2021 North American Management Society Conference Proceedings

Business Ethics Case: Greed and Corruption in a Fortune 500 Company ...........................................2
How Technology Life Cycles Increase the Financial Position of the Firm .............................................14
Managing Virtual Internships During the Covid-19 Pandemic Era: Implications for Academic Instructors and Business Leaders ................................................................................................向前 ..................................................................................................................................28
Welcoming Generation Z: Managing Managers’ Communication Expectations of this Digital Loving Generation ..........................................................................................................................................................40
Entrepreneurship and Innovation: The Development of a Minor for an Undergraduate Business Program ..................................................................................................................................................54
Familiarity Mode’s Impact on Globalization And Invulnerability Case Study ...........................................61
One World Decisions & Risk: Ex Post Facto Case Study ...........................................................................67
Managing the Mind, Body, and Soul—Closing the Gap Between Managers and Young Employees with Anxiety Disorders ...........................................................................................................................................75
Improving Emotional Intelligence Through Coaching ................................................................................77
Let’s Hang Out and Talk About Work: A Conceptual Framework Exploring the Dark Side of Workplace Friendship ........................................................................................................................................79
The noose: A case study in institutional miscommunication ....................................................................81
Scholarly Impact of Management Theory: The Roles of Explanatory Value and Scientific Validity ........82
Cultural Values Held by Cameroon’s Young Generation: Findings and Implications .............................84
Managing Diversity and Inclusion in a Health Care Organization .........................................................101
When physical attractiveness does not benefit: Focusing on interpersonal relationship, target employee personality, and career success ................................................................................................102
What motivates an academic coach in an online accelerated course? Using a qualitative approach ........................................................................................................................................................................128
Relational Leadership: A Model for Empowering People with Disabilities ...........................................146
Exploring and Cultivating Types of Intelligence: Creative Ways to Prepare Students for Real-World Leadership ..................................................................................................................................................171
Transformational Leadership in the Public Sector ......................................................................................178
Correlation Between Corn Prices and Farmland Values: 1980 to 2020 .................................................190
BUSINESS ETHICS CASE: GREED AND CORRUPTION IN A FORTUNE 500 COMPANY
George Dierberger
Augsburg University
Cory Erickson
Augsburg University
Jacob Enger
Augsburg University
Patricia Jesperson
Augsburg University

Abstract
In 2019, a former student urgently contacted one of the authors and asked to be seen the next day to discuss an ethical dilemma. The dilemma involved a request for quote to a Fortune 100 company that resulted in being asked for a bribe in the form of a kickback to the director of purchasing. The case is a true story of graft and corruption, the names have been changed to protect the anonymity of the former student and the companies involved.

Brady Software is a family owned business in Rochester, with sales of $10 million dollars, and has responded to a request for quote (RFQ) for a new customer relationship management (CRM) from Holman Medical, a $12-billion-dollar medical device company. The president and the vice president of sales completed three presentations to the Holman leadership team and were selected as a finalist. The assignment of the contract has been complicated by an unethical request from the director of purchasing.

KEY WORDS: Business ethics, management, decision making process, organizational culture, leadership, marketing, and operations
SUGGESTED COURSES: The case will be most appealing to undergraduate business seniors and MBA students interested in ethics, communication, management, finance, and marketing.
SITUATION ANALYSIS
Kevin Kraus, Brady Software’s CEO sat behind his desk with his Vice-President of sales, John Malone, across from him, anxiously awaited a phone call from Holman Medical, a Fortune 500 company that had issued a request for quote (RFQ) for a new customer relationship management software program (CRM). Kraus and Malone were childhood friends who reconnected after college and had worked together from the beginning with Malone being his first employee. They both felt the enormous pressure of the situation as the bid, which was worth $10 million dollars over 5 years, would double the size of the business and position their company for profitable growth. The two of them had worked diligently for the past three months on the RFQ and had spent weeks in St. Paul presenting to the Holman review committee and preparing the final bid. As Kraus stepped outside his corporate headquarters in Rochester Minnesota, he lit up a cigar and inhaled deeply, the cold winter air was a harsh wake-up call as he exhaled. It was now January 5, 2021 and Kraus could not believe that in three months the RFQ was issued and reviewed by Holman Medical that Brady Software, was selected as one of three finalists for the contract. Kraus and Malone had received positive feedback each time they presented and were told they really liked the customization and support that Brady Software offered as part of the contract proposal. They knew that one of the competitors, Salesforce was a major player and had a national reputation. Kraus and Malone felt they knew Holman on a more intimate level and being based in Minnesota would give them a competitive advantage over Salesforce who may be distracted with new businesses; especially after Salesforce acquired Slack in December of 2020 and also owns Tableau software. The new acquisition could bolster Brady Softwares chances as Salesforce may be distracted by the latest acquisition (Mazalon, 2020). The new contract length was for 5 years and worth an estimated $10 million dollars with $2 million in year one and $2 million per year for the next 4 years.

Kraus, a computer scientist, founded Brady Software in 2012 and had grown the company to $10 million dollars and employed 55 people. The bulk of the company’s current business was with the state of Minnesota and focused on the CRM software that Holman Medical was interested in for its sales team. Kraus and Malone felt confident that their proposal and presentation in front of the Holman management team was well received and they were able to confidently answer all of
the questions asked by the panel; they also received positive feedback from the purchasing director, Pat Sullivan.

**Company and Industry Background**

Holman Medical, an iconic Minnesota based company, with revenues of $12 billion dollars and 65,000 employees. Their core competencies centered around surgical drapes, masks, gloves and adhesives. Their founding father, Dr. Herbert Holman, started the business in his garage in 1974 and slowly built the company into a market leader with offices in over 60 countries through-out the world. His two lead scientists were, Dr. Marco Santori, a chemical engineer from the University of Minnesota and Dr. Andrew Yanez, a chemical engineer from MIT. They both helped Dr. Holman create many of the core products that drove the company’s rise to market dominance. The majority of the sales derive from products developed by Dr. Santori and Dr. Yanez and Holman Medical continues to be the leaders in their respective markets.

Holman Medical had grown substantially over the past 20 years through market share gains, small adjacent market acquisitions and international growth. In order to maximize their market penetration, the leadership team at Holman Medical realized they required a customized customer relationship management system (CRM) to help them track their sales opportunities with customers. In many cases, a sales representative from one division would be walking out the door as another sales representative was walking in with a different product group. Pat Sullivan, purchasing director for Holman Medical had worked for the company for 8 years. He was a highly rated employee and was responsible for purchasing computers, software and managed all of the service contracts. Sullivan reported to the Vice President of operations, Terri Kirk. The process for procurement was very straight forward and typically followed the same methodology:

- **Step 1** – Identify the need for the product or service
- **Step 2** - Write the specifications for the bid
- **Step 3** – Solicit bids from multiple vendors
- **Step 4** - Invite the top 10 vendors to an online interview
- **Step 5** - Reduce the number of vendors to 3 and invite to headquarters
- **Step 6** – Interview final 3 vendors and make selection
Step 7- Contract negotiations and implementation

Brady software’s leadership team, Kevin Kraus and Malone felt very confident after the final presentation. The bids were blind and included a thorough investigation of the software and its ability to be customized for the needs of Holman Medical. The Holman team called current customers of Brady Software to ask about their experience with the Brady product and if they were pleased with the product and the customer service. The reviews were extremely positive and the feedback was shared with Kraus and Malone and the other two candidates.

On January 6th, Kraus received a phone call from the purchasing manager, Pat Sullivan regarding the bid. Mr. Sullivan was calling with the news that Brady Software was the top candidate to receive the Holman CRM business pending final negotiations. Sullivan asked for a meeting with Kraus and his vice president of sales, John Malone. Kraus and Malone set the meeting for January 10th at noon for lunch at Marx café in Stillwater, a short 25-minute drive for Sullivan and a 90-minute drive from Rochester for Kraus and Malone.

Kraus and Malone drove from Rochester and arrived early, about 11:30am, to meet with Sullivan and were surprised to see him already seated in the back of the restaurant. The meeting started out with some desultory conversation about COVID 19, the vaccine implementation and how the year ended for both organizations. After the dishes were cleared, Sullivan cleared his throat and said, “I hope you are pleased with the opportunity to be awarded the contract. I really pushed hard for your company to be awarded the business. As a small company, I felt that I could work with you the closest and that you would appreciate the opportunity I have given you.” Kraus and Malone exchanged glances and Malone said, “we appreciate the opportunity and we look forward to working with you. When can we begin implementation and training?” Sullivan responded, “well there are a few details to work out and I wanted to talk with you personally so we have an understanding as to how this will work.” Kraus and Malone exchanged puzzled looks and returned the gaze to Sullivan. Sullivan said, “here’s how it is going to work, I want 10% of the value of the contract upfront and 5% every year after. The money will be sent to a separate account in my wife’s name. It is the least you can do after I advocated for you to get the contract.” Kraus and Malone were floored by the request. They could not believe that they were
being asked to pay a bribe to a Fortune 100 company. Kraus was the first to speak and said, “Pat, what you are asking is something we cannot do. We pride ourselves on being an ethical company and we simply do not participate in any kind of kickback. I would rather lose the business than jeopardize my reputation and company.”

Sullivan looked at both men, threw his napkin down and said, “I thought I could work with your team but I was obviously wrong.” I may need to reevaluate my decision,” and with that stormed out of the restaurant.

Malone and Kraus looked at each other in disbelief. Malone was the first to speak, “I cannot believe he just asked for a bribe. We worked our tails off on the bid and we were better than the competitors. We have earned that business fair and square.” Kraus, looked dejected and asked Malone to call the company’s attorney as soon as possible. “We have been offered a bribe and we need to talk to our attorney about our options. Let’s call Jack on the drive home.”

**Ethics Defined**

Business ethics will help you identify ethical issues when they arise and utilize different approaches to solving them. According to Ferrell in his book, Business Ethics (2017) there are 5 distinct stages of ethics in North America:

1) Before 1960 focusing on questioning the concept of capitalism
2) The decade of 1960’s the rise of social issues
3) The 1970’s ethics as an emerging field
4) The 1980’s focused on consolidation in industry and global businesses
5) The 1990’s focused on the institutionalism of ethics.

The stages walk us through the evolution of ethics and yet today we are still dealing with ethical issues on a regular basis. In the September 2020 Strategic Finance journal, it partially listed the companies who have been involved in corporate scandals over the past 20 years (Epstein & Hanson, 2020). The companies range from Enron, General Motors, Theranos, Boeing and Airbus. In 2015, Volkswagen was accused with intentional deceit by designing software to fool the EPA on fuel emissions on their diesel vehicles. As a partial response, in 2002, during the George W. Bush administration, congress passed the Sarbanes-Oxley Act in response to the
Enron, WorldCom and the Halliburton scandals. The new law made securities fraud a criminal offense and stiffened penalties for corporate fraud. Additionally, the law mandated that corporate executives had to sign off on their firm’s financial reports and risk fines or jail time for false reports. According to the Wall Street Journal, the law has not been used with any great regularity (Rapoport, 2012). In fact, very few executives have been pursued as a result of the legislation and is rarely used. Prosecutors have not brought any criminal charges for false financial certification; they have brought several civil allegations in those areas.

In 2010, the Dodd-Frank Wall Street Reform and Consumer Protection Act was enacted after the impact of the great recession partially brought on by corruption on Wall Street. It increased regulation of Wall Street by adding more mechanisms that the banks can invest using their own accounts. It also prohibits the use of derivatives by banks (Geier, 2020).

Business ethics comprises organizational principles, values and norms that may originate from individuals, organizational statements or from the legal system that primarily guide individual and group behavior in business (Ferrell, 2017). Principles are specific and pervasive boundaries for behavior that should not be violated. Values are enduring beliefs and ideals that are socially enforced. Morals refer to a person’s personal philosophies about what is right and what is wrong. Therefore, ethics is defined as behavior or decisions made within a groups values. Business ethics are a major concern in society today. Misuse of company resources, abusive behavior, harassment, accounting fraud, defective products, bribery, employee theft and intentional patent infringement are all examples of business ethics violations.

According to Ferrell, one possible framework for ethical decision making includes the following inputs:

- Ethical issue intensity – relevance of an event or a decision in the eyes of the individual, work group or organization. Under current law, supervisors or managers can be held responsible for the unethical behavior of their employees.
- Individual factors – People often apply their own personal ethics and they learn their ethics through the socialization process with family, religion, social groups and education.
• Organizational factors – typically, the organizational values often have greater influence on decisions than a person’s own values. These values encompass the culture of the organization, ethics, obedience to authority and context to the financial and personal situation of the event.

• Opportunity – represents the conditions in an organization that limit or permit ethical or unethical behavior.

The above factors influence the decision making process. The normative stakeholder approach affirms the voice of stakeholders and focuses on how decisions should be approached from an ethical and principles standpoint. Normative approaches decision and involves the standards of the organization and industry. Concepts like ethics, fairness and justice are highly important in a normative structure. Johnson and Johnson’s credo approach to decision making is founded in its culture of doing the right thing. (Editor, 2021). This is different from a descriptive approach that focuses on the actual behavior of the firm and how it impacts the shareholders and customers. The former CEO of American Apparel was fired for allegedly misusing funds and violating sexual harassment policies. Providing untruthful or deceptive information (Volkswagen) is not only illegal but also unethical and results in a loss of trust (Ferrell, 2017).

**LEGAL OPTIONS**

The next day, on another cold morning, Kevin Kraus and John Malone walked into the law offices of Umhaefer, Mauer and Sadek in Rochester, Minnesota. Their meeting with Jack Umhaefer, their lawyer for the past 12 years, was scheduled immediately on the drive home from Stillwater for the following morning. They were escorted into the conference room and waited for Jack to enter the room and sit down. Jack looking disheveled, entered the room, briefly shook hands with both men and sat down. After exchanging pleasantries, Jack asked them to repeat exactly what was said at the meeting. Kevin and John repeated the discussion and Kevin’s immediate response to the question of a kickback to Sullivan. Jack asked several questions regarding how Sullivan wanted to be paid and the process. He was very pleased with the response given by Kraus and the discussion immediately changed to whether to respond in writing, by the law firm or by Kraus. Malone said, “we have to respond in writing as soon as possible and send it to the vice president of purchasing.” Kraus said, “do we have to respond in writing? Will that imply that we approached Sullivan and solicited the bribe? We earned that
business and for this to happen is so unfair to all of us. We have always run an ethical company and I am concerned that if we get dropped by Holman Medical it could impact our business with the state of Minnesota.” Jack asked, “what do you mean?” Kraus responded, “we have told our current customers about the bid because Holman required that we provide references for the bid. What happens if the press finds out and somehow we get accused of attempting to bribe someone? This could destroy our business!” Jack paused before speaking, “we have four options that we need to consider:

1) Write a letter and an email to the vice president of purchasing detailing what happened and alerting her to the attempted bribery.
2) Write an anonymous letter to the company and suggest that they investigate Sullivan for possible fraud and bribery
3) Respond to Sullivan in writing that they will not participate in any kickbacks
4) Do nothing

Jack went on, “if we write the letter to the vice president they will most likely suspend the contract award and conduct an internal investigation. The fact that we disclosed the conversation, may not help you get the contract. Rarely do whistleblowers receive justice. If the letter is anonymous, I cannot guarantee that they will not find out who it is from and they may then ask us why we were not honest with them right away. If we respond only to Sullivan then he can deny the conversation took place and accuse us of approaching him with a kickback. Finally, if you do nothing and pretend the conversation did not happen then we could be accused of being complicit in the action by Sullivan.”

**BRADY SOFTWARE NEXT STEPS**

Kraus and Malone walked out of the lawyer’s office worried and confused. They knew they would never pay a bribe or a kickback to a company or an individual in the hopes of obtaining business or currying a favor for business. Their lawyer, Jack Umhaefer, was unclear about the course of action to be taken. What would you recommend Brady Software to do and why?

**STUDENT INSTRUCTIONS and KEY DELIVERABLES**

Using the information provided in this case, students are to assume the role of consultants hired by Brady Software to provide constructive recommendations for the future. The following deliverables should be prepared for presentation.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Deliverable</th>
<th>Learning Objective</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Report:** Prepare a detailed letter to the vice president of purchasing notifying Holman Medical of the attempted bribe.  
1) This letter should be focused on the facts of the case  
2) The willingness to work with the appropriate agencies  
3) The hope for a continued relationship with the company. | 1. Demonstrate an understanding of business ethics  
2. Demonstrate an understanding of the consequences of the letter written to Holman Medical |
| **Training:** Prepare a proposal for an effective ethics training for Holman Medical.  
1) The responsibility of the corporation to shareholders  
2) The need for an organizational ethics program  
3) Codes of conduct  
4) Ethics training and communication | 3. Ability to create an ethics training course for Holman Medical  
4. Create a timeline and implementation strategy for Holman Medical |
| **Ethical decision making Items:**  
1. A framework for ethical decision making  
2. Using the framework to improve ethical decisions  
(Instructor note): For online courses these items could be placed in a shared file location, and delivered via an online forum such as Skype or Google Hangout. | 5. Create a process for ethical decision making |
BUSINESS ETHICS CASE: GREED AND CORRUPTION IN A FORTUNE 500 COMPANY

This case was prepared by the authors and is intended to be used by undergraduate seniors and MBA students in preparation for a career in management, marketing or finance. The case is based on a true story brought to one of the authors by a former student who needed advice on how to morally and legally handle a recent situation in his/her dealings with a Fortune 500 company based in Minnesota. The views represented here are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the journal. The views are based on the professional judgment of the authors and their experiences with dealing with graft and corruption. Copyright © 2021 by the authors. No part of this work may be reproduced or used in any form or by any means without the written permission of the authors.

In completing this ethics case, students will need to demonstrate the following learning outcomes:

1) Demonstrate an understanding of the ethical challenges facing businesses
2) Demonstrate the ability to analyze pertinent facts in the case and follow a decision making process that is ethical, legal and morally acceptable
3) Recommend a solution to the leaders of Brady Software that is fair to all parties
4) Draw meaningful conclusions and make final recommendations to the board of directors.

The recommendations and salient points we recommend in this case study include a review of the ethical decision making process outlined in the ethics course. A successful implementation of the strategies identified will provide an opportunity for Brady to continue to operate while maintaining its integrity and being viable as a business entity.

There are a number of recommendations based on various aspects of the case:

- The need to write the letter to the vice president of purchasing is imperative for the legal, moral and ethical protection of Brady Software. The willingness to walk away from the business is imperative.
• If Pat Sullivan, the purchasing director is not confronted in writing, it could lead Brady Software to be accused of complicity. If Sullivan is requesting a kickback from Brady Software he is most likely asking other companies for money as well. The point is, this is just a matter of time before it blows up.

• Ethically, how did Holman Medical train its employees regarding its ethical culture? Why and how was this behavior allowed to exist? Where were the checks and balances?

**AUTHOR BIOGRAPHIES**

**Dr. George Dierberger** is an Associate Professor at Augsburg University, Minneapolis, Minnesota. His teaching areas of expertise include innovation and design, leadership, organizational development, change management, international business and strategic management. Research interests primarily focus on the scholarship of entrepreneurship, innovation, and leadership. Dr. Dierberger spent 25 years in a variety of leadership positions at 3M and continues to consult for entrepreneurial organizations. E-mail: dierberg@augsburg.edu

**Cory Erickson** has been teaching Marketing and Sales Management at Augsburg University since 2016. Currently he is an Assistant Professor in the Department of Business Administration. His teaching areas of interest include Marketing and Sales Management, Managing Innovation and Organizational Behavior. His research interests include Entrepreneurship and Marketing Excellence in Successful Start-Ups. Outside of teaching, Cory has had a successful Marketing and Management career working for Fortune 100 companies all the way to Start-Ups.

**Jacob Enger** has been teaching accounting at Augsburg University since 2018. Currently he is an Assistant Professor in the Department of Business Administration. His teaching areas of interest include Auditing, Intermediate Accounting, and Advanced Accounting. His research interests include Auditing with a focus on professional ethics and conduct, and the use of data visualization tools in practice. Prior to teaching, Jacob practiced as a CPA with a regional accounting firm for over a decade, providing a variety of tax, consulting, and auditing services for clients. E-mail: engerj@augsburg.edu
REFERENCES


https://www.wsj.com/articles/SB10000872396390444130304577557190343517170
How Technology Life Cycles Increase the Financial Position of the Firm

Kelsey Metz
Lincoln Memorial University
James Maxwell
Lincoln Memorial University

Abstract: Businesses need to understand the importance of technology life cycles for increasing their financial position. It is extremely important to understand technology life cycle approaches for gaining competitive advantage and increasing the value of the firm. The purpose of this paper is to provide a review of the theory, and to discuss the continued relevance of technology life cycles as they relate to competitive advantage and improved financial performance.

INTRODUCTION
The business world is continually progressing due to improvements in technology. As an example, it is almost impossible to obtain a job that lacks computer interface within today’s society. This reality differs substantially from a quarter-century ago when computer-use by working professionals was not guaranteed. As such, this paper will discuss the continued importance of technology innovation, adoption, and deployment, and how firms can implement the use of technology life cycle models to aid in financial performance. Further, the impact of technological innovations on the United States economy will also be discussed.

NEW ERA
Throughout the generations, technology has evolved immensely. While the Silent Generation knew nothing or very little about the concept of computers, the following generation of Baby Boomers have grown to possess baseline computer knowledge. Subsequently, Generation X was largely raised knowing about computers, and have since developed an advanced computer skillset due to workforce requirements. The most current generation of workforce members, Millennials, were raised using computers and related products, and must now maintain a heightened level of computer competence to be professionally competitive. Aside from the use
of computers for professional purposes, computers are now also used multiple times per day for personal reasons largely related to the attainment of information. Thus, our living within the Age of Information (Kosta et al., 2017). We know of no other way to survive than with our iPhones, tablets, laptops, and other digital devices. While the current generation is undeniably dependent upon modern technology, many individuals maintain a certain level of hesitation when considering the purchase of a newly introduced technological innovation. This hesitation is often attributed to the high monetary cost and related uncertainty of the potential adoption (Rogers, 2003). However, after a few months on the market, new product prices tend to fall, and the consumer may become more interested in finalizing the purchase decision. As for businesses, the decision to pursue the use of a new technology is much more complex as investment goes far beyond a single transaction. A business’s investment in the adoption or creation of a new technology is often substantial, and, therefore, must be approached in a highly methodical manner.

THE NEED FOR A LIFE CYCLE APPROACH
Due to the introduction of numerous technological advances within the 20th and 21st centuries, many businesses had to determine a way to decipher the “good” new technologies from the “bad” new technologies. These companies had to formulate a way to make the decision-making process easier when seeking to develop or introduce new technological products or processes. While there are several ways that this can be accomplished, many companies chose to adopt a technology life cycle (TLC) approach. A technology life cycle approach, or model, is used to aid in the strategic management of technology. This concept visually depicts a technology’s progression by graphing an organization’s expended effort on a technology against the technology’s obtained performance. Foster (1986) states that effort expended and obtained performance should be measured by quantifiable variables to more accurately estimate the amount of effort that is needed to obtain specific levels of performance within future technology cycles and predictive models. In graphing these items on the X and Y axes, respectively, a technology will fall into the category of Embryonic, Growth, Maturity, or Ageing (Foster, 1986). The Embryonic section of the graph suggests that an organization has expended little effort on the technology, thus performance obtained is also low. The Embryonic Stage infers that a technology is currently undergoing research and development (R&D), or that the initial product
has been recently introduced to the market. The Growth section infers that effort expended on the technology has increased, therefore obtained performance strongly increases due to the incremental innovations that improve the technology and its appeal within the market. The Maturity section communicates that effort expended has continued to progress, yet the performance obtained begins to slow and stabilize, often reaching an apex, as enhancing product-specific innovations become less frequent. The Ageing or Decline phase conveys that significant effort on behalf of the business has been expended on the examined technology, and the performance obtained has reached its limit. Within this phase, the technology’s applicability is has likely declined, and a newer disruptive technology has emerged. With this new technological introduction, the cycle begins again. Graphically, this cycle often forms an S-shaped curve due to the appearance of sinusoidal line that results from the described pattern.

In using technology life cycle models for the strategic management of technology, many firms will apply the discussed s-curve model to determine the developmental stage of a currently used technology. In understanding the position of the technology, businesses can more accurately determine whether they should be investing in the creation or acceptance of a technology, investing in the improvement of the a current technology, reducing current investments due to capped performance levels, or actively seeking to adopt or create a replacement technology (Foster, 1986). As such, the use of a technology life cycle method can aid firm performance and decision-making by providing clear entry and exit criteria, as well as benefits relating to more effective and repeatable transition strategies. The model can also aid in the more decisive use of materials, skills, and human resources. As such, businesses can use this model to provide a greater level of clarity when discussing or justifying decision-making with stakeholders.

While the construction of an s-curve may require the collection of ample quantitative data, an accurate model has proven to maintain strong predictive capabilities within several industries including agriculture, transportation, energy, and information technology (Nieto et al., 1998; Taylor & Taylor, 2012). Due to the continued introduction of disruptive technological innovations such as blockchain technology, the Internet of Things (IoT), 3D printing, and artificial intelligence, the understanding and applicability of technology life cycles maintains relevance within today’s business environment (Bughin & Woetzel, 2020; Forbes Technology
Council, 2020; Frizzo-Barker et al., 2020). Businesses who do not actively seek to implement or introduce new technologies are likely to fall behind their competitors who proactively adopt and deploy updated processes and products (Hao & Song, 2016). This occurs as improved processes lead to greater efficiency and resulting output. Similarly, up-to-date market ready products are needed as consumers consistently pursue new technological products and innovations for the purposes of convenience, entertainment, personal efficiency, and more. The use of technological innovations for increased productivity and heightened sales levels will be discussed in following sections.

**Theory of Technological Life Cycle**

In addition to Richard Foster’s acclaimed s-curve model, Tushman and Anderson (1986) discussed the theory behind the occurrence of technological life cycles and their relation to disruptive technologies. The term disruptive technology refers to the introduction of an advancement that significantly changes, or differs from, the industry accepted norm. Tushman and Anderson (1986) describe disruption as a technological discontinuity that is so significant that no change in scale, efficiency, or design could make the older technology competitive with the newly introduced technology. The appearance of a technological disruption marks the start of a new technology life cycle. Anderson and Tushman (1990) describe a cycle that is similar to the one described by Foster (1986). This cycle begins with the occurrence of a technological disruption that causes the subsequent discontinuation of a standardized technology. Following the appearance of the disruption, an era of ferment commences as the experimental technology opens a new product class wherein product variations compete for dominance. Within this stage, technology adoption slowly ensues. Once the technology’s dominant design emerges, the technology is absorbed more rapidly. Following the wide acceptance of the technological product, an era of incremental change occurs wherein smaller, incremental improvements enhance the technology. Once all foreseeable incremental innovations have been realized, a new technological disruption is likely to occur, and the process will begin once more (Anderson & Tushman, 1990).

Within these various technological life cycle stages, technologies may be categorized as the following: Bleeding Edge, Leading Edge, State of the Art, Dated and Obsolete. During the Bleeding Edge stage, the technology shows high potential but has not demonstrated value or
settled down into any kind of compromise. The Leading Edge classification occurs when a technology has proven itself in the marketplace, but is still new enough that it may be difficult to find knowledgeable personnel to implement it or support it. The State of the Art stage occurs when everyone agrees that a particular technology is the right solution to an overarching problem. A technology is considered to be Dated when it is still useful, but a replacement Leading Edge technology is readily available. A technology is categorized as Obsolete when it has been superseded by a newer State of the Art technology (Tushman & Anderson, 1986).

Theory of Technology Acceptance
While technology life cycles seek to aid firms in the strategic management of created or implemented technologies, product life cycles seek to examine product adoption among consumers. The product life cycle maintains the four stages of Introduction, Growth, Maturity, and Decline (Levitt, 1965). A product’s position within one of these categories can be determined by continually graphing sales volume against time. The sales levels of a related product or technology relay consumer acceptance. In seeking to explain the phenomenon behind consumer acceptance of technology, Fred Davis, Richard Bagozzi, and Paul Warshaw (1989) developed the Technology Acceptance Model (TAM). The Technology Acceptance Model is an information systems theory that models how users come to accept and use a technology. The model suggests that when users are presented with a new software package or technological device, a number of factors will influence their decision-making. Primary influential adoption factors, however, were concluded to be perceived usefulness and perceived ease of use (Davis et al., 1989). Consumers’ perceived ease of use increases in relation to the product life cycle and Everett Rogers’ Diffusion of Innovations Theory. This occurs as heightened sales levels and coordinating widespread adoption of an innovation leads late majority-classified consumers to believe that a technology is easy to use, thus influencing their belated purchase decision (Rogers, 2003).

TECHNOLOGY, PRODUCTION, AND THE ECONOMY
Technological advancements have the power to improve businesses’ financial performance, as well the economy as a whole. Edward Lazear, Professor of Economics at Stanford - Graduate School of Business, states, “There are two ways to achieve economic growth: Add population or
make people more productive,” (Snyder, 2019, para. 15). As the United States birthrate has continued to steadily decline, the latter must be accomplished (World Development Indicators, n.d.).

In examining the established relationship between technology, production, and the economy, it has been determined that technological advancements enhance productivity by efficiently increasing output (Çalışkan, 2015). Therefore, when output is increased, economic outcomes improve as the private and public sectors are enabled to consume a larger amount of goods and services. As a result of heightened consumption and consumer spending, businesses are more likely to invest their earnings into workforce expansion. In turn, employees’ newly earned wages lead to higher household income levels, and, ultimately, an improved standard of living as estimated by the GDP per capita (Broughel & Thierer, 2019). Additionally, in using more efficient production processes to make goods readily available within the marketplace, the gross domestic product (GDP) is improved as more products are produced annually. In using technological innovations to improve business productivity and output, businesses may use new technologies and innovations to manage their practices and processes in a more efficient manner. Introduced or improved technologies can effectively aid in the efficient management of employees, inventories, supply chains, product design, and more. The resulting improvement or elimination of inefficient production processes thus leads to enhanced profitability and financial performance.

In addition to improving the GDP through productivity and a resulting influx of assorted market-ready products, the occurrence of technological innovations can also influence consumer spending due to the purchases that result directly from the introduction of a new or improved technological product. As mentioned, new technological products often encounter a cyclical period related to consumer understanding and acceptance, however, once consumers have collectively decided to adopt a product, they will put forth the money to do so. This increase in spending benefits individual firms’ financial performance, as well as the macroeconomy and GDP. The GDP is positively affected as this economic indicator considers the private consumption variable within the calculation. Likewise, if the technological advancement is adopted by government entities, the GDP would also be positively affected. Such was the case
with the introduction and use of computers, smartphones, tablets, and various software packages within the workplace.

The United States’ market-driven economy is one that fosters and encourages technological innovation. This occurs as unplanned economic systems allow for goods and services to be produced based on the forces of supply and demand (Gregory & Stuart, 2004). As the government does not regulate or oversee the production and distribution of goods and services, technological advancements occur as people are free to present innovative ideas and products within the marketplace. Motivation for the introduction of innovative goods and services exists as producers are rewarded monetarily if their items are accepted and adopted by consumers. The United States’ innovative atmosphere was further propelled in the 1990’s due largely in part to the creation of the World Wide Web in 1989 (Choudhury, 2014). The combined adoption of personal computers, the Internet, and the World Wide Web allowed for the widespread exchange of ideas and an extensive collaborative network which arose on a global scale. As such, heightened information accessibility and resulting technological innovation led the United States economy to achieve performance levels which were unseen for a generation (Weller, 2002). The continual influxes in technology, which were put into motion by the information-oriented advancements of the 1990’s, have subsequently aided in an approximate increase in nominal GDP from $5.96 trillion in 1990 to $21.43 trillion in 2019. Similarly, the approximated real GDP has increased from $9.37 trillion in 1990 to $19.10 trillion in 2019 (Gross Domestic Product, n.d.). The United States GDP is expected to drop during 2020 due to the COVID-19 pandemic (Gross Domestic Product, 2020).

TECHNOLOGICAL INNOVATION

Technological innovation is inherent to competitive success. Innovation leads to improved technologies through the creative development and application of new ideas (Kogan et al., 2017). As established, the occurrence technological advancements the lead to improved productivity, sales levels, firm-specific financial performance, and ultimately economic growth. Technological innovation may originate through a singular inventor, or by way of a collaborative network. Examples of collaborative networks include joint ventures, research associations, and informal networks. In high-technology sectors collaborative networks are very important
because individual firms rarely possess all the resources and capabilities that are necessary to succeed (Daft, 2021). For an organization to be successful with innovative activity and the resulting creation and implementation of innovations, a firm-specific innovation strategy is required. Innovation strategies should be unique as those belonging to other firms cannot be directly replicated due to organizational differences. Successful innovation strategies should consider the firm as a whole by promoting interdepartmental collaboration, knowledge-sharing, and experimentation for the purpose for formulating new and improved ideas that optimize business performance (Pisano, 2015). These requirements mimic those needed by a successful external collaborative network.

There are several dimensions used to categorize innovations and to help clarify how different innovations offer different opportunities on producers, users, and regulators (Schilling, 2017). Various types of innovations include product and process innovations, incremental and radical innovations, competence-enhancing and competence-destroying innovations, and component and architectural innovations. Product innovations are embodied in the outputs of an organization through its goods or services. Process innovations are innovations in the way an organization conducts its business, such as, the techniques of producing or how they market goods or services. Product innovations can enable process innovations and, vis-à-vis, process innovations can enable product innovations. Incremental innovations may involve only a minor change from existing practices. The radical innovation is the degree to which it is new and different from the previous existing product and processes. A radical innovation is relative meaning that it can change over time or with respect to different observers. Competence-Enhancing innovations build on the firm’s existing knowledge base. Competence-Destroying innovations render a firm’s existing competencies obsolete. It depends on the firm’s perspective to decide whether their innovations are competence-enhancing or competence-destroying. A component innovation, also referred to as a modular innovation, entails change to one or more components of a product system without significantly affecting the overall design. An architectural innovation entails changing the design of the system or changing the way that the components interact.
CHOOSING INNOVATIVE PROJECTS

There are different methods of choosing innovation projects. Selection methods can be informal or highly structured. Also, they can be entirely qualitative, strictly quantitative, or a mix of both. Usually, firms will use a combination of methods to completely evaluate the potential of the innovation project.

Quantitative Methods

Commonly used quantitative methods for choosing innovative projects include the Discounted Cash Flow and Real Options approaches. In Discounted Cash Flow, the net present value of an investment project is calculated by examining discounted expected cash inflows against discounted cash outlays for the purpose of determining estimated profitability. The Internal Rate of Return (IRR) is the discount that makes the net present value of an investment zero. Discounted Cash Flow analyses often produce accurate financial estimates as they consider the timing of an investment, as well as the time value of money.

A Real Options approach applies a stock option model to non-financial resource investments. An example of this method would be research and development (R&D) capability and license to commercialize technology. There are limitations to real options models, however, as many innovation projects do not conform to the same capital market assumptions as the real options models. Additionally, real options models may not acquire options at a small price, as they may require full investment before its known whether the technology will be successful.

Qualitative Methods

Most firms use qualitative methods when factors in the development of projects are difficult to quantify. Screening questions are a type of qualitative method that is often employed. Screening questions may be used to assess different dimensions of the project decision that include the role of the customer, role of the capabilities, and the project timing and cost. The role of the customer would be market, ease of use, distribution and pricing. The role of capabilities would be future capabilities and competitors’ capabilities.

Another commonly used qualitative method includes mapping the company research and development portfolio. This method emphasizes balance of the different types of projects and coordinating resource availability. Additionally, qualitative methods such as Aggregate Project
Planning (APP) may be used. The Aggregate Project Planning method examines the goals and objectives of the company, and how these items may be accomplished through individual projects. Once relevance is established, projects can then be placed into the categories of Breakthrough Projects, Platform Projects, Derivative Projects, Advanced R&D Projects, and Partnered Projects. A Breakthrough project incorporates new revolutionary technologies into a commercial application. A Platform project is not revolutionary, however, offers fundamental improvements over proceeding generations of products. A Derivative project uses incremental improvements and a variety of design features. A Derivative project pays off the fastest and it helps service the firm’s short-term cash flow needs. Advanced R&D projects include the development of cutting-edge technologies. While these projects have no immediate commercial application and take longer to pay off, a successful advanced R&D project will put the firm in a position to be a technological leader.

Innovative ideas can also be ranked on different dimensions using a Q-Sort Technique developed by William Stephenson in the 1930s. First, you place innovative ideas on individual cards. Then, for each dimension that is being considered, the cards should be stacked in order of their performance on the related dimension. Next, there will be several rounds of sorting and debating that develop a consensus concerning the importance of each innovative idea or project. (Thomas & Watson, 2002)

**Combining Qualitative and Quantitative Methods**

Managers can also combine qualitative and quantitative methods when choosing innovative projects. An approach that utilizes both qualitative and quantitative methods is Conjoint Analysis. Conjoint analysis estimates the relative value that individuals place on attributes of a choice. First, an individual is given a card with products that have different prices and features. These items are then rated in terms of desirability. Next, a multiple regression is performed to assess which attributes influence the rating.

A Data Envelopment Analysis (DEA) is another approach that combines quantitative and qualitative methods. A DEA uses linear programming to combine measures of the project that are based on different units into an efficiency frontier. In performing a DEA, projects can be
ranked by assessing their distance from the efficiency frontier. The results of the Data Envelopment Analysis are only as good as the data that is utilized.

PROTECHTING INNOVATIVE TECHNOLOGY
Firms must protect their innovations to retain control of the product or process. In regard to product protection, a firm may apply for a patent. A patent is a firm’s rights granted by the government that excludes others from producing, using, or selling an invention (General Information, 2015). There are three different types of patents, which include Utility, Design, and Plant. A Utility patent protects new and useful processes, machines, and a combination of materials. A Design patent protects the original designs for manufactured items. A Plant patent protects distinct new varieties of plants. Other options for protecting products includes include trademarks and copyrights. A trademark is a word, phrase, symbol, or other indicator that is used to distinguish the source of goods from one party from another (General Information, 2015). An example of a trademark would be the Apple symbol. A copyright is a form of protection granted to works of authorship. A copyright it prohibits others from performing the work publicly, displaying the work publicly, and reproducing the work in copies or phone records. A copyright is established in first legitimate use. The copyright for works was created after 1978 to have protection for author’s life plus 70 years.

SUMMARY
As time progresses, business managers will need to continue to embrace and participate in the growth of technology. This must occur as technological innovation is a key driver of firms’ financial performance due to improved productivity and the creation of desirable technological products. In addition to improving the financial performance and security of individual firms, technological innovations also positively impact the economy due to increased output and product sales which improve the national GDP. To monitor the likelihood of the occurrence of new and needed technological innovations, CEOs and business managers must direct their teams in finding the most useful business life cycle approach for their company. In using a life cycle approach, businesses can track a current technology’s progression, and initiate appropriate decision-making and transition strategies in coordination with the analyzed technology’s maturation and inevitable decline. As a part of the transition period, new innovative and
disruptive technologies can be adopted or created. These projects can be selected using quantitative, qualitative, or mixed methods. The resulting innovation could be categorized as a product, process, incremental, radical, competence-enhancing, competence-destroying, component or architectural innovation. If the new innovation is unique and exclusive to the creating firm, the item should be protected by a patent so that the firm can gain competitive advantage through their owned process or product.

REFERENCES
Forbes Technology Council (2020, May 7). 15 technologies that will disrupt the industry in the next five years. *Forbes*. https://www.forbes.com/sites/forbestechcouncil/2020/05/07/15-technologies-that-will-disrupt-the-industry-in-the-next-five-years/


Managing Virtual Internships During the Covid-19 Pandemic Era: 
Implications for Academic Instructors and Business Leaders

Laura B. Klein
Oakland University

Chaunda Scott
Oakland University

Abstract
During the beginning phase of the COVID-19 Pandemic in late March of 2020 in the United States, two academic instructors at a mid-sized, public university in the midwest were involved in converting a traditional human resource development internship course into a virtual internship course that they would be teaching in May of 2020. This paper shares the lesson learned by the two instructors along with a summary of a relevant theoretical leadership framework that provides useful insights for academic instructors and business leaders who are or will be managing virtual academic internships in the future. This paper will conclude by offering recommendations for academic instructors, business leaders and academics students interested in academic virtual internships.

Introduction
As two instructors of a traditional internship program at a midwest university in the summer of 2020, we were tasked with suddenly revising the program format to one that was virtual due to Covid 19. Without much experience teaching this virtually, certain challenges and opportunities arose. A challenge was that we had to convert and reinvent processes and documents to effectively manage the internship course in a virtual context given that this was a capstone course and requirement for students to graduate at the end of the semester. With not much guidance, and teaching this course remotely, we along with students and their internship supervisors, had to adjust to the new learning style quickly.

This unexpected change provided unique opportunities gained from this virtual internship experience. As instructors, along with internship students, and academic or business supervisors, we were able to advance our virtual learning knowledge and expand our online/remote
communication skills while facilitating a rich and valuable internship experience for students through a virtual medium. To share some of the experiences learned by the instructors, students, and internship supervisors, we will discuss below the virtual internship criteria, triangular-leadership model, and offer recommendations for instructors, students, and leaders interested in participating in learning through virtual internships.

**Virtual Internship Criteria**

This section will provide an overview of the virtual internship criteria at a midwest university. Students who were enrolled in the capstone course were required to secure a workplace site where the internship objectives could be accomplished virtually and allow them to gain experience in the area of human resources. Internship sites needed to facilitate and offer student experiences in the areas of organizational development, career development, training and development, cultural diversity, and employment systems and standards. To ensure that students have an opportunity to work at a professional level all sites were approved by staff of the human resources development (HRD) internship office before the student work commenced.

Students were required to work under the close supervision of an HR professional (the “site supervisor”) and with the additional oversight from the university HRD instructor. The HRD Internship requires a minimum of 320 hours at the internship. These hours are completed virtually with approval of the workplace supervisor and without direct faculty supervision. Students were expected to apply their learning from their HRD course work and previous experiences. There were three mandatory virtual class meetings as well as other opportunities for each student to meet and complete tasks, experiences, and accomplishments and connect with their instructor. Students compiled an online portfolio of the work they completed from the aforementioned areas above and submitted for final grading and use as a professional work sample.

**Theoretical Framework: Triangular Leadership Model**

A useful theoretical framework that academic instructors and business leaders can draw upon when managing virtual internships is the Triangular Leadership Model by Author One (2016) as shown in Figure 1.1 below. This theoretical “triangle” framework includes: 1) transformational leadership theory, 2) authentic leadership theory, and 3) distributed leadership theory. Notably, all three theories are equally relevant and essential for leadership to demonstrate.
while providing leadership for virtual internships. Each of the three theories discussed offer merit and practicality when applied to understanding the leadership opportunities for success and managing student needs while engaged in the internship role.

In a dissertation by Author One (2016), *Understanding the Experiences of Non-traditional University Leadership in Higher Education: A Qualitative Study Using a Triangular Theoretical Approach*, the transformational leadership theory was examined. This theory’s impact on organizational performance has garnered attention from researchers and leaders who hope to improve institutional and organizational success, it also has developed the substance, depth, and clarity to view the phenomenon of virtual internship leaders. Additionally, authentic leadership theory provides the contemporary approach to understanding the aspects of leadership needed to survive in today’s higher education and business environments. Distributed leadership recognizes in today’s workplace environment, the effort to lead an organization occurs at many different levels and in many cases outside of formal leadership roles. Successful academic and business leaders managing virtual internships will possess the ability to not only understand the importance of each leadership theory, but the ability to exhibit transformational, authentic, and distributed leadership characteristics to meet the demands of internship students in the virtual environment. Through the lenses of transformational, authentic, and distributed leadership theories, the realistic, current, and transforming nature of virtual internship leadership roles can be interpreted.

**Transformational Leadership Theory**

**Defining Transformational Leadership.** One of the most prevalent leadership theories researched over the past several decades is transformational leadership. Transformational leadership stems from the work of political scientists and sociologists, and gained momentum as an approach to studying leadership when Burns introduced the term transforming leadership in 1978. Transformational leadership is the process in which one person engages another and elevates the level of motivation and morality in both parties (Burns, 1978; Northouse, 2004). Burns argues by raising the conduct and ethical aspirations, both leaders and followers are transformed (1978). As such, the leader and the follower are connected and reliant on each other to raise performance. According to Burns, “power bases are linked not as counterweights but as mutual support for a common purpose” (p. 20). In turn, transformational leaders are able to
identify the needs of followers, but are able to go further by satisfying higher ethical and motivational needs in order to engage the whole individual (Burns, 1978). As such, transformational leaders have the ability to inspire, motivate, and encourage employees (and themselves) to achieve beyond expectations toward a common goal. Leaders and followers are able to transcend to an optimal level of achievement based on the greater good of the organization.

According to Bass (1985, 1989), four tenants directly relate to transformational leadership; idealized influence/attributed charisma, inspirational motivation, intellectual stimulation, and individual consideration. Specifically, *idealized influence/attributed charisma*, defines the level of power, confidence, ideas the leader exudes, and sense of mission. This influence has a strong emotional appeal and can move followers from self-interest to focusing on the common good beyond a level of expectation. It also highlights leadership behaviors and alignment to vision, mission, and purpose, and is consistent with ethical and moral expectations. *Inspirational motivation*, encourages followers to think beyond common expectations and motives to achieve at exceptional levels. Leadership has the ability to instill confidence in followers that the heightened level of achievement is achievable. *Intellectual stimulation*, encourages followers to challenge or question ideas, think innovatively, look for creative ways to solve problems, and ignites intellectual curiosity. *Individual consideration*, allows leaders to identify strengths and needs in individual followers and encourage development, empowerment, and ultimately self-actualization (Walumbwa & Wernsing, 2013).

**Research findings.** Recent empirical studies in various fields and context have revealed mostly expected results. Chief Executive Officers (CEOs), who hold the top-leadership role within organizations, are commonly studied with relation to transformational leadership. A 2008 study conducted by Jung, Wu, and Chow, used a sample of 50 Taiwanese telecommunication and electronics companies to explore how the CEO’s transformational leadership abilities impacted innovation within the organization. The results demonstrated a direct and positive effect on the CEO’s leadership style and level of innovation (Diaz-Saenz, 2011). In addition to senior leadership research, middle manager studies also reveal similar results. According to Singh and Krishnan, who studied the role of “altruism in the relationship between self-sacrifice” in India in 2008, transformational leadership positively related to follower’s collective identity and perception of organizational performance (Diaz-Saenz, 2011, p. 303). In a military context,
Eid, Johnsen, Bartone, and Nissestad (2008), explored the role of personal hardiness in initiating change or growth in a military training activity. Their study found a “significant increase in transformational and transactional leadership styles after the exercises” (as cited in Diaz-Saenz, 2001, p. 303). Additionally, it was discovered the transformational leadership style increased six months after the completion of the exercise.

Research conducted by Basham (2012), addresses the significance and broad appeal of transformational leadership in a higher education environment and specifically addresses a climate of change within an institution. With reduced government funding and the necessity to adapt to economic and organizational shifts, transformational leaders can instill a sense of encouragement and motivation for change.

**Application of Transformational Leadership Theory to the role of virtual internship leader.** When applying transformational leadership theory to the role, responsibilities, and ‘best fit’ characteristics of virtual internship leaders, identifying those who can drive and embrace higher order change is essential. Recognizing the need for change is transactional; institutions and companies that require a new direction, shift in organizational culture, or need to foster performance excellence, benefit from a transformational leader. Those leaders who demonstrate the ability to engage their constituencies beyond the transactional exchange relationship can heighten awareness of the need for fundamental, directional, and process changes (Bass, 1985). According to Bass, “This heightening of awareness requires a leader with vision, self-confidence, and inner strength to argue successfully for what he sees is right or good, not for what is popular or is acceptable according to the established wisdom of time” (p. 17).

Transformational leaders can inspire, motivate, and captivate their followers and provide the direction necessary to enhance organizational performance. With an emphasis on intrinsic motivation and employee development placed in today’s higher education environment and business environments, a charismatic and visionary leader can inspire constituencies, and in this case, internship students, to exceed performance even in a time of uncertainty (Northouse, 2013).

Both Burns and Bass address the prospect of ethical behavior as relative to leadership motives (Walumbwa & Wernsing, 2013). Burns (1978) notes there is an ethical component inherently built into transformational leadership; however Bass (1985) recognizes transformational leaders can use their abilities for good or bad intentions. The discussions that
assess leadership ethics, values, and an overall moral compass, address the topic of authenticity and provide the platform for the emergence of authentic leadership theory.

**Authentic Leadership Theory**

**Defining Authentic Leadership.** Introduced initially by Luthans and Avolio (2003), authentic leadership theory merged concepts from positive organizational behavior, transformational/full-range leadership, and ethical leadership theories, to depict the type of leadership needed to survive and thrive in contemporary organizational environments. Defining authentic leadership is somewhat complex as scholars accept multiple interpretations or definitions of the term. Most widely accepted is the definition of authentic leadership from a developmental, rather than simply interpersonal, perspective. According to Northouse (2013), *authentic leadership* emphasizes the ability to demonstrate resiliency and ethical transparency, while engaging constituencies across all levels. Authentic leadership is viewed as something that can evolve within an individual and is developed over the lifetime of a leader’s career. In organizations where change is imminent, the authentic leader can provide a foundation of trust and inspiration for followers.

According to Luthans and Avolio (2003), authentic leadership “draws from both positive psychological capacities and a highly developed organizational context, which results in both greater self-awareness and self-regulated positive behaviors on the part of leaders and associates, fostering positive self-development” (p. 243). A highly developed organizational context provides a clear organizational framework and culture of transparency. In those contexts, leaders and followers feel less vulnerable and are able to pursue the organization’s vision, goals, and objectives. Authentic leaders are “confident, hopeful, optimistic, resilient, transparent, moral/ethical, future-oriented, and give priority to developing associates to be leaders” (p. 243). Additionally, authentic leaders can engage followers by demonstrating actions and behaviors that reflect their values (2003). Leadership is able to exhibit behaviors and model the way followers can embrace and cascade throughout an organization. They are guided beyond self-interest and operate from deeper values.

Building on this definition, Kernis (2003), who looks at authenticity and its relationship to optimal self-esteem, claims, “authenticity can be characterized as reflecting the unobstructed operation of one’s true, or core self in one’s daily enterprise” (p. 13). He argues authenticity has
four key components which include awareness, unbiased processing, action, and relationship orientation (2003). Most authentic leadership models draw from the work of Kernis and part of his larger theory on self-esteem.

For the purpose of the virtual internship leader, the following tenants are identified as characteristic of authentic leaders: 1) **transparency**, present themselves as genuine and real – showing one’s true self; fostering open communication and relationships with others in doing so 2) **curiosity**, includes a desire to learn, understand, and explore 3) **vulnerability**, which includes self-awareness of strengths, weakness, feelings, and can express these with others; also leads to compassion for others 4) **openness**, possessing the quality of being straightforward in actions and words 5) **honesty**, driven by honorable intentions and moral code. 6) **trustworthiness**, inspiring trust and reliability 7) **humility**, displays humbleness and lack of ego in leadership role; leaders can be confident and humble at the same time, and 8) ‘**hot’ relationships’, which encourages the establishment of key relationships where individuals share genuine, real aspects of themselves to each other.

**Application of Authentic Leadership Theory to virtual internship leaders.** Business leadership and executive development programs were the first to embrace the applicability of authentic leadership. With uncertain and challenging times across most industries, authentic leadership is relevant to organizations – including higher education – that need to foster meaningful relationships and genuinely relate with key constituencies (Avolio & Gardner, 2005). This ongoing priority within higher education can provide followers with a “renewed focus on restoring confidence, hope, and optimism” (p. 316). As companies and higher education continue to compete for financial resources and the best talent, authentic leaders can open the doors to providing the organizational climate and environment for sustained success.

**Research findings.** Although the previous decade has prompted an increase in authentic leadership discourse, surprisingly few empirical studies exist. The majority of research discussions focused on business environments and explored leadership behaviors and individual perceptions of those behaviors. Qualitative research conducted by George, Sims, McLean, & Mayer (2007) explored how people become and remain authentic leaders. Researchers interviewed 125 leaders, primarily from business backgrounds (half were Chief Executive Officers) and nonprofit organizations. Participants were selected based on their reputations for
authenticity. Results from the study did not uncover a consistent trait or characteristic from these leaders, but rather their authenticity evolved from their life stories and real world experiences (2007). The limited research available also suggests, “leadership authenticity is in fact a relevant and potentially important issue for followers” (Caza & Jackson, 2011, p. 356). With an ongoing interest in authentic leadership from the academic and business communities, the research environment is primed for more empirical studies relevant to various types of organizations.

**Application of Authentic Leadership Theory to the role of virtual internship leader.** Leadership authenticity is relevant to the role, responsibilities and characteristics of those responsible for managing virtual internship programs and students. As financial and ethical scandals have surfaced throughout various industries over the past several decades – constituencies are demanding open and honest leadership (Northouse, 2013). Identifying those candidates who are trustworthy and genuine becomes a clear priority for selecting the best-fit leaders. Additionally, those serving in the role need to communicate and demonstrate authenticity and transparency through their actions. According to George (2003), authentic leaders must possess the following characteristics – passion, behavior, connectedness, consistency, and compassion. Not only should leaders possess these characteristics, but continually need to develop in each of those areas. With the demands facing academic and business leaders in today’s unpredictable economic climate, the need to exceed performance with numerous constituencies is necessary and can challenge the leader’s personal authenticity (Bornstein, 2004). As leaders face new and complex challenges, the need to possess authentic leadership qualities will impact the success of their experience managing virtual internships.

**Distributed Leadership Theory**

**Defining Distributed Leadership Theory.** Distributed leadership has gained prominence within educational management research throughout the past decade and acknowledges leading an organization involves multiple individuals who exert power or influence, transcending formal leadership roles (Spillane & Diamond, 2007; Gosling, Bolden & Petrov, 2009; Lumby, 2013). Occasionally referred to as shared leadership, shared governance, collaborative leadership, or democratic leadership, distributed leadership has taken a prominent hold on framing leadership research in complex organizational environments (Spillane &
Diamond, 2007). Distributed leadership tenants include: 1) collaboration, 2) open culture, 3) reflective practice, 4) leadership/engagement at all levels, and 5) flexibility.

**Application of Distributed Leadership Theory to organizations and higher education.** Although transformational leadership theory and authentic leadership theory can provide frameworks for understanding the individual leadership characteristics of an academic or business professional managing virtual internships, using a distributed leadership perspective is also relevant and necessary as a means for predicting leadership and student success while engaged in the internship process. Distributed leadership notably aligns with educational leadership and organizational shared governance. Distributed leadership theory identifies that no “one individual” leader can be solely responsible for success in vast corporate or institutional contexts.

**Application of Distributed Leadership Theory to the role of virtual internship leader.** Leaders who serve in this role must quickly learn those aspects and adapt their leadership style accordingly. According to Gosling et al. (2009), “Distributed leadership is not a replacement for individual leadership, rather it is an essential complement that both facilitates, and is facilitated by, the leadership of specific individuals (p. 300). Virtual internship leaders who can engage and foster distributed leadership within their organizations have greater opportunities for succeeding in the role. According to research conducted by Jones et al. (2014), distributed leadership relies on endorsement and support from formal leadership. With a distributed leadership model, “achieving the engagement of a wider group of staff is more effective in implementing change, and…in a more complex world, the skills and expertise of more diverse people are necessary to create successful leadership” (Lumby, 2013, p. 583). The appeal of the distributed leadership model resides in today’s desire for greater collaboration and collegiality, along with the need for collective input and leadership throughout institutions (Bolden, Petrov, & Gosling, 2009).

**Theoretical Framework Summary**

Framing the virtual internship through the triangular framework leadership model that includes transformational leadership theory, authentic leadership theory, and distributed leadership theory, can provide contemporary and practical knowledge for use to educate academic internship program leaders and business professionals responsible for supervising
student interns and fostering a virtual environment that provides a valuable, growth-driven experience.

**Conclusions and Recommendations**

As instructors of this virtual internship experience, we had the opportunity to develop and enhance our virtual learning skills. Our students also developed these marketable skills: working independently, adaptability, time management skills, multi-tasking, meeting deadlines, and meeting virtually on Zoom and WebEx learning management systems. Evident from our experiences instructing this virtual internship course, we recommend that virtual internships are an excellent option for students seeking to engage in internships in other states and countries across the globe. As for future research opportunities, we hope that this article will encourage academics and professionals in HRD and related fields to share their virtual internship teaching and learning experiences through scholarly journal articles for the purpose of building scholarly literature on this topic.

**References**


Figure 1. Theoretical “triangle” model.
Welcoming Generation Z: Managing Managers’ Communication Expectations of this Digital Loving Generation
Arlene Ramkissoon, Ohio Dominican University
Natalie Kompa, Ohio Dominican University
Thomas Eveland, Ohio Dominican University

Abstract: Intergenerational communication between managers and subordinates has been studied in previous years. However, there is a dearth of research on manager-employee communication preferences between Generation Z employees and their managers who belong to preceding generations. This research aims to further the meager understanding of the disconnects between communication media preferences between Generation Z and their managers of previous generations. By increasing the understanding of Generation Z preferences for specific communication media, overall employee satisfaction and employee performance of this cohort will increase. This research will add to the new body of knowledge on Generation Z’s preferred communication channels for information transfer. Practical organizational applications will be discussed in this paper.

INTRODUCTION
The subject of generational diversity in the workforce has been widely studied in the last decade. Many studies have researched the differences between Baby Boomers, Generation X, and Millennials, also known as Generation Y. At present, Millennials; those born after 1980, are not only the youngest generational cohort in the workplace but they are also the most educated and the largest generation of employees (Fry, 2015; Van Rossem, 2019). However, there is now a need to also extend generational studies to include the most recent entrants to the workforce; Generation Z employees. As Generation Z begins matriculating into the workforce, these newest entrants, born in 1995 and later, are predicted to be a larger generation than the Baby Boomers (born between 1946 and 1964) and the Millennials (born between 1981 and 1994) (Sparks & Honey, 2014). If this expectation is taken into consideration, management may have to determine how to contend with a set of challenges which are unique to the Generation Z cohort. These challenges can include attracting, selecting, training and retaining these fledgling employees.
Are management practitioners adequately prepared for their arrival? There has been research on how generations perceive each other (Van Rossem, 2019). In addition, there is a proliferation of literature on how to address disconnects between Millennials and the preceding generations in the workplace (Omlion-Hodges & Sugg, 2019). There is currently a scarcity of research on Generation Z and their disconnects with previous generations. This exposes a need to narrow this gap in existing literature; especially the discrepancies between Generation Z and previous generational cohorts when it comes to communication preferences in the workplace. If this can be better understood, it stands to reason that managerial communication with Generation Z employees should be tailored to their preferences. A study conducted by Madlock (2008) has determined that effective managerial communication with each employee is a primary predictor of employee satisfaction with their job and with their leader-member communication. In addition, communication over time serves to shape the relationship between managers and subordinates. High leader member exchange (LMX) can result in higher organizational citizenship behaviors (OCBs), team performance, and overall job performance (Harris, Li, & Kirkman, 2014; Omlion-Hodges & Baker, 2017).

Traditionally the primary source of information on communicating with Millennial employees and now Generation Z employees is from their direct managers. While this is insightful, it only provides half of the perspective needed to understand the best-practices necessary for communicating with this particular generation. This area of research can only be completed by including the perspectives of Generation Z employees.

It is important to note that “life events” in the different cohorts have a great influence on what the members of these generations value, and by extension, how they view members of their own generation and that of others (Van Rossem, 2019). According to Joshi, Dencker, Franz and Martocchio (2010), employees hold what is called a generational identity which is “an individual’s knowledge that he or she belongs to a generational group/role, together with some emotional and value significance to him or her of this group/role membership” (p. 393).

From the perspective of social identity, perceptions of one’s own and other generations can result in generational stereotypes, prejudice, and even interpersonal conflict (Urick & Hollensbe, 2014). Information transfer from one generation to another can often result in suboptimal
outcomes due to the fact that information sharing requires trust, which can be sacrificed when differing life experiences or worldviews are involved. This problem is further propagated by the different communication media preferences of each generational cohort (Hadar, 2015).

Therefore, it is crucial for managers to understand the distinctive characteristics of employees in the Generation Z labor market and have a plan to leverage their unique skillset once they are a part of the workforce. This can only be successful if the expectations of Generation Z can be fully understood and taken into consideration when engaging in communication exchange. While managers are faced with the unique challenge of learning how to adjust to the communication preferences of this cohort, the Generation Z employees will have to adjust to operating in a work environment. Generation Z employees are entering the workforce with considerably less work experience than previous generations; in 2018, approximately 20% of 15-17 year olds have reported having any work experience in the previous year, while approximately 30% of Millennials have had some form of work experience when they were that age (Schroth, 2019). It can therefore be deduced that managers of this generation of employees will require some practice in managing their expectations, perceptions, and stereotypes associated with these employees, especially those which deal with their communication preferences.

Since members of Generation Z are poised to replace Millennials as the largest generation in the workforce, it is a proactive measure on the part of researchers and management to understand or even eliminate misunderstandings of this generation in order to increase intergenerational synergy. This study aims to add to the nascent body of literature on Generation Z in the workplace, and will especially focus on managerial communication with Generation Z. Through a conceptual lens, this paper will set the stage for an exploratory study which will identify the communication channel preferences of Generation Z and their managers who belong to previous generations.
LITERATURE REVIEW

Generation Z

Generation Z represents a cohort of workers who come to their jobs with an innate ability to use and consume data, often outpacing their older office cohorts, many of whom grew up during a time of data usage growth, but not with the innate capabilities of Generation Z to manipulate and consume online content (Kleinschmit, 2015). Generation Z has been found to be highly achievement-oriented and hardworking, although their work experience may be limited prior to landing a first full-time job (Schroth, 2019).

Generation Z individuals came of age during a period of tremendous economic and cultural upheaval, experiencing a post September 11th world where the U.S. has always been at war and their families still face the long-term effects of the Great Recession (Dorsey, 2016). Members of Generation Z have described themselves as more anxious than previous generations, rating their mental health as fair or poor, as compared to all previous generations (APA, 2018). While Generation Z mirrors some traits that are similar to the previous generation, Millennials, this newest generation looks at the world differently than generational predecessors. One distinct characteristic of Generation Z is deep value and involvement in societal issues and a broad acceptance in friend groups and society overall (Swanzen, 2018).

Generation Z members comfortably multi-task, having grown up in a culture of complexity. These technology savants often operate on as many as five screens at the same time, moving from two-way to one-way conversations with ease (Glum, 2015). Generation Z relishes the use of technology to connect with the world, not hide from it. This generation uses their smartphones to build online and offline community, and to actively participate in the world around them and to have voice (Kleinschmit, 2015). In a 2019 study conducted by the Pew Research Center it was found that 95% of U.S. teenagers have cell phone availability and 45% of them report being almost constantly online (Schaeffer, 2019).

Since technology plays a pivotal role in the life of Generation Z, it governs how this generation communicates, socializes, completes schoolwork, entertains, and even exercises (Schroth, 2019). It is incorporated into the daily lives of Generation Z individuals; from their social
interaction, the completion of tasks, their form of relaxation among other things (Pew Research, 2018). Online communication and community building by Generation Z outpaces all other generations, with Generation Z spending more than three hours per day on their computers for non-school related purposes and with 81% using some form of social media (Sparks & Honey, 2014). Generation Z possesses what some researchers have described as, a digital bond to the Internet (Steinmetz, 2017).

With Millennials and Generation X entering the work world in droves many years prior to Generation Z, the workplace has become populated with Millennial and Generation X managers, with the average age of a first-time manager in the U.S. standing at 30 (Taylor, 2019). Identifying ways to communicate in this multi-generational workplace will continue to present organizational challenges. Millennials are often considered to be the most digitally savvy when it pertains to their digital leadership capabilities, however Generation X leaders were found to be equally confident in digital communication while also demonstrating better skills in showing empathy and driving outcomes (Neal, 2019).

Discrepancies between what Millennial and Generation X managers consider essential to good communication and the wants and needs of the newest generation of workers present additional challenges for leaders. Employees use their manager communication as an indicator of the quality of the shared relationship (Fairhurst, 2007). Another outcome is that subordinates use the top-down communication methods as a guide when choosing how they instigate communication with their managers (Omilion-Hodges & Sugg, 2019). This highlights the importance of perceptions in the communication exchange. Initial framing and expectations of management communication can play a role in the way employees communicate which may undesirable to the employee (Omilion-Hodges & Sugg, 2019). Manager communication archetypes can be a major information source used to determine how Generation Z employees assume their managers should communicate with them. Table 1 below, compares the communication expectations and preferences between Generation Z and the previous two generations.
Table 1
Communication expectations of Generation Z, Millennials and Generation X

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Generation</th>
<th>Communication expectations</th>
<th>Preferred method of communication</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Generation Z</td>
<td>Positivity, followed by clear targets</td>
<td>*Current gap in literature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Millennials</td>
<td>Open communication and feedback followed by clear targets</td>
<td>Text messages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Collaborative interaction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Generation X</td>
<td>Open communication and positivity followed by clear targets</td>
<td>Voicemail</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>E-mail</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Casual face-to-face</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Direct and immediate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baby Boomers</td>
<td>Respectful, participatory exchanges</td>
<td>Face-to-face</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Phone calls</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Personal interaction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Structured networking</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Note.* Adapted from Shroth (2019) and Hannam and Yordi (2011)

As illustrated in the table above, Generation Z indicates positivity is the foremost consideration in manager-employee communication while Millennials and Generation X consider open communication to be their prime expectation when communicating. Unmet expectations around communication can lead to employee dissatisfaction and eventual turnover (Pearce, 1998). The communication contract between Generation Z and managers from other generations should include approaches germane to the needs of Generation Z. To meet the communication needs of Generation Z, managers should consider positive communication including essential details in the early stages of supervisor-employee relationship formation with Generation Z, including an outline of job responsibilities; expectations around hours of work and working conditions as well as a clear outline of the pros and cons of the job, organization and manager (Schroth, 2019). An examination of theories around communication media and their applicability to meeting the needs of Generation Z and managers can help smooth the communication process between
generations. Since members of Generation Z have incorporated technology into every aspect of their lives it is only fitting to research which electronic communication media would be most effective for Generation Z in the workplace.

**Information richness of communication media**

Information Richness Theory (IRT) was conceptualized by Daft and Lengel (1986) to address the richness of any electronic communication media. This theory ranks communication media in terms of “richest” to “leanest” (Ngwenyana & Lyytinen, 1997). The subject of richness in managerial communication is one which takes on an interpretive perspective of the capacity of both the sender and the receiver of messages to accurately understand the meaning of the messages (Lee, 1994). The seminal body of work by Daft and Lengel (1986) describes IRT as a function of the “learning capacity of a communication” (p. 560).

According to Daft and Lengel (1986) communication transactions which are categorized as low in information richness are those which require a longer time for understanding to be garnered and processed. Conversely, communication transactions which are considered high in information richness encompass varying perspectives or influence a clear understanding of the issues to influence a timely understanding of the issues at hand (Daft & Lengel, 1986). Different communication mediums are associated with varying degrees of richness. Information richness of some commonly used mediums in decreasing order is as follows: “(1) face-to-face, (2) telephone, (3) personal documents such as letters or memos, (4) impersonal written documents, and (5) numeric documents” (Daft & Lengel, 1986, p. 560). The main determinants of the degree of richness depends on the medium’s facilitation of feedback in real-time, the number of verbal and non-verbal cues utilized, ability to customize or personalize and the capacity for language variety (Daft & Lengel, 1986).

Even though IRT was originally formulated to focus on the processing of information, the use of the theory has evolved to individual managers, their media choices, and their communication of messages (Markus, 1994). With the integration of more sophisticated technology in the workplace more information channels were added to those originally discussed by Daft and Lenge (1986) in their seminal work (Markus, 1994). The updated list has been categorized into
information channels which are high (face-to-face, video conferencing, telephone), medium (email, handheld devices, blogs) and low (written letters and memos, formal written documents, spreadsheets) in information richness (Bauer, Erdogan, Short & Carpenter, 2016).

Table 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Information Channel</th>
<th>Information Richness</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Face-to-face conversation</td>
<td>High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Video conferencing</td>
<td>High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Telephone conversation</td>
<td>High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E-mails</td>
<td>Medium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Handheld devices</td>
<td>Medium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blogs</td>
<td>Medium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Written letters and memos</td>
<td>Medium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Formal written documents</td>
<td>Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spreadsheets</td>
<td>Low</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Technology shaping communication skills

One of the primary requirements of employers in the present workforce is effective communication skills (Deming, 2017; Hochwarter, Witt, Treadway & Ferris, 2006). It is interesting to note that while employers identify oral communication skills as one of the top three applied skills, they rate recent graduates as highly deficient in this competency (The Conference Board, 2019). This can be exemplified by the fact that by the time Generation Z individuals were in the early teenage years, their primary mode of communication was through web-based devices such as mobile devices, cellular phones and WiFi (Dimock, 2019). The introduction of the smartphone impacted Generation Z in a myriad of ways, including the limiting of traditional face-to-face interactions that teens would otherwise have with one another (American Psychological Association, 2018). Researchers suggest that this reliance on technology can impair Generation Z’s ability to communicate with others, including the older generations in the workplace.
(Schroth, 2019). Unlike Millennials, who needed to adapt to social media, 24/7 connectivity, and various on-demand media, Generation Z has no adaptation lag, since these technology-enhanced modes of communication were ubiquitous by the time of Generation Z’s birth. The easy availability of electronic devices has been found to directly reduce the frequency of face-to-face communication this generation engages in (Dimock, 2019).

With Millennials and Generation X entering the work world in droves many years prior to Generation Z, the workplace has become populated with Millennial and Generation X managers, with the average age of a first-time manager in the U.S. standing at 30 (Taylor, 2019) Identifying ways to communicate in this multi-generational workplace will continue to present organizational challenges. Millennials are often considered to be the most digitally savvy when it pertains to their digital leadership capabilities, however Generation X leaders were found to be equally confident in digital communication while also demonstrating better skills in showing empathy and driving outcomes (Neal, 2019).

**RESEARCH FOCUS**

It can be assumed that Generation Z employees, due to their expertise with communicating via web-based devices, favor medium-rich communication methods in their professional life. For example, communication via e-mail, chat via company intranet, and text messaging will be the prime avenues of communication preferred by Generation Z employees in the workplace. As such, it is often assumed that Generation Z employees would rather communicate through medium-rich channels with their managers or with others within the organization. However, the current discussion of this generation’s communication preferences is based on assumptions, anecdotal evidence, and informal extrapolations from interactions with those from Generation Z.

Given this generation’s economic and social impact on our nation and the public and private organizations within, it is critical that empirical data and analysis begin to inform the literature. To that end, this research seeks to answer four primary questions which will uncover not only Generation Z’s preferences for communicating with their managers but also the preferences of the managers when communicating with the Generation Z employees. Answers to these questions will help to identify and address the disconnects in generational preferences for communication channels in the workplace.
Research Questions:

1. What are Generation Z’s preferences for communication channels when exchanging information with their immediate manager in the workplace?
2. What are Millennial managers’ preferences for communication channels when exchanging information with their Generation Z direct report?
3. What are Generation X managers’ preferences for communication channels when exchanging information with their Generation Z direct report?
4. What are Baby Boomer managers’ preferences for communication media when exchanging information with their Generation Z direct report?

METHODOLOGY

Due to the originality of this study, an exploratory approach will be used to conduct this research. Participants will be sourced from several franchises in a popular fast-food chain in the Central Ohio region. The population under study will include all hourly and managerial employees from all of the generations under study, and special care will be taken to ensure an ample sample of participants from each generation.

The survey will be conducted through an electronic survey service. The survey will be designed based on the principles included the work of Dillman (2000), and will be pilot tested for content and construct validity and tested for reliability using Cronbach’s alpha (Field, 2013). The participants will be assured anonymity as identifying information will not be collected and responses will be available only to the researchers. Each participant will be required to sign a consent form.

A series of questions designed to probe the communication preferences of Generation Z will be utilized as a proxy to measure the construct of Generation Z’s communication preference. A corresponding set of questions designed to probe the communication preferences of Millennial, Generation X and Baby Boomer managers will also be distributed to members of each respective generation. As a preface, the participants will be informed of the meaning of communication channel as it pertains to this study. Each participant will be asked demographic questions such as their birth year, gender, the length of time they have been employed at that employer, if they were in a managerial or non-managerial position, their highest level of education attained.
Survey data will be collected over a three-week period and the results analyzed using t-tests, ANOVA, and MANOVA.

**IMPLICATIONS OF THIS RESEARCH**

The results of this research will have many practical implications in industry. It is well-established in academic literature that generational cohorts have different preferences due to corresponding life-events and experiences (Van Rossem, 2019). This is certainly true for preferences for certain communication channels which have associated with them different levels of information-richness (Hannam & Yordi, 2011).

When the communication preferences of Generation Z as well as the preferences of their managers are known, there are several direct applications which can be implemented. First, this research will discover any communication preference disconnects which may exist between generations. Managers will have a choice to change their communication channels to match those preferred by their subordinates. Any effort on the part of the manager to adjust communication preferences to suit the preferences of Generation Z signals to these young employees that they are valued in their company and that their managers are respectful and considerate of their preferences. This can help to strengthen the LMX relationship between the manager and the Generation Z subordinate.

It is expected that each generation will have different preferences for information exchange in different situations. For example, Generation Z might prefer face-to-face communication when it deals with performance feedback or mentoring communication exchanges but prefer medium-rich communication channels such e-mails when exchanging information on daily operations in the workplace. It can be assumed that the more importance Generation Z places on the information being exchanged, the more information rich channels would appeal to them. This is because they may want to observe and interpret of all the verbal and non-verbal cues which are associated with the communication.

Generation Z communication preferences can be taken into account when training is being designed for this cohort. Their communication preferences will also signal their learning preferences or their preferences for knowledge transfer in the workplace.
It is expected that the results of this study will improve the understanding of the disconnects which might exist between communication media preferences of Generation Z and their managers of previous generations. If these disconnects can be identified and addressed, more satisfied and higher performing employees will result. This can only lead to improved organizational performance and a healthier workplace environment.

References


Entrepreneurship and Innovation: The Development of a Minor for an Undergraduate Business Program

Mary U. Henderson
St. Catherine University
Megan Kalina
St. Catherine University

Abstract
The purpose of this paper is to review the rationale for developing a new entrepreneurship and innovation minor at the University. Business leaders value innovative and entrepreneurial acumen in their employees. Many students today will start businesses in the future. A competitive review of all higher education institutions in the state revealed that 14 of them offer entrepreneurship and innovation programs as majors, minors, concentrations, and/or certificates. Since there is not an entrepreneurship or innovation program at the University, there is a gap in the academic offerings. After a review of the marketplace and an analysis of programs at in-state colleges and universities, the authors developed a new entrepreneurship and innovation minor for the University. This paper discusses the need from both a business and university perspective for the addition of a new entrepreneurship and innovation minor at the University. While it will be located in the Business Administration department, the minor is designed for both business and non-business majors. This paper addresses these questions: What is the overall rationale for this minor? What is the business need for it? What is the university need for it? What are the University minor requirements? What new courses are needed and what are their respective course descriptions?

Key words: Entrepreneurship, innovation, minor, University

Introduction
The world has become a complex, rapidly changing place. This has created a need for innovation and an entrepreneurial mindset. In this paper, we will explore the development of an entrepreneurship and innovation minor at a University. The proposed minor is based on
understanding the University and business needs. The overall competitive landscape was analyzed through a web search for a state in the Midwest. This analysis included looking at the program requirements on the respective school website for all majors and minors.

University Need for an Entrepreneurship and Innovation Minor

The authors teach at a University with a mission to “…educate women to lead and influence” [University, 2019]. The founding religious order, a group of sisters, has been deeply committed to social justice and the importance of higher education for women. In addition to the academic disciplines, they taught women the art of lace-making as a means to earn a living so they could have a better life. These entrepreneurial founders inspired the work that continues today at the University. The business administration department at the University is committed to educating students for future careers as leaders in business. This department offers majors and/or minors in accounting, business administration, business management, business-to-business sales, healthcare management, healthcare sales, integrated marketing communication and design, and marketing. A minor, and possibly a major in the future in entrepreneurship and innovation is missing from the mix of programs. This gap would be addressed by the addition of a minor in entrepreneurship and innovation.

Once the demand for this minor is measured and evaluated, the faculty would determine if a major in entrepreneurship and innovation should be developed in addition to the minor. This minor in entrepreneurship and innovation is designed to meet the academic needs of both business and non-business majors at this liberal arts institution.

In current business classes, students actively engage in ongoing discussions and case studies featuring entrepreneurial examples. They are frequently interested in learning more about successful business start-ups because some of them foresee that as part of their future.

Singer (2015) states,

Ten years ago, it may have sufficed to offer a few entrepreneurship courses, workshops, and clubs. But undergraduates, driven by a sullen job market and inspired by billion-dollar success narratives from Silicon Valley, now expect universities to teach them how to convert their ideas into business or nonprofit ventures. (p.1)
Business Need for an Entrepreneurship and Innovation Minor

There has been a growth in demand for an entrepreneurial and innovative mindset in business today. This is evident in companies, primarily with importance on new product development. Product life cycles are getting shorter, and new products emerge quicker. Employees are crucial to generating new ideas. Companies take steps to create an innovative environment that will hopefully generate creative ideas. Reviewing Forbes 2018 list of the World’s Most Innovative Companies, there are large companies, small companies, medium companies. It is not just small start-up businesses that desire innovative employees today. All companies do.

Innovation is more than just creating new products. According to Henderson (2017), innovation also relates to improving and adapting business models to achieve better products and services. For businesses to stay competitive, or get a market edge on their competitors, their business models must support this mindset of growth.

Reviewing the 2018 Forbes ranking of the World’s Most Innovative Companies list, for the top five companies, sales growth rates range from 24.88% to 67.98%. The innovative and entrepreneurial mindset has led to significant sales growth. Developing and encouraging an entrepreneurial mindset is essential for all employees of growth-driven companies. Hamel and Tennant (2015) identify the five requirements of an innovative company, with the first being employees who have been taught to think like innovators. This skill set is crucial for entrepreneurs as well as all employees who work in organizations that value innovation.

Target Corporation is an excellent example of a large company that values innovation. Target’s stock price increased 20% on August 22, 2019, after they released their quarterly earnings beating analyst expectations (Trainer, 2019). The retail company has demonstrated innovation from changing product delivery options, modern store redesigns, increasing the interactive nature of stores, small store formats, and a Disney partnership (Trainer, 2019). These are examples of business model innovations Target made to stay relevant, given the increase in online consumer purchases.

With a start-up business, the entrepreneur would be considered the Chief Innovation Officer (CIO). The owner starting the business, has come up with an innovative company idea that
fulfills an unmet need. As organizations of all sizes are embracing the entrepreneurial mindset, there is an increase in the number of companies having a CIO as part of the C-level team. For example, in 2017, Nordstrom created the position of CIO tasked with taking on digital tech to increase sales (Kung, 2017). Osterwalder (2015) refers to this position as the Chief Entrepreneur and believes this person must be at the c-level. This is the person taking the company into the future and leading the innovation.

Considering this strong business need, for organizations of all sizes and industries, a minor in entrepreneurship and innovation would add value for a significant number of students. It would increase their marketability and provide additional career opportunities for them.

**Competitive Analysis**
A review of all private and public institutions offering bachelor’s degrees in the same state as the University revealed that 14 of the 50 institutions offer entrepreneurship and/or innovation majors, minors, concentrations, and/or certificates. Of the 14 organizations, eight are public and six are private entities. Eight of these 14 schools offer majors and eight offer minors. Others of them offered certificates and concentrations. Of the eight schools having an entrepreneurship and innovation minor course information was available for seven of the institutions. The program at the eighth school is newly approved, and course requirements have not yet been posted on their website. For the seven schools, commonalities around course requirements were discovered, as noted in the table below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Institution</th>
<th>#1</th>
<th>#2</th>
<th>#3</th>
<th>#4</th>
<th>#5</th>
<th>#6</th>
<th>#7</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fundamentals of Entrepreneurship</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>no</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integrative Marketing Communication and Design/Principles of Marketing</td>
<td>no</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Innovation, Creativity, and Entrepreneurial Mindset</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>no</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>no</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entrepreneurship Strategy</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entrepreneurship in practice</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>no</td>
<td>no</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>yes</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Optional
The Case for a New Entrepreneurship and Innovation Minor

A program in entrepreneurship and innovation would provide business and non-business students with flexibility to study another business-related discipline. It also opens up an additional career path for students. There would potentially be appeal for this new minor for students in all programs across the University. The plan would be to initially offer this minor is an online format. In the future, the goal will be to expand it to a face-to-face offering. Since it would be offered as an online minor at the start, no additional classroom space would be needed which is important since space is at a premium on the campus. Online course offerings would provide a flexible option for students. There may be additional new potential grants available for a program focused on entrepreneurship from organizations such as the Kauffman Foundation.

Developed Minor Proposed

The proposed entrepreneurship and innovation minor would include five courses totaling 18 credits. These classes include:

   This course will lay the foundation for entrepreneurship and innovation. It will cover the basics of planning and launching a business. Students will be introduced to real entrepreneur stories. Students will meet entrepreneurs of for-profit and nonprofit organizations who will share their business experience via online interviews and recordings.

2. Integrative Marketing Communication and Design–4 credits.
   This course is an introduction to the promotion element in the marketing mix, focusing on the integration of all elements, including advertising, personal selling, public relations, sales promotion, sponsorship, interactive marketing, and other marketing channels. Students will master new web-based technologies, such as Twitter, LinkedIn, WordPress and other social media. As a writing intensive course, students will write - individually and as a team - a wide variety of marketing communication pieces using standard technology (i.e., desktop word processing) and web tools, such as Google Docs and online blogging.

3. Innovation, Creativity, and Entrepreneurial Mindset–4 credits.
   This course will develop the mindset to think innovatively and creatively and to use those tools to solve problems and discover opportunities.

This course will cover strategic and tactical tools needed to start and operate a successful small or entrepreneurial business. This class will include planning, initiating, and developing a complete business plan for a business.

5. Entrepreneurship in Practice – 2 credits
This course will be taught in conjunction with a student working in an entrepreneurial internship or project, in the student’s area of interest, for-credit. Students meet in a class with others doing internships/projects. The class reads and discusses career, entrepreneurship, and innovation books and materials and everyone maintains a journal. There are midpoint and final evaluations at the site. Peer coaching occurs in class. Also, the instructor, who is the faculty internship adviser, provides individual business coaching for the students.

Summary
A review and analysis of industry expectations for entrepreneurial and innovation acumen, academic program growth trends, and a competitive higher education program analysis revealed a gap in the curriculum at the University. After identifying this gap, steps were taken to address a solution A new minor in entrepreneurship and innovation was developed which involved the design of some new courses. This program is ready for review by the administration and, if approved, will launch in the fall of 2020.
References


Forbes 2018 ranking of the world’s most innovative companies, (2019). Retrieved from https://www.forbes.com/innovative-companies/#1dbb0e0f1d65


Familiarity Mode’s Impact On Globalization And Invulnerability Case Study

Irena Bagdady
University of Phoenix

Introduction

Familiarity is the quality of being well known, based on close association. A synonym for familiarity is the understanding between two entities. Two affiliations from diverse cultures function better together when examining naturalistic environment. Respecting cultures about one another to gain knowledge can be concluded as the mode in a data set (Ngiam, Khaw, Holcombe, & Goodbourn, 2019). Familiarity mode compared doubly greater in significance to language and benevolence taxonomies in this case study.

In the United States (US), the scenario of underserved foreign nationals (UFNs) and served nationals (SNs) are examples of affiliations because of invulnerability aspect impacting globalization. Invulnerability is the privilege of exemption from certain laws and taxes granted to diplomats, like UFNs by the country in which they are working. UFNs for the case study, are represented by embassy officials, ambassadors, trade and commerce commissioners in the Mideastern United States from home countries. SNs for the case are represented by executives and managers in the Northcentral United States. As a researcher studies familiarity as a culture, UFNs in embassies representing their countries are comparable to SNs of corporations, both cohabitating in the United States. UFNs and SNs balance each other out, as SNs stabilize and mitigate decisions, in a position to help 2nd and 3rd World countries. The mediation of SNs influences the decisions concerning retrospective phenomenon that UFNs create (Håkonsson & Carroll, 2016).

The researcher examines coordination as the first naturalistic environment element (Chan, Shum, Touloupolu & Chen, 2008). Planning, sequencing and strategy is the second naturalistic environment element (Chan, et al, 2008). Familiarity mode, involves word and phrase frequencies from perceptions and experiences of affiliated leaders to determine significances and a model analysis of responses to questions.
Research Question

There is one research question. What are the perceptions and experiences of US affiliated UFN and SN leaders and how does mitigation of decisions concern invulnerability through familiarity mode?

Problem

There is a lack of recognition for the affiliation of UFNs and SNs in the United States needed to improve decision-making (Håkonsson & Carroll, 2016). Specifically, familiarity is a type of culture that requires greater attention for the affiliation of the two entities and aspects of invulnerability’s impact on globalization lacking retrospectivity (Raphael, 2020). The impact on globalization is observable by familiarity mode revealing the UFNs cause decision stifling and need affiliation of the SNs.

Purpose

The purpose of the case study was to understand the reasons why the affiliation of two entities is misunderstood. The case study unveils misunderstanding affiliations of UFNs and SNs through familiarity mode impacting globalization. Familiarity was examined for retrospective aspects of diplomats crossing borders at term commencement and expiration and SNs who stabilize global decisions, specifically for 2nd and 3rd World countries.

Method

The method of this case study is qualitative. The design is a case study (Yin, 2015). Data sources in the case included respondent responses to two sets of questions validated by a field test (Yin, 2017). One set of questions pertained to UFNs and the other was for SNs, making it possible to gain scholarly insights into the problem. Familiarity taxonomy was funneled for the case study protocol to link the questions and protocol topics. Protocol topics compared familiarity through converging arrow and process arrow models for the case study.

Data Collection

The primary means of data collection was through face-to-face interviews with two sets of questions. Interviews were performed for UFNs and SNs using two recorders, an MP3 and a Samsung Android telecommunication device. UFNs interviews lasted 90 minutes and SNs interviews lasted 60 minutes. Data was collected and asked by researcher with 20 questions, 10 each. In the case study, data collection referred to outcomes of model analysis for affiliated leaders living in the United States at the same time.
Data Analysis

**Results measures.** A two-model analysis was created from transcribed interview respondent responses using a pattern matching technique. The latter involved a word frequency system that was further funneled to a taxonomy. A frequency was calculated every time a question’s response hit a category. Frequencies were determined with a synonymous words and phrases in a line compared to the total number of lines system. Frequencies in a line were added and then compared to the total number of lines in first fraction form and then were converted to percentages. The significant categories for the case included lead action and human resources; recruitment. The significant categories were then funneled further to the taxonomies of familiarity, language and benevolence.

NCapture in Microsoft software was usable to transcribe recorded interviews from UFNs and SNs (Merriam & Grenier, 2019). NVivo12 ® software technology was used for findings to code and analyze results to create findings and conclusions (Yin, 2015). Findings and conclusions created the two models for analysis (see Figures 1 & 2).

**Findings.** One finding in the converging arrows model in Figure 1 that shows familiarity impacts globalization by SNs concerning invulnerability and the moderating of decisions was achieved (see Figure 1).

![Figure 1- Familiarity Mode #1 & #2 Converging Arrows for US Served Nationals As Moderators of Decisions](image-url)
Only the two categories of lead action and human resources; recruitment for SNs were usable with highest significances. The finding was familiarity mode appearing twice in the data set for the SN respondent responses. Coordination at 75% Mode #1, was the highest percentage for human resources recruitment when asked questions. Sequencing, strategy and planning at 115% Mode #2, was the highest percentages for lead actions when asked questions.

The second finding is the process arrows for familiarity triangulation model in Figure 2 and invulnerability impacts globalization. Process One, Two and Three of UFNs and SNs word frequency determinations compare salient familiarity to language and benevolence taxonomies through coordination and strategy, sequencing and planning (see Figure 2).

**Process One**
- **Affiliation of UFNs & SNs**
- Familiarity (50%) SNs
- Mode #1 75% Mode #2 115%
- Language (25%) UFNs 82%
- Benevolence (25%) UFNs 73%

**Process Two**
- **Coordination & SSP**
- COORDINATION SNs 75% (HR Recruitment) UFNs 82% (Elasticity)
- STRATEGY SEQUENCING & PLANNING SSP 58% 115% (Lead Actions) UFNs 73% (Acts of Volition)

**Process Three**
- Invulnerability On Globalization
- Mode #1 & #2 Familiarity; Invulnerability & Affiliation

*Figure 2- Process Arrows For Familiarity Triangulation Model & Invulnerability Impacting Globalization*

Language and benevolence funneled taxonomies appeared only one time each and are less significant for the UFNs from a statistical mode (see Figure 2). A process arrows model demonstrates human resources recruitment and lead actions as most significant classifications for familiarity revealing that a retrospective invulnerability is lacking in globalization considerations (Figure 2).
Conclusion

The converging arrows model in Figure 1 differentiates from the process arrows familiarity triangulation model in Figure 2. UFNs word frequency was less significant in Figure 2, determining that invulnerability lacks retrospectivity needing attention. Invulnerability for the UFNs has a different set of criteria in the United States, temporarily as dignitaries, that will go back to different criteria for law and order in their home countries.

In Figure 2, the familiarity triangulation mode has process One, Two and Three; affiliation of UFNs and SNs; coordination; strategy, sequence and planning; and invulnerability’s impact on globalization. Process one shows coordination familiarity modes #1 and #2 as having most relevance with the highest percentages over language and benevolence. Process two shows coordination in human resource departments and how they hire may require assessments and extensive background checks that dignitaries are not evading suit or prosecution in a different temporary domicile (Raphael, 2020).

Coordination of SNs in human resources; recruitment category applying to various industries may require vigilance and scrutiny of applicants to determine how they perform temporal tasks over diplomatic term duration in assessments. Strategy, sequencing and planning of SNs in lead action, applies to chief executive officer (CEO) making determinations through delegation of duties for decisions and retrospective applications differing from country to country. Elasticity and acts of volition categories for UFNs are examples of needy as 2nd and 3rd World country representatives because they are reliant and must have clean records. 2nd and 3rd World Embassy representation in the United States is moderated through their affiliation on corporate leaders, regardless of the industry or country.

Process Three shows familiarity mode of UFNs and SNs impacting globalization. Invulnerability retrospectivity of UFN’s activity back in his or her home country is critical before the end of term. Abuse and exploitation impacts globalization by shielding a diplomat from liability for wrongful actions before acquiring a dignitary position. Familiarity would include reciprocal clearing of diplomat liability before returning to their host country.
References


One World Decisions & Risk; Ex Post Facto Case Study
Irena Bagdady
University of Phoenix

Introduction

Risk is the quality of taking chance. The case is based on taking chance in the United States (U.S.), specifically two cultures living in the same country. The definition of risk for the case is the threat between two U.S. parties hampering safety, and challenging decision stifling.

Two affiliated interdependencies from diverse cultures, comprised of U.S. under-empowered foreign nationals (UEFNs) to empowered nationals (ENs). UEFNs and ENs function better together when examining risk as one element under naturalistic environment. Risk summed and averaged as the most significant categories compared to the other two elements of motor and process and naturalistic action (Chan, Shum, Toulopolu & Chen, 2008). The researcher used risk sums and averages for a synonymous words and phrases evaluation.

In the U.S., the scenario of UEFNs and ENs are examples of interdependencies of two U.S. parties from an ex post facto perspective. Ex post facto is a term used to describe a retroactive effect or force. The latter term is a consequence based on an antecedent condition (Simon & Goes, 2013). For this case study an antecedent condition is a temporary U.S. assignment preceded by what he or she experienced in their prior home country, but may not be subject to consequence in a host country. The interdependency between two parties in the U.S. for this case study is comparison of temporary dignitaries to permanent executives and managers.

The privilege of exemption from certain laws and taxes is granted to temporary dignitaries like UEFNs by the country in which they are working. UEFNs for the case study, are represented by embassy officials, ambassadors, trade and commerce commissioners in the Mideastern U.S. from home countries. ENs for the case are represented by executives and managers in the Northcentral U.S. As a researcher studies risk as a culture, UEFNs in embassies representing their countries are comparable to ENs of corporations, both cohabitating in the U.S. UEFNs and ENs should balance each other out, as their interdependence stabilize and mitigate decisions, concerning 2nd and 3rd World countries. The latter interdependence influences the
decision stifling that lack of interdependence creates concerning ex post facto phenomenon (Håkonsson & Carroll, 2016).

The researcher examines risk as the one naturalistic environment element (Chan, et al., 2008). Review and job satisfaction and motivation taxonomies for risk element involved word and phrase frequencies from perceptions and experiences of interdependent leaders to determine significances and a model analysis in responses to questions. Development, as a matter of self-efficacy promotes new method improvement (Demir, 2020). A two-model analysis is a type of new method for case study amelioration.

Research Question

There are two research questions. 1) What are the perceptions and experiences of U.S. interdependent UEFN and EN leaders and risk concerning minimizing decision stifling? 2) How does U.S. UEFN and EN leader interdependence mitigate decisions for 2nd and 3rd World countries concerning the ex post facto phenomenon?

Problem

There is a lack of recognition for the interdependence of UEFNs and ENs in the U.S. needed to improve decision-making (Håkonsson & Carroll, 2016). Specifically, risk is a type of culture that requires greater attention for the interdependence of the two parties and aspects of ex post facto lacking retroactivity (Raphael, 2020). A one world mentality was observed when examining categories further funneled to taxonomies for UEFNs and ENs, when lacking interdependent qualities, that causes decision stifling.

Purpose

The purpose of the case study was to understand the reasons why the U.S. interdependence of two parties is misunderstood when examining risk element. The case study unveils misunderstanding interdependencies of UEFNs and ENs through rearing foreign nationals and human resources; retention categories impacting a one world mentality. Review and job satisfaction and motivation were examined for retroactive aspects of temporary dignitaries crossing borders at the beginning and expiration of a term and UEFN and EN interdependence improvements stabilizing one world decisions.

Method

The method of this study is qualitative. The design is a case study (Yin, 2015). Data sources in the case included respondent responses to two sets of questions validated by a field
test (Yin, 2017). Risk categories further funneled to taxonomies for the case study protocol to link the questions and protocol topics. Protocol topics compared UEFN’s to EN’s responses through vertical circle list and ascending picture accent process models for the case.

**Data Collection**

The primary means of data collection was through face-to-face interviews with two sets of questions. Interviews were performed for UEFNs and ENs using two recorders, an MP3 and a Samsung Android telecommunication device. UEFNs interviews lasted 30 minutes and ENs interviews lasted 20 minutes (Håkonsson & Carroll, 2016; Karadağ, 2015). Data was collected and asked by researcher with 10 questions, 5 each. In the case study, data collection referred to outcomes of model analysis for interdependent leaders living and working together in the U.S. at the same time.

**Data Analysis**

**Results measures.** A two-model analysis was created from transcribed interview respondent responses using a pattern matching technique, aligning to a category. The latter involved a word frequency system that was further funneled to a taxonomy. A frequency was calculated every time a question’s response hit a category. Frequencies were determined with a synonymous words and phrases in a line compared to the total number of lines system. Frequencies in a line were added and then compared to the total number of lines in first fraction form and then were converted to percentages. The significant categories for the case included rearing foreign nationals and human resources; retention. The significant categories were then funneled further to the taxonomies of review and job satisfaction and motivation.

NCapture in Microsoft software was usable to transcribe recorded interviews from U.S. UEFNs and ENs (Merriam & Grenier, 2019). NVivo12 ® software technology was used to obtain, code and analyze results to create findings and conclusions (Yin, 2015). Findings and conclusions created the two models for analysis (see Figures 1 & 2).

**Findings.** There are two findings for the case study. The first finding in the vertical circle list model in Figure 1 shows how risk impacts one world by UEFNs and ENs interdependence to alleviate decision stifling (see Figure 1).
The two categories of rearing foreign nationals for UEFNs and human resources; retention for ENs were usable with highest significances. The finding was risk involving the interdependence of the two UEFN and EN parties for decision mediation. UEFNs at 90% was the highest percentage for rearing foreign nationals when asked questions. ENs at 62% was the highest percentage for human resource retention when asked questions. Although the UEFNs at 90% is higher than the ENs at 62%, hence the temporary U.S. positions assumably rely on assistance of the permanent, but yield opposing results. Decisions without the temporary position leader’s influence is therefore stifled. Decision stifling is alleviated through recognizing the importance of U.S. 2nd and 3rd World leaders with temporary posts, at 90%, and the lesser significance of what leaders with permanent posts, at 62%, and what they had to say, promoting interdependence.

The second finding is the ascending picture accent process model, thus ex post facto impacts one world decisions. UEFNs and ENs word frequency determinations compare salient review and job satisfaction and motivation taxonomies through risk and double standards for temporary dignitary assignment (see Figure 2).
The League of Nations picture depicts the foundation of naturalistic environment emphasizing EN highest averages, and the arrow pointing up to the flag globe symbolizing the U.S. interdependence of two parties (see Figure 2). The ascending picture accent process model demonstrates that the naturalistic environment elements reveals risk as the highest average for ENs at 92%. Further, the ascending picture accent process model demonstrates that the interdependence of UEFNs and ENs promotes one world thinking. One world decision ascends on a temporary/permanent, home/host, dignitary/business U.S. assignment interdependence, and proceeds with greater harmony and balance.

Conclusions

The vertical circle list model in Figure 1 differentiates from the ascending picture accent process model in Figure 2 in the case study analysis. The latter models differentiate through outcomes and potentials of the case study, risk of ENs as foundational in the process, for the interdependency of the UEFNs and ENs. Figure 1 denotes an unexpected consequence. The unexpected consequence, when the researcher examines risk element, is the mutual dependency of U.S. ENs as permanent positions of UEFNs as temporary dignitary assignments, but that experience the ex post facto phenomenon. Researcher defends that common knowledge in the
U.S. would only help 2nd and 3rd World countries as temporary U.S. assignments for one world decisions. Figure 2 synthesizes two party interdependence through risk, the propensity to take chance, as highest significance of naturalistic environment, accentuating the process of interdependence of two parties.

**Outcomes**

There are three outcomes for the purpose of the case study. The reasons why dignitary leaders do not understand interdependency between two parties and process for retroactivity has not been examined for naturalistic environment elements, namely risk (Chan et al., 2008). Risk, compared to motor and process and naturalistic action, shows (a) word frequency tally from interview transcription applicability to all industries and countries, (b) a two-model analysis for interdependence and process, and (c) the ex post facto aspect lacking recognition for temporary dignitary compared to permanent U.S. assignments requiring interdependence. The first outcome from word frequency tally transcripts was determined through synonymous words and phrases in lines compared to the total number of lines, as percentages. Second outcome is the two-model analysis as the vertical circle list for handling and alleviating decision stifling and the ascending picture accent process model for risk element. Third outcome is the ex post facto phenomenon where researcher evaluates invulnerability that is lacking for temporary U.S. assignments. Retroactivity of UEFN’s dignitary activity back in his or her home country is critical before the end of term, before going back to home domicile. Abuse and exploitation impact one world mentality by shielding a dignitary from liability for wrongful actions before acquiring a border crossing position.

**Potentials**

Potentials of the review and job satisfaction and motivation taxonomies were developed from the most significant statistics for risk element. The latter taxonomies nurture the case study’s potentials in three parts. Potentials of one world decisions are through (a) learning how temporary U.S. dignitary handle double standards and lack of retroactivity (b) the recognition of dignitary invulnerability promoting a double standard erroneously and (c) the need for temporary U.S. dignitary assignments, the UEFNs from 2nd and 3rd World countries, to recognize vice-versa consequence of helping the ENs.

First potential is the vertical circle list and the ascending picture accent process model systems are usable to analyze the risk element for significant categories of rearing foreign
nationals and human resource; retention. For example, U. S. interdependent UEFNs and ENs, who take chance are observable in government agencies like U.S. embassies and corporations. UEFNs in government positions are distinguished by prospective assessments, for rearing foreign nationals, to determine appropriate candidates for transitioning domiciles to work. The ex post facto effect applies to the working transitioning domiciles to the U.S. by examining background checks that dignitaries are not evading suit or prosecution by accepting a foreign post (Raphael, 2020). UEFNs and ENs in government and corporation positions, were examined through risk and human resource retention, hence attrition rate. Since dignitary attrition is extremely expensive and difficult to replace, a scrutinized appointee needs to be secured and not threaten quitting the post assignment.

Second potential is how one world laws and vulnerability need not just local perspectives to be correct. Wording of one world law is critical for repairing negative aspects of ex post facto. Negative aspects for dignitary vulnerability, needs to include reliability and clean records to make stable decisions.

Third potential is UEFNs global justice that is achievable because of retroactive implementation and execution through the two-model analysis for the case study. Vertical circle list and ascending picture accent process models would be usable in one world law creation. Global justice would be served in varying industries with long supply chains and that outsource, and all countries coming to the U.S. for temporary work. Rearing foreign nationals and human resources; retention for risk element developed the taxonomies of review and job satisfaction and motivation, and apply to all interdependent leaders and league of nations.
References


Managing the Mind, Body, and Soul—Closing the Gap Between Managers and Young Employees with Anxiety Disorders

Dr. Debra Hunter
Troy University

Dr. Charles Chekwa
Troy University

Abstract
Younger generational cohorts are entering the workforce with much higher rates of reported mental illnesses than their predecessors. Academic stress, anxiety, and depression are a major cause of concern among college students. The 2019 Center for Collegiate Mental Health reported that anxiety is one of the most common diagnosis of students seeking services at university counseling centers. In many cases, these young individuals have received special accommodations in primary, secondary, and higher educational learning institutions. Classroom accommodations that support flexibility may include additional time to complete assessments, small group classes, permission to record lectures and the ability to use technology in a learning environment. However, mandated educational accommodations for disabilities in Section 504 of the Rehabilitation Act do not transfer into the workplace. The workplace environment operates under different standards with less flexibility. In fact, educational institutions may be marginally preparing students with accommodations to operate in the real world. Companies required to adhere to Title I of the American Disabilities must only provide “reasonable accommodations” for documented disabilities and the interpretation of what is reasonable is determined by management. Yet, many anxiety related disabilities are undisclosed to management. Employees fear stigmatization and being shunned for sharing their conditions. In some cases, the anxiety could affect workplace productivity and possibly pre-mature termination if misunderstood. The lack of communication between employees and managers creates a “gap” leading to possible unemployment or discrimination suits. In fact, EEOC discrimination charges filed on behalf of employees who suffer from anxiety increased from 65 in 2006 to 371 in 2019. This increase leads one to believe that managers are not properly addressing employees’ mental health. Proper
training and development opportunities in mental health related issues may curtail additional lawsuits imposed on organizations. To provide an inclusive workplace environment, managers must be proactive in assessing the holistic needs of employees including support for mental and emotional disabilities. This research contends that Generation Z will have higher expectations than previous cohorts for workplace accommodations to support anxiety, stress, autism, and other mental challenges. These expectations have implications for universities and management training programs designed to embrace the needs of individuals with mental health related issues. Greater attention is warranted on closing the existing gap between management and employees with anxiety related disorders.
Improving Emotional Intelligence through Coaching

Valerie Pape
Bradley University

Abstract
An MBA/MS Accounting interpersonal skills course is designed with specific behavioural learning objectives in emotional intelligence. The course elements include sequenced individual reflections and one-on-one coaching with the instructor. The course learning objectives go beyond understanding the concept in the assigned reading to the application of the knowledge and skill in students’ current and future interpersonal interactions. The course delivery is hybrid, so technology tactics that influence course design and learning assessment are presented. Techniques in helping students improve their emotional intelligence and examples of individual reflection and coaching preparation exercises are shared.

Keywords: management education, leadership, coaching, emotional intelligence

The purpose of the presentation is to discuss elements of an MBA/MS Accounting interpersonal skills course with specific behavioural learning objectives in emotional intelligence. Those elements include sequenced individual reflections and one-on-one coaching with the instructor. The discussion includes successful techniques in helping students improve their emotional intelligence. The course learning objectives go beyond understanding the concept in the assigned reading to the application of the knowledge and skill in students’ current and future interpersonal interactions. The course delivery is hybrid, so technology tactics that influence course design and learning assessment are provided. Examples of individual reflection and coaching preparation exercises help link the concepts of emotional intelligence and coaching.

Interpersonal Skills and Business Education
Business school stakeholders have stated the importance of strong interpersonal skills for future career success (AACSB, 2017). At the same time, “softer skills of management (interpersonal skills, communication, leadership) are hard to learn through formal education” (Khurana and Nohria, 2008, p. 73). Business curriculums typically require management and leadership courses so the ongoing challenge is how to design a course that address that tension.

**Emotional Intelligence**
The term “interpersonal skills” is broad and appears in many job listings and course catalogs. Emotional intelligence (EI) is a useful framework for describing the types of skills included when interpersonal skills are referenced. There are many frameworks for EI and the various instruments developed to assess it. A straight-forward one is (Goleman, 2006; Goleman and Boyatzis, 2017). In Goleman’s model, there are four domains (i.e., self-awareness, self-management, social awareness, and relationship management.) That first domain is a priority in improving the other domains and it can be a challenge to address in a traditional classroom setting.

**Coaching**
Coaching is a commonly-used word and a definition helps differentiate it from traditional classroom teaching. Typically teaching shares new knowledge and skills that add to students’ existing knowledge and skills with the assumption that the teacher knows more than the student. Coaching helps students change in the way they want to go and helps increase students’ awareness with the goal of encouraging the students to choose to change perceptions and behavior. The assumption is that the coach is the not expert and does not know all the answers (International Coaching Community).

Students are usually preparing to work in organizations after the completion of their programs. Business and other organizations use coaching to assist with leadership development efforts and facilitate the processing of 360-degree feedback (Chamorro-Premuzic, 2017). Can coaching
within the business school curriculum enhance the students’ self-awareness and EI? Furthermore, can it prepare them to take advantage of this leadership development approach within their current or future employment settings?

One Approach: Reflective Learning and One-on-One Coaching

A mid-size university requires that master’s level students (MBA and MS Accounting) take course work in leadership and organizational behavior. The core course in this area includes student prework in the form of online assessments in personality and EI. In addition, students participate in a 360-degree assessment with feedback in categories supporting emerging leadership skills. Consistent with best practices in administering these assessments, instruction is provided on how to analyze and use the assessment results. One-on-one coaching is offered to allow students to have a personal and private conversation about individual results. Previously, this coaching was provided as an optional course activity. Students were encouraged but not required to attend a coaching session and the assumption was that it was a benefit to the students and that participation would be high. Participation in coaching was not 100% and some students expressed concern that they did not know what was expected of them during the coaching session. Others treated it as optional in the spirit of optional reading or an optional lecture.

The course was redesigned to make coaching part of the course expectations (and grading) and to make it flow from specific reflection (self-awareness) assignments sequenced throughout the course. The course is delivered in a hybrid format, so the learning management system assisted the administration and grading of these self-reflections throughout the sequence. A number of self-reflections were developed with attention to linking the assigned practitioner articles or leadership theory excerpts to students’ opinions and experiences. These multiple self-reflection exercises encouraged the self-awareness practices noted as a critical element of EI. In
particular, the self-reflection before the coaching session prepared students to be active participants including shaping personal coaching agendas and outcomes.

References


Let’s Hang Out and Talk About Work:  
A Conceptual Framework Exploring the Dark Side of Workplace Friendship  
Ben Zugay  
University of Wisconsin-Whitewater

Abstract
This conceptual paper investigates two growing areas of interest: the “dark side” of workplace friendships and the integration of work and non-work life. Specifically, relationships between constructs are proposed applying the conservation of resources theory and the border/boundary theories. With an increased understanding of how workplace friendships can produce negative outcomes, implications for managers are imperative. Practitioners can identify strategies to minimize the negative outcomes of workplace friendships, and thus help employees more holistically by improving overall employee well-being.

Keywords: Workplace Friendship, Work-Life Balance, Conservation of Resource (COR) Theory, Border/Boundary Theories
INTRODUCTION

When racist symbols appear on university campuses, college administrators often demonstrate a level of panic that outpaces what occurs when they are faced with a natural disaster or armed attack. Recent university-based racial incidents emphasize the need to explore how racially-related aggressions and the associated triggers appear to evoke leadership consternation and communication responses that may be perceived as more harmful to the various stakeholders than the originating event.

History shows that stakeholders seek “meaningful engagement with university leaders” and “reasonable alternatives” for addressing issues on campus (Stripling, 2018), and when they feel these need go unmet, they respond with public protest, social media campaigns or calls for deans or presidents to step down. The result is potential long-term consequences for the stakeholders, administrators and institution involved (Trachtenberg, 2018). In addition, research in sensemaking and stakeholder theories identify the process and considerations made by individuals in authority during a crisis as they aim to communicate details of the incident with the parties involved or affected. Fueled by the access to technology and use of social media among stakeholders, administrators may rush to comment to protect the individuals involved, to “save face” and avoid widespread negative publicity or hits to their institutional reputation, to demonstrate they are “handling” the situation, or some combination of these alternatives. The ability to be self-reflective, and to consider all the stakeholders affected, when addressing the
issue may be, in a sense, easier when the genesis of the incident (i.e., the perceived threat) comes from a source outside the institution as opposed to when the “threat” comes from “inside the house.” In these cases, the communication process often reflects a reactive approach that may not take into consideration both the logical and emotional responses needed to demonstrate that affected parties are being acknowledged, respected, and included in decision making and subsequent communication, and that meaningful steps are being taken to resolve the issue. Without this consideration of potential effect on all message recipients, ongoing harm and hurt can remain well past when the institution deems the issue to be resolved.

In this case study, we combine the concepts of sensemaking and rhetorical arena theory to consider the factors that may underpin universities’ crisis management reactions by comparing two separate sets of communications around racialized events on-campus at a private, religious, “value-driven” institution. We explore how sensemaking is complicated by crisis, and how consideration of the rhetorical arena taps into our universe of obligation and reflects our awareness of racial microaggressions, issues of individual identity, and organizational history around addressing similar incidents. This case study contributes to both research and practice by outlining components of more appropriate communication-based plans of action that more deeply consider the full arena of message recipients and involve key stakeholders in communication creation for future incidents. Toward those ends, the case study of the so-called “noose” incident is divided into two major segments. First, the paper reviews the literature associated with sensemaking, crisis communication, and rhetorical arena theory, including micro-level issues connected to the incident involving micro-aggressions, individual identity, and institutional communication related to racial incidents on university campuses. Second, in its analysis section, the case study compares the response in the “noose” incident to a separate racialized event and set of communications on the same college campus. Our intent is to identify best practice communications-based approaches that may better align race-related crisis response theory and practice to the needs and concerns of stakeholders throughout the rhetorical arena, regardless of whether the genesis of the incident is internal or external. Our hopes is to establish
“ideal” institutional leadership communication responses to those evoked in the wake of this particular on-campus racial crisis.

SCHOLARLY IMPACT OF MANAGEMENT THEORY: THE ROLES OF EXPLANATORY VALUE AND SCIENTIFIC VALIDITY

JAUME FRANQUESA
Ohio Northern University
WILLIAM ACAR
Kent State University
JINO O. MWAKA
University of the Sacred Heart

ABSTRACT
This paper advances a comprehensive model of evaluatory dimensions of management theories, and of the relationships between these dimensions and the theory’s eventual prominence in the management field. We test our model with data from expert raters who were sampled and screened from within the membership of pertinent divisions of the Academy of Management.

KEYWORDS: Theory building, theory evaluation, management theory, theoretical contribution, scholarly impact, philosophy of science.

Introduction

There has been significant interest among management scholars in what makes for a well-constructed and valid theory and in criteria for the evaluation of theories (Bacharach, 1989; Miller & Tsang, 2010; Shapira, 2011; Arend, Sarooghi, & Burkemper, 2015). Likewise, there has also been attention placed on what makes a theoretical contribution interesting and/or useful to scholars and practitioners (Davis, 1971; Miner, 1984, 2003; Astley & Zammuto, 1992; McKinley et al., 1999; Bartunek, Rynes, & Ireland, 2006). The two sets of proposed predictors
are only partially overlapping. This, therefore, raises the question of whether both the scientific rigor/accuracy as well as the interest/usefulness of management theories are equally appreciated by those in the field or if one type of consideration prevails over the other: Besides considerations like the reputation of authors and of the journal of publication (Cole & Cole, 1967; Judge et al., 2007), which characteristics of a theoretical contribution are most strongly associated with its eventual prominence among management scholars? What is the best advice that we can offer future management theory writers to maximize the scholarly impact of their work?

This paper seeks to shed light on these questions by advancing and testing a model of the predictors of scholars’ perceived importance of a theoretical contribution, within the organization theory and strategic management fields. First, we propose that the overall interest and usefulness of a theory to management scholars will be best captured by a second-order construct which we term the perceived “knowledge meaningfulness” of the theory, and which results from the complementarity among three component subdimensions derived from the prior literature on theory building and evaluation: (1) the novelty or originality of the theoretical perspective and of its precepts and propositions; (2) the extendibility of its logic to a broad range of phenomena and research questions; and (3) the relevance for practice of the knowledge derived from the theory, in the sense of informing important analysis and decisions by managers. We then hypothesize that both the meaningfulness of a theory as well as its scientific rigor, as captured by its internal consistency (i.e., the extent to which it is based as a well-constructed logical system) and by the empirical falsifiability of its predictions, will be positively related to the perceived importance of the theory among scholars in the field. We test our model with data collected from members of pertinent divisions of the Academy of Management who report enough familiarity with a particular theoretical exemplar to be able to evaluate it.

**Background and Contribution**

There have been three prior studies of the relationship between aspects of a theoretical contribution and its subsequent scholarly impact. Miner (1984) analyzed 32 management
theories and explored if either (i) **scientific validity** (or “goodness” of the theory, as measured by the extent to which empirical tests had been carried out and had generally been supportive), and/or (ii) **practical usefulness** (extent to which the theory had contributed useful applications to management practice) were related to a theory’s scholarly prominence or, in his words, **importance** (measured as the theory’s frequency of nomination by knowledgeable scholars). Yet, he found little evidence of any relationship among these variables.

In a re-test of the same relationships 20 years later, Miner (2003) analyzed a larger group of 73 theories and found a significant correlation between the **scientific validity** of a theory and its importance rating, while usefulness in practice continued to be not significantly related to importance. The author concluded that the change in results between his 1984 and 2003 studies indicate that the field had evolved into a “more mature science”; albeit one that might “have become too academic” at the expense of disregarding “the matter of practical application” (p.262).

Finally, Colquitt and Zapata-Phelan (2007) investigated the “theoretical contribution” made by empirical articles in management, and found that both their level of **theory testing** (i.e., the extent to which predictions/hypotheses in the empirical article are grounded on something closest to a “true theory”) and of **theory building** (i.e., the extent to which the empirical article adds to existing theory by proposing a new mediator or moderator, a new relationship, or even a new construct) were positively associated with scholarly impact, as measured by citation rates. Interestingly, they also found that articles in the mid-range of both variables achieved as much prominence as those with the highest degrees of both. From this, they concluded that a balance between novelty, on the one hand, and continuity with an existing theoretical formulation (regardless if it is a vague framework, a model, or a “true theory”) on the other, helps bring the most attention to an article among management scholars.

The present study builds on the arguments and findings from the above studies, as well as from copious prior conceptual work on theory building and theory evaluation in management, in order to further explore predictors of the scholarly importance of a theoretical treatise. We make several contributions to this prior literature: First and foremost, we propose a parsimonious and
yet more comprehensive model of the key aspects that drive a theory’s adoption, allegiance, and eventual salience within the management academic community. Second, our model also introduces a new second-order evaluatory construct which we term the *knowledge meaningfulness* of a theoretical exposition to management scholars. Finally, by contrast to prior studies which relied on single-item measures derived from largely subjective summary coding schemes¹, we advance and validate a survey instrument with multi-item scales that operationalize key theory evaluation constructs of interest.

**Predictors of Theory Importance**

Based on prior research and discussion/commentary on theory building and evaluation, we proposition that the importance of a theoretical contribution among management scholars will be driven by its: (1) *novelty* (Colquitt and Zapata-Phelan, 2007; Corley and Gioia, 2011; McKinley et al., 1999), (2) *extendibility* and potential to generate further research (McKinley et al., 1999; Whetten, 1989), and (3) *relevance for practice* (Corley and Gioia, 2011; Miner, 1984, 2003); as well as by its scientific validity (Miner, 1984, 2003; Colquitt & Zapata-Phelan, 2007) in the sense of meeting two basic criteria for a theory or model: (4) *internal consistency* (Campbell, 1953; Shapira 2011), and (5) *empirical falsifiability* (Bacharach, 1989; Popper, 1959). Moreover, we posit that *novelty, extendibility and relevance for practice* interplay with one another in complex ways, so that their impact on the perceived value of a theory’s insights is best captured as a unifying dimension: We propose a new construct which we term the *knowledge meaningfulness* of a theory (or of a model, framework, or other theoretical contribution) as capturing the *a priori* informational or explanatory value that results from its novelty, extendibility and perceived relevance for practice. Our hypothesized model is summarized in Figure 1.

---

¹ *Scientific validity* and *practical usefulness* constructs in Miner studies (1984, 2003), and *theory building* and *testing* in Colquitt and Zapata-Phelan (2007), were subjectively assessed by the author him/herself (or by one of the authors).
Novelty

Building on prior work, we define novelty of a theory or theoretical exposition as the extent to which it challenges scholars’ extant views and thinking on organizational phenomena by either modifying or extending current theories, or by offering an entirely new point of view (Barney, 2018; Bettis et al., 2014; Conlon, 2002; Davis, 1971; McKinley et al., 1999; Whetten, 1989). Thus, our construct encompasses two possible subdimensions of originality of a theoretical contribution, which Corley and Gioia (2011) termed “incremental” (i.e., progressive advances in an established course of understanding) and “revelatory” (i.e., surprising new perspectives or new directions in understanding). Novel aspects of a theory may include, among
others, modifying relationships advocated in current theories by adding a new mediator or moderator, redefining or expanding existing constructs so that they apply to a new domain, altering current assumptions and/or proposing a new rationale to understand known phenomena and relationships, or introducing new concepts or constructs and proposing previously unexamined relationships (Bartunek et al., 2006; Colquitt & Zapatta-Phelan, 2007; Davis, 1971; McKinley at al., 1999).

We expect novelty to be a driver of a theory’s attractiveness and, thus, of its eventual prominence among scholars. Novelty helps the theory to get noticed, by separating its insights from the multitude of frameworks, constructs, and variables that compete for a scholar’s attention (DiMaggio, 1995; McKinley et al., 1999; Colquitt & Zapatta-Phelan, 2007). Consistent with this, a survey of editorial board members of the Academy of Management Journal revealed that the most frequently cited reasons why an article was found interesting included, among others, whether it created new theory and whether it challenged established theory and created an “aha” moment (Bartunek et al, 2006). As a result of its effects on salience, novelty of a theory will contribute to the eventual impact of the ideas presented within it (Whetten, 1989).

Extendibility

We are coining the term extendibility of a theory to refer to the extent to which it provides opportunities for and stimulates further theoretical development as well broad application in research. A theory, as a framework for understanding some domain of organizational phenomena, should be open to further conceptual development, thus facilitating the growth of knowledge. Indeed, a good theoretical contribution should trigger such subsequent development, as well as energize the exploration of new questions in a way that alters research practice (Whetten, 1989; McKinley et al, 1999).

One element contributing to extendibility is a broad potential scope, defined as the range of phenomena that the theory and its constructs could be applied to (Bacharach, 1989; McKinley et al, 1999). For example, a theory might be extendible from the micro- to the macro-level, or vice versa. A related contributor of extendibility is construct ambiguity, defined as vagueness in
the meaning of a theory’s constructs, so as to increase their generalizability and robustness as broad conceptualizations of phenomena, which expands the opportunities for application (Astley & Zammuto, 1992; McKinley et al., 1999). Vagueness makes the theory less falsifiable, but it increases its ideational scope and stimulates insights into a broader range of phenomena and possible relationships (Astley & Zammuto, 1992; McKinley et al., 1999; Suddaby, 2010). Construct ambiguity also increases the variety of operationalizations and measures that may fit within its frame of reference and, thus, the number of empirical studies that can be presented as tests of the theory (Astley & Zammuto, 1992; McKinley et al., 1999).

Based on the above discussion, extendibility increases the utilitarian value of a theory to scholars, by facilitating and promoting a stream of research work and publication based on it. Indeed, we believe extendibility to be the key driver of the perceived research utility of a theory. Thus, we expect extendibility to increase the scholarly appeal of a theory, leading to greater use and allegiance to it, and ultimately to its heightened impact on the field in the form of a substantial cumulative literature (Astley & Zammuto, 1992; McKinley et al., 1999; Weick, 1995).

**Relevance for Practice**

As a professional field, there is a long tradition that management theory should have implications for, and effects on, practice (Corley & Gioia, 2011; Hambrick, 2007; Miner, 1984, 2003; Mintzberg, 2005; Sandberg & Tsoukas, 2011). Generating knowledge that is usable “in the real world” and addressing a subject that is timely and relevant to practitioners are seen as important factors that contribute to the quality of our theorizing (e.g., Whetten, 1989; Kilduff, 2006; Ployhart & Bartunek, 2019) as well as make a research contribution more interesting to scholars (e.g., Bartunek et al., 2006). As such, it is often a requirement for publication in top management journals that a theoretical contribution should be “relevant to practice” (e.g., Rynes, 2005).

Drawing on Astley & Zammuto (1992), we define a-priory relevance for practice of a theoretical contribution as its potential to influence managerial (or other practitioners’) action either through (i) feasible tools and techniques that may derive from it and which will be directly
applicable in practice; (ii) concepts, ideas, and language that may increase practitioners’ ability to frame, analyze, and solve business problems; as well as to legitimate chosen courses of action; and/or (iii) the timeliness and importance for practitioners of the phenomena that the theory explains (Astley & Zammuto, 1992; Corley & Gioia, 2011; Mintzberg, 2005; Ployhart & Bartunek, 2019).

Based on our synthesis of the literature, we expect that the relevance for practice of a theoretical contribution will increase its appeal among scholars, thus leading to its greater adoption and eventual impact on the field (Miner, 1984; 2003).

**Overall Explanatory Value: The Concept of Knowledge Meaningfulness of a Theory/Model**

Albeit distinct traits, we posit that the novelty, extendibility, and relevance for practice of a theoretical contribution are connected elements that mutually reinforce each other; and that, as such, they will be best conceptualized as different manifestations of a tridimensional higher-order construct. For example, ceteris paribus, greater novelty enhances the opportunities for subsequent scholarship into new and unexplored questions and, thus, extendibility. Simultaneously, extendibility promotes application of the current rationale to new phenomena and, thus, breads further novelty. Similarly, practical relevance enhances extendibility, and vice-versa: Greater practical relevance facilitates direct observation of the relevant phenomena as well as of manifestations of the theoretical knowledge “in use”, which may provide new ideas/insights to modify/extend the theory. At the same time, greater extendibility magnifies the practical relevance of the theory as it broadens the scope of application to a greater number of phenomena, contexts, or problems of consequence to practitioners. In short, we expect complex interdependence among these dimensions of a theoretical contribution, so that their discrete impact on the value of the contribution may be difficult to untangle. Given this, we argue that the perceived value or appeal to scholars from a theory’s novelty, extendibility and relevance for practice will be best captured as a comprehensive, unified dimension.

We propose the notion of meaningfulness of a theory’s knowledge content as the overarching informational or explanatory value perceived by management scholars based on a
theory’s combination of novelty, extendibility, and relevance for practice. Moreover, we propose that this construct can be best operationalized as second-order factor with the above constructs as its three reflective lower-order indicators. The following testable hypotheses derive from the above arguments:

**Hypothesis 1:** Perceived novelty, extendibility and relevance for practice will be distinct yet interrelated constructs whose covariance will be effectively captured by a reflectively measured second-order factor.

**Hypothesis 2:** This tridimensional second-order construct, which we will refer to as a priori knowledge meaningfulness of a theoretical treatise, will be positively related to the treatise’s eventual perceived importance among management scholars.

**Scientific Rigor**

Besides the meaningfulness of its substance and insights, the scientific rigor/validity of a theory/model may also be related to its eventual prominence in the management field (e.g., Miner, 1984, 2003). Scientific rigor is part of the theory building/assessment criteria proposed by prior management authors (Arend et al., 2015; Bacharach, 1989; Dubin, 1969; Shapira, 2011) as well as by editors of leading publications (Bartunek et al., 2006; Whetten, 1989).

Drawing from philosophy of science, two aspects in particular have been emphasized in the prior management literature as necessary requirements for sound theoretical construction: internal consistency and empirical falsifiability. We define internal consistency as the extent to which the theoretical contribution is a well-constructed deductive system, resulting in coherent explanation and concluded insights. Namely, starting with clear construct definitions as well as explicit statement of assumptions or axioms and, based on these, solid logical derivations follow which lead to specific predictions (Campbell, 1953; Ackoff, 1962; Dubin, 1969; Shapira, 2011).
Internal consistency, therefore, implies that there are no tautologies or near-tautologies in the arguments (Ackoff, 1962; Arend et al., 2015; Bacharach, 1989; Priem & Butler, 2001) and that the logic is otherwise reliable (Campbell, 1953; Dubin, 1969; Shapira, 2011; Whetten 1989).

In turn, we define empirical falsifiability of a theoretical contribution as the extent to which predictions formulated from it can be confirmed or refuted by empirical evidence (Arend et al., 2015; Bacharach, 1989; Miller and Tsang, 2010; Shapira, 2011). Empirical falsifiability is related to the ability to operationalize and measure constructs accurately and reliably; to the precision of predictions regarding the nature of the relationships among them as well as the specifications of boundary conditions under which such relationships should hold; and to the ability to obtain pertinent data, including enough variation in the object of analysis (Astley & Zammuto, 1992; Bacharach, 1989; Miller & Tsang, 2010).

Since internal consistency and empirical falsifiability have been argued to be important aspects of a “good” theory, we expect that these traits will also increase the attractiveness of a theory to scholars and, thus, the allegiance to it, leading to eventual impact. Hence, our final two hypotheses:

Hypothesis 3: The internal consistency of a theoretical treatise will be positively related to its eventual perceived importance among management scholars.

Hypothesis 4: The empirical falsifiability of a theoretical treatise will be positively related to its eventual perceived importance among management scholars.

Methods

Participants, Procedures and Study Sample

Participants in our study were academic members of the Business Policy and Strategy (BPS), Organization and Management Theory (OMT), and Entrepreneurship (ENT) divisions of the Academy of Management who were affiliated to institutions within the United States. Potential respondents were contacted by email and invited to participate in an on-line survey that entailed a detailed assessment of up to two theoretical exemplars, from a short-list of eight well-
known works in strategy and organization theory. To promote response, the articles offered for assessment were seminal pieces within four of the most prominent theoretical streams within strategic management and organization theory. At the same time, to provide variance in the variables of interest, they represented different theoretical approaches and/or different levels of influence within their respective literatures. The works offered as assessment choices were: Jensen and Meckling (1976) and Eisenhardt (1989a), for agency theory; DiMaggio and Powell (1983) and Greenwood and Hinings (1996), for institutional theory; Barney (1991) and Amit and Schoemaker (1993), for the resource-based view; and Williamson (1975) and Ouchi, (1980), for transaction-cost economics.

At the start of the survey, participants were asked to select the theoretical work that they were most knowledgeable to assess². After completing the assessment instrument for the chosen theoretical exemplar, respondents could opt to either end the survey or select a second article from the list and complete a second assessment. To ensure that respondents would only rate theoretical exemplars they were most familiar with, the survey closed after the second assessment round.

Measurement

**Scholarly importance.** Following Miner (2003), our dependent variable was measured using a single-item indicator of the perceived importance of the theoretical exemplar. Respondents were asked to “rate the importance of the theory to the field of management”, and their responses were recorded on a seven-point scale ranging from “not at all important” to “very important”. The validity of this measure was explored by contrasting importance ratings with citation data.

**Theory evaluation constructs.** Since novelty, extendibility, relevance for practice, internal consistency, and empirical falsifiability have not been operationalized via survey instruments before, we developed a theory evaluation scale to measure our independent

² Respondents who reported lack of sufficient familiarity with any of the listed references were not allowed to proceed and the survey would end for them.
variables. Design of this instrument was based on our review of the theory building/evaluation literature in management, and guided by the conceptual definitions offered earlier in this paper. It also underwent two separate phases of refinement: In the first phase, different versions of our proposed theory evaluation scale underwent sequential review by two separate panels of judges who reviewed for content validity and clarity. Items were dropped, added, or amended based on the feedback received, resulting in a preliminary 30-item overall theory evaluation scale that was used in our survey. The survey instrument is reproduced in the Appendix.

The second phase of scrutiny consisted of validation and refinement of the factor structure of the theory evaluation scale, through exploratory factor analysis (EFA). Scores on the 30-item battery from the study sample were factor analyzed using principal components extraction and oblique (promax) rotation. Following rotation, items were eliminated which either had cross-loadings or failed to load onto any factor.

**Control variables.** To minimize potential omitted variable problems when testing for hypothesized relationships, we controlled for theory age, as well as for possible rater biases due to years of experience, closeness to the theory (based on the rater’s prior publications and presentations), and intensity of research and consulting activities, as all of these might affect importance ratings.

**Analyses**

We used covariance-based structural equation modeling (SEM) with LISREL software. Following recommended procedures (e.g., Anderson and Gerbin, 1988), we employed a two-step analytical strategy whereby, prior to fitting the structural model, we examined and determined the best measurement model through confirmatory factor analysis (CFA). In our case, this step also served to test our first hypothesis.

We compared five models to identify the measurement structure that best fits the data. Model 1 was a first-order unitary factor model, with all items loading onto a single latent variable. Model 2 was a first-order model with the five orthogonal factors, and with the loading structure as derived from the EFA. The comparison between these two models would serve to
confirm the multi-dimensionality of our theory evaluation instrument. Model 3 was the correlated (oblique) five factor model. The comparison between Model 2 and Model 3 therefore would serve to confirm that there is significant covariance between the first order factors which, as hypothesized, might then best be captured through a second-order factor. Model 4 was the hypothesized measurement model with one second-order factor (meaningfulness) and five first-order factors, where only three of them (novelty, extendibility, and relevance for practice) loaded on the second-order factor. Finally, Model 5 was an alternative structure with one general second-order factor with all five first-order factors loading onto it\(^3\). The comparison among the last three models would serve as the test of Hypothesis 1. Once the best measurement model was identified, SEM was performed to estimate the fit of the overall hypothesized model to the data. Beyond overall fit, path coefficients for proposed relationships were used to test the remaining hypotheses.

**Conclusion**

This article makes several important contributions to the sparse empirical literature on theory evaluation dimensions, and on how the latter relate to the eventual perceived importance of theoretical works in the management field. In particular, we propose and test a comprehensive and yet parsimonious model of a theory’s attributes that would drive its eventual prominence. This model and the results from its empirical contrast will pave the way for subsequent conceptual and empirical research on drivers of scholarly impact of theoretical contributions in the field of management. A fuller understanding of the etiology of impact should be a welcome and important pursuit.

**REFERENCES**


---

\(^3\) Note that this measurement model is equivalent to (i.e., will produce the exam same fit as) alternative models with any four factors loading on the second-order factor, plus a covariance between the exogenous factor and the second-order factor (e.g., Marsh and Hocevar, 1985).


**APPENDIX**

**Survey Instrument (30 items)**

After choosing a theoretical exemplar that they reported being most familiar with, respondents were given the following instruction:

Please answer the following set of questions with respect to [Author(s) (year): “Title”. *Publication Journal*, volume(issue): page#-page#].

Please indicate the extent to which you agree or disagree to the following statements:
Responses were recorded using the following scale:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strongly Disagree</th>
<th>Moderately Disagree</th>
<th>Slightly disagree</th>
<th>Neither Agree nor Disagree</th>
<th>Slightly agree</th>
<th>Moderately agree</th>
<th>Strongly agree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Cultural Values Held by Cameroon’s Young Generation:

Findings and Implications
Casimir C. Barczyk,
Purdue University Northwest

Charles Rarick
Purdue University Northwest

Gregory Winter
Alcorn State University

Abstract

This study uses Hofstede’s Value Survey Module (VSM 2013) to assess the cultural values of Cameroon’s young adult population. The survey questionnaire is designed to measure six cultural dimensions. The original Hofstede studies did not include an analysis of Cameroon. While the national culture of other African countries has been assessed, there is a dearth of literature on Cameroon’s cultural classification. Fifty individuals enrolled at a major university completed the VSM 2013. Analysis of the data showed that the young adults in Cameroon are low in power distance and strongly collectivistic. They are somewhat feminine in nature and highly accepting of uncertainty. Young people possess a short-term orientation towards time and are restrained in the expressions of impulses and desires. The cultural dimension scores found in Cameroon are compared to Brazil, China, Germany, the USA, and to two regions of Africa. The results show cultural similarities and differences with the comparison countries and regions. Some implications of these results for international business are suggested.
Abstract
The purpose of this paper is to survey the challenges of a large non-for-profit, integrated health care organization in Michigan in the process of implementing diversity and inclusion and to explore what hinders this organization on its journey toward an integration-and-learning perspective (i.e., promoting diversity as valuable resources for learning and growth). The author interviewed nine people of this organization between summer 2019 and March 2020. She also followed up with the study in December 2020 and witnessed some positive changes in the organization during the social movements in the summer of 2020. These are the main obstacles: There is a systematic problem of a lack of a safe space for minorities in this large organization of 30,000 employees. Many people of color cannot see their path of success in the organization. There is a lack of communication and learning among leaders from different departments. There is increasing pressure to cut costs at the expense of welfare of employees, community programs, and health equity. The leaders should fully utilize the opportunities provided by the recent social movements to have more meaningful and productive dialogues among different groups of employees and bridge the caste that divide employees. As more and more truthful conversations between those with and without privilege in the organization occur more and more creative solutions for providing accessible and affordable health care will be made possible. The journey of this health care organization toward a culture with integration-and-learning perspective can inspire other health care organizations to know how to use a diverse, equitable, and inclusive workforce to achieve health equity.

Introduction
A diverse, equitable, and inclusive workforce is crucial to achieve health equity (i.e., health care can be accessible and affordable to people in community) and is an important tool to mitigate racial/ethnic disparities in health and health care in the United States. (LaVest and Pierre, 2014; Loucel, 2012, Tejeda, 2018). The Health Resources and Service Administration (HRSA) advocates that increasing diversity among health care professionals would improve population health outcomes, after reviewing 55 studies written between 1985 and 2005 (HRSA, 2006). The Institute of Medicine (2010) also affirms that a diverse health care workforce contributes to enhanced communication, health care access, patient satisfaction, decreased health disparities, improved problem solving for complex problems, and innovation. Thus, a diverse workforce is “important for reducing health disparities in the population caused by socioeconomic, geographic, and race/ethnicity factors because evidence suggests that minority health professionals are more likely to serve in areas with a high proportion of underrepresented racial and ethnic minority groups” (White, Zangaro, Kapley, and Camacho, 2014). In 2018, more than 800 health care organizations signed the American Hospital Association’s #123forEquity pledge toward eliminating health care disparities. Their public commitment indicates that more and more health care organizations seem to be promoting diversity, equity, and inclusion.

The U.S. health care system can be described as a caste system—“the artificially-constructed and legally-reinforced social hierarchy for assigning worth and determining opportunity for individuals based on race, class, and other factors” (Sivashaker, Couillard, Goldsmith, Walker, and Eappen, 2020). Over decades of research study about diversity in health management, employees of color remained, and continue to remain, underrepresented among managers, executive leaders, and hospital boards. They are overrepresented in low-wage essential jobs such as patient room cleaning and patient transport, and their earnings are less than the average of their white colleagues (Institutes for Diversity in Health Management, 2021). Many of these employees of color are front-line workers who have been found to contract COVID-19 at higher rates than staff in higher-income brackets (Silvashaker et al., 2020). The need to seek justice for employees of people of color has been advocated for decades. Unfortunately, many hospitals in the U.S. are used to their highly hierarchical structure with
white dominated perspectives. Managers are accustomed to their hierarchy of authority while professionals are accustomed to their hierarchy of status (Mintzberg, 2017:3) Without changing the existing management system in many hospitals, a diverse work force cannot be easily incorporated into the core functions of hospitals and simultaneously contributing fully and effectively for the welfare of patients (Fisher and Petryk, 2012; Goldbach, 2017; Gurin et al., 2013; Hunt et al., 2015; Kochan et al., 2003; Leslie, 2018; Nagda et al., 2009.). Thus, it is essential to know how to manage a diversified workforce at different levels to move toward health equity.

The purpose of this paper is to survey the challenges of a large non-for-profit, integrated health care organization in Michigan in the process of implementing diversity and inclusion and to explore what hinders this organization on its journey toward an integration-and-learning perspective (i.e., promoting diversity as valuable resources for learning and growth). The author answers this research question:

What hinders the health-care organization on its journey toward an integration-and-learning perspective when it implements diversity and inclusion policies?

The author uses the framework (see fig. 1) proposed by Ely and Thomas (2001) to explore how different work group diversity perspective affecting the effectiveness of its diversity and inclusive initiatives. From their empirical studies, they find that a diverse work force cannot bring significant cultural change when these people are only hired to comply with the legal discrimination and fairness requirements (i.e., discrimination-and-fairness perspective of diversity) or to access diversified populations who can pay for their service (i.e., access-and-legitimacy perspective of diversity). They propose that for organizations to raise employee performance and satisfaction, they must move beyond the discrimination-and-fairness and access-and-legitimacy perspectives and toward an integration-and-learning perspective (i.e., promoting diversity as valuable resources for learning and growth). The health care organization in this study must focus efforts on developing an integration-and-learning perspective within their existing hierarchical culture. Leaders need to develop cross-functional or cross-departmental conversations and foster trusting relationships that are critical for employees to
Literature Review

Diversity is defined as “the varied perspectives and approaches to work that members of different identity groups bring” (Thomas & Ely, 1996:80). There are at least seven dimensions of diversity: race, gender, age, disability, religion, sexual orientation, and cultural and national origin (Bell, 2017; Shore et al., 2009). These dimensions can be visible or invisible. As many organizational diversity studies focus on the visible demographic compositions of groups or organizations, they tend to neglect whether these employees, coming from diverse social and cultural backgrounds, feel being valued and treated with care in developmental ways (Cox, 2001; Janssens & Zanoni, Roberson, 2006; Shore et al., 2011).

Inclusion is currently accepted as a new approach to diversity management. Inclusion is generally defined to represent “a person’s ability to contribute fully and effectively to an organization” (Roberson, 2006:215). Roberson (2006) asked more than 500 human resources or diversity officers and organizational development professionals about their perceptions of diversity, inclusion, diversity organizations, and inclusive organizations in the U.S. Her study concludes that an inclusive organization is an organization with “employee involvement and the
integration of diversity into organizational systems and processes” (228). Her findings of the essential characteristic of an inclusive organization corresponds to the integration and learning perspective of diversity proposed by Ely and Thomas (2001).

Diversity management seeks long-term cultural change. Gaining value from managing diversity and inclusion requires “a sustained systemic approach and long-term commitment. Success is facilitated by a perspective that considers diversity to be an opportunity for everyone in an organization to learn from each other how better to accomplish their work and an occasion that requires a supportive and cooperative organizational culture as well as group leadership and process skills that can facilitate effective group functioning” (Kochan et al., 2003: 18).

Managing diversity and inclusion needs to go beyond the visible financial result to address the progress of group process in a particular organizational context. The impact of diversity on performance is dependent on the organizational context and group/team processes.

Ely and Thomas (2001) propose three major perspectives of managing diversity:

- **Integration-and-learning perspective**: Organizations promote diversity as a valuable resources for learning and adaptive change.
- **Access-and-legitimacy perspective**: Organizations promote diversity to gain access to particular cultural markets without incorporating diverse workforces into their core functions.
- **Discrimination-and-fairness perspective**: Organizations promote diversity as a moral end and focus on equal opportunity, fair treatment, recruitment, and legal compliance without making significant changes in organizational processes.

Ely and Thomas (2001) use these perspectives to mediate between the impact of cultural diversity on groups functioning in three case studies; they determine that the integration-and-learning perspective is the best form of managing cultural diversity (see fig. 1). When work groups adopt diversity perspectives and value diversity as valuable resources for learning and adaptative change, high-quality intergroup relations including feeling being valued and respected can be expected. The integration-learning perspective can cultivate trusting relationships among
different groups and encourage collaboration among different groups for the interests of patients. Leaders can exemplify the integration-learning perspective by developing cross-functional dialogues and exploring opportunities to serve the interests of marginalized patients and employees. Learning how to adopt integration and learning perspective also results in change in the information flow between top-level management and front-line workers and management at different levels. Thus, diversified workforces can feasibly be used a tool to mitigate health disparities when integration and learning perspectives are adopted.

**Research Methodology**

In this research, the author uses qualitative study and semi-structural interview methods (Lam, 2000; 2013). Starting in May 2019, she contacted five culturally diversified organizations in the U.S. health care industry which have earned diversity and inclusion awards in the most recent three years to participate in her research. She planned to evaluate each health care organization’s diversity and inclusion policies and practices. Only one organization in Michigan was accepted to be in the research project while the others are outside Michigan and are challenging for the field work. Once the organization was accepted, the author collected all available information (e.g., policy statements, mission statements, diversity definition, PR materials, etc.) from its websites. She sent her requests to the organization with the consent form and interview guidelines. She asked for referrals and interviewed three groups of people at different levels and positions in the organization. During the interview, the author requested quantitative data from the organization’s human resource department (e.g., the number of EEOC-related complaints over the years, the demographic composition of the organization over time, the presence and number of affinity groups, etc.). In on-site visits, the author observed whether their physical facilities created an inclusive environment for their employees.

The author adopted appreciative inquiry practice and encouraged participants to think of their best experience in the area of diversity and inclusion. The interview guideline is shown in Appendix A. She and her research assistant entered the organization, negotiated the terms of inquiry, collected data, and provided feedback. She adopted the research methodology displayed
in Figure 2 that comes from Alderfer & Smith (1982:35) study of intergroup relationships embedded in organizations. The interviews were tape-recorded with the permission of respondents. They were transcribed and coded with specific themes. She had to be sensitive to how her own identity as an Asian American immigrant affected the responses of interviewees. She tried to cultivate a safe climate for respondents as this research in organizational settings might cause possible politically, emotionally, and legally charged issues. She signed confidentiality forms with the interviewees and promised to share the executive summary with them. She received approval from the Institute Research Review Board of her academic institution and showed the approval letter to the respondents.

During the process of collecting data, she accessed secondary data to reinterpret her findings. She also listened to the practices of diversity and inclusion of other hospitals at the 2019 and 2020 Academy of Management conference. She also validated her assumptions and findings by interviewing a diversity officer of another hospital in Michigan and two nurse professors at her institution. The data collected from the organization revises the theoretical framework or adds new theoretical perspective to diversity.

**Figure 2: Interrelationships among theory, method, and data in behavior research**

Five interviews were conducted during July and August 2019. Each interview lasted between one and two hours. The identity characteristics of interviewees are shown in Figure 3.
Their years of experience in diversity and inclusion at this organization ranged from three years to 20 years.

In February and March 2020, the author interviewed three medical doctors and one staff of this organization about their perceptions of the organization’s diversity and inclusion practices in a conference and a seminar (Fig. 4).

Figure 3: Identity Characteristics of interviewees

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Interviewee #</th>
<th>Race</th>
<th>Sexual Orientation</th>
<th>Gender Identity</th>
<th>Department</th>
<th>Experience of working in diversity and inclusion in this organization</th>
<th>Position in the organization</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>#1</td>
<td>white</td>
<td>LGBT</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Information Technology</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>Manager</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#2</td>
<td>Latino</td>
<td>Heterosexual</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Diversity, inclusion, and equity</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#3</td>
<td>white</td>
<td>LGBT</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Information system and hospital operation</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>Director</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#4</td>
<td>African American</td>
<td>Heterosexual</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Community health</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#5</td>
<td>white</td>
<td>Heterosexual</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Community health</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>Director</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 4: Characteristics of Informants
The author also sent the interviewees an executive summary in December 2020 and asked them to give her feedback. She also asked how various social movements and COVID-19 changed their organization. One participant was also interviewed for one hour in January 2021 to describe those changes in the organization. Two participants responded by emails.

**Findings**

This organization appears to strive toward the integration-and-learning approach to diversity and is moving beyond the legal compliance and market-oriented perspectives. From 2009 to 2019, the organization has undertaken many diversity and inclusion initiatives. Many strategic initiatives including components such as cultural competency, community engagement, supplier diversity, equity of care, talent acquisition, and compensation have been implemented. Evidence for positive signals of integration-and-learning approach are found in the observations below.

**These are positive signals:**

1. The CEO is committed to making cultural changes and seems serious about issues related to racism in and outside the organization. The CEO signed #123forEquity pledge in 2017 and Talent 2025 CEO commitment. Interviewees always praised her commitment to antiracism and her effort to make cultural changes. She has shown a commitment to having enough minority candidates in the candidate pool for various positions. She has brought more cultural understanding about racial inequality issues in the organization. The organization expresses a commitment to bringing more people of color into the talent pool and also investing in the system to show how
social determinants of health affect health equity and the need of diversified workforce.

2. The organization also made a cultural shift by having a new diversity officer to oversee the DEI department and work as a senior vice president of human resource management in 2019. The diversity and inclusion equity (DEI) officer can increase the visibility of the organization’s commitment to healthy equity and mobilize changes in human resources policy.

3. Seven people in the DEI department deepen the organization’s commitment to national #123for Equity Pledge and regional Talent 2025 diversity programs by implementing a system-wide approach in these five areas: cultural competence, supplier diversity, equity of care, community engagement, and workforce diversity. These five areas are sponsored and executed by employees. DEI team connects, communicates, and mobilizes people from the Human Resource Department, other departments, IRG groups, and Resident Physician initiatives for the benefits of patients. The DEI team provides cultural competence training and helps more than 30,000 employees to increase awareness of their unconscious biases. The DEI’s dedicated service is committed to go beyond the compliance of affirmative actions.

4. The DEI team partners with the resident diversity council and organizes training workshops about the impact of race and racism on health care. The DEI team uses data analytics to educate doctors and nurses about social determinants of health. Doctors and nurses are encouraged to examine their own biases about different identities of patients and to receive support from the five IRG (Inclusive resource groups), Human Resources, and DEI departments.
The management team has changed doctors’ compensation plans from being centered on the number of patients to the quality of care they have given for patients. The DEI and human resource management team train doctors to understand how the well-being of patients are related to their perceived identities. They help doctors to be comfortable with the transition from quantity of patients to quality outcome, and to know how to understand patients’ identities and health from the whole person perspective. Interviewee #2 said:

This is how you begin to heal the whole person. And understanding Identity is incredibly important... we know the work we do influences their behavior influences.

5. Five inclusion resource groups (IRG) have been formed for the following groups: young professionals, LBGTQIA+, African Americans, veterans, and Hispanic/Latino. They are led by employees and championed by their executives. These five groups strengthen relationships with people of similar backgrounds inside and outside their organization. Sometimes doctors refer patients to particular members in the IRG. Only fewer than 10% of employees are involved in the five IRG groups.

6. The organization conducts a quarterly survey about employees’ engagement and an annual survey of their sense of belonging in the organization.

7. Leaders in several departments determine how to promote diversity as valuable resources for learning and growth. The leaders’ personal experience also affects their level of empathy toward others in their department.

Interviewee #1 remembered his fear of disclosure of his sexual orientation for 15 years in his previous jobs, but now he could be open to his sexual orientation during the job interview in this organization. From 2009 to 2019, the organization focused on inclusive family friendly policy (LBGT+) and raised awareness about unconscious bias. He expresses gratitude to be accepted and appreciated when the organization’s family
policy affirms his partner’s status. He does not want to change people’s biases directly. He prefers to help create a safe environment for his subordinates such that he can know them, empower them, include them as people in his department. His practice is to model and lead his subordinates to be immersed in the diversified culture. As the bargaining power of employees in information technology (IT) health care industry is very high, they can choose to leave if they dislike the diversity culture in this organization. As a result, those employees in the IT department are willing to learn how to adapt the LGBT+ culture and appreciate diversity as valuable resources. His outreach information technology (IT) program is to bring more young people, more women, to the organization through cooperative programs with communities. He said:

My leadership style is to create a safe space for others and not to change their bias….It took me a long time as a leader to figure out that something that I was paid to do every day was being a good model….I want people to bring their whole self to the workplace (Interviewee #1).

The teams that tend to have lower engagement scores are teams with managers that are less engaged” (Interviewee #1).

Interviewee #3 disclosed her involvement in racism and community work as she wants to provide a better environment for her two adopted daughters from China. She did not expect that people would treat her daughters as less-than-people and is regularly insulted by questions of her being a ‘gay parent,’ as if the adjective demoralizes her parenthood. She could only provide care for the 40 people who reported to her. She said:

Listen to their stories...hire more young people.

The above two leaders take care of their subordinates first and exemplify how to achieve diversity and inclusion with empathy and compassion toward people. They both are transformed by their painful experiences and create meaning of their own leadership
by being truthful to their identities and providing safe spaces for their employees. They want to change the culture by hiring more young people.

Interviewee#2 provides cross-cultural competence training and workshops to employees. She reflected her experience of feeling included and valued in a voluntary woman’s organization and wants to pass her passion to others “by creating those same types of experiences and spaces for people.”

Interviewee#5 plans to hire more people of color and provides a safe space for people of color in his own community health department. He wants his daughter to grow up in a world with universal equity among all people.

What holds this organization back on their journey toward an integration-and-learning perspective?

1. There is no clear path of success or promotion for people of color in the organization. Two interviewees who were people of color were frustrated with their stagnant positions and saw no path to leadership.

Interviewee #4 is an African American and said:

White people came in with my qualifications got training to be leaders while I had no chance to receive training in my five-year work…. African Americans in IRG are marginalized.

Another interviewee #2 who is Latina and her facial expression showed hopeless about her promotion when she was asked her future. She helped her colleagues to know how to deal with implicit biases but had no faith in the change of the caste system.
These two interviewees were working very hard to seek health equity for patients. They created meaning and significance of their work by relating their cultural identities to patients’ identity and showing empathy toward marginalized patients. They had no hope for leadership development and for higher rank positions in the caste system. They did not feel valued and respected as they could not see how their future promotion related to their current commitment to different diversity and inclusion initiatives. They felt they were stagnant in a hierarchical organization.

2. There is a systematic problem of a lack of safe spaces for minorities in this large organization of 30,000 employees. 3500 employees are in marginalized positions and have been subjected to systematic racial structures in the system. They are afraid of being laid off and speaking up in the hierarchical organization. Many are paid minimum wages, which do not adequately sustain their dependents. When some marginalized employees feel unsafe to advocate their voices to seniors, they perceive these diversity and inclusion policies as just window dressings. Interviewee #4, who is African American and a leader of an IRG group, was very frustrated with these DEI initiatives. He said:

No feel safe….No change much…. [Organization] puts on the image of care.

Some respondents believe that the system mostly works for white people. Leadership positions have not been diversified. 95% of leaders in the organization are white men. Interviewee #5 who is white American and directs community health department. He disclosed the continuous tension between front-line people and leadership because the front-line people are more diversified while 95% of leaders are white man. In his community health department, he hired 10 people of color to low-wage jobs. They present the public an image of diversified labor force. He said:

We live in a segregated world. Most white people do not have knowledge of people of color…. 3500 employees are subjected to systematic racial structures in
the system….95% of leaders here are white males… [the] system works for white people.

Interviewees perceived the organization used people of color in the community health department to present to the public an image of diversified labor force while the community health department in reality lacks significant political power in the organization. For example, many front-line staff in the community health department are people of color. They are responsible for connecting with patients in the community and help the organization achieve equity of care. However, these health community positions are low-wage jobs and the workers are often afraid to advocate for their concerns and interests

3. The DEI training is voluntary. Those who need it the most do not come. Employees who need cultural training the most will not become conscious of their need to understand biases and their effects on other people. Those who deny the need for healing in a safe space will not come to attend cross-cultural workshops and those who already possess knowledge of their biases will come to workshops and continue to learn. Participation in cross-cultural competence workshops and activities provided by IRG groups and DEI team is not related to compensation. The training is promoted as being primarily for the patients’ benefits, not employees. Some employees refuse to participate in these workshops and keep their biases. In general, biases toward employees are not penalized. Only a few employees have been penalized for their own racial biases toward patients and other employees by the DEI and Human Resources departments.

4. There is a lack of communication and learning among leaders from different departments. It is up to the discretion of each department’s leaders to decide how to implement diversity as valuable resources for learning and growth. The leaders’
personal experiences also affect their level of empathy toward others in their department. Each department is unaware of the other departments’ diversity and inclusion climate. The author had a conversation with two prestigious doctors and one doctor’s assistant of this hospital in a disease conference and found that they did not have significant interactions with the DEI and IRG of their organization. One doctor (Interviewee 6) told the author his patients mainly come from referrals, not from the local community. His research work is not very related to the diversity and inclusion practice. His assistant (Interviewee 8) expressed a lack of awareness of the organization’s diversity and inclusion practices. Another doctor who is in the children palliative-care team (Interviewee 7) and explained to the author about the over-representation of white patients in its web site. He accepted that diversity and inclusion practices were not significant in his team even though his patients represent the community.

5. There is increasing pressure to cut costs at the expense of the welfare of employees, well-run pipe-line computer programs in the community, and health equity. For example, Interviewee #3 has invested many resources in nurturing female IT staff, starting with his outreach K-12 programs. He perceived that program starting from public schools in the entire pipeline can increase the supply of people of color to the organization in the long-run program. However, he is worried that the organization would cut this out-reach program as the health care industry adjusted to the financial situation to invest less in community programs. He is worried the increasing expected financial performance of the hospital will destroy his years of nurturing young female IT staff and the outreach program. He has seen the progressive changes in the organization during his 20 years of service. He perceives that the diversity and inclusion policy need to turn to the hospital’s fundamental value of caring for your employees since many employees are not paid to higher than the
minimum wages and could not adequately care for their families. Interviewee #3 said:

Care people is more important than those systematic measurement…Supplier diversity is not real…minority owned the business but not hire any minority in the business.

The organization is perceived to be cost driven at the expance of diversity. Interviewee #3 is pessimistic about the organization’s diversity and inclusion practice. He said,

Business value of diversity may not be a top priority in the overall scheme of all of the things that are happening in health care these days. I don’t know if they see diversity as a solution to the problems they are trying to solve right now.

One nurse professor at the author’s institution also made similar comment about diversity and inclusion practice in hospitals. She said, “there was no fire in the belly.”

Interviewee #5 who is in charge of the outreach community program and frustrated with the low financial commitment to health equity. He said:

People in the community know the problem of health equity but do not want to give resources to help solve the problem. People cannot see how racism is against universal American values (Interviewee #5).

6. The organization’s internal cultural environment is not friendly to people who are different from the dominate group. Interviewees said:

Inclusion is harder because you have to make all of these people from different backgrounds and thoughts feel like they are heard, listened to, and valued….Where we still lack diversity in the VP to the CIO level, where we still
see mostly white men….but we still don’t have people of color even across the organization (Interviewee #2).

Most people of color we hired at the VP or director level left within about 18 months (Interviewee #3).

7. The organization has limited access Hispanic and African American physicians because of the systematic undersupply of these physicians and relative over supply of Asian physicians even though many of their customers are Hispanics and African Americans. The location of this health care organization is not large and diverse cities that can more easily attract physicians of color. The interviewees said:

   Over the last 10 years, the city has become more inclusive….we still have little black owned business…I don’t feel it is welcoming place for people of color (Interviewee#2).

   The culture of the city [in which the organization locates] is not quite progressive enough… there is only one bar and one club. The club is only for 18 years old while the bar is only for 55 years old….I don’t believe we have any internal programs specifically targeting people who will like to transfer from far away….I mean hiring in [this city] is difficult due to the weather (Interviewee#1).

In summary, there is a systematic problem of a lack of a safe space for minorities in this large organization of 30,000 employees. 3500 employees are in marginalized positions and overrepresent in low-wage essential jobs. They are afraid of being laid off in a caste system that works for white male decision-makers. Many people of color cannot see their path of success in the organization. Those who are marginalized do not trust these diversity initiatives. As the current reward system is not linked to employees’ participation in these DEI initiatives, those with the strongest biases will not be motivated to attend the workshops. They will maintain their implicit biases. Only a few have been confronted by the patients and have received penalties by
the Human Resources department. It is the leaders’ decisions to practice diversity, equity, and inclusion in their own departments. There is not adequate intergroup dialogue about sensitive issues as structural racism in the organization to induce serious change. The location of the organization also creates barriers to attract people of color and enforces the systematic shortages of physicians of color in the organization. Thus, the diversified workforce mainly comes from those local residents with low-wage jobs.

**Positive Changes during the 2020 Social Movements**

The author followed up with the study and witnessed some positive changes in the organization during the COVID-19 pandemic. The social movements in the summer of 2020 and the increased awareness of inequality in the community created opportunities for the organization to speed up its changes in the implementation of its DEI policies. The organization has announced an increase in the minimum wages to their front-line workers who are highly presented by people of color. The IRG groups have been using a virtual channel to reach 30,000 workers to educate them on health equity and social injustice issues. Interviewee #4 told the author he could reach out to 30,000 workers, CEO, and high-ranking decision makers to celebrate Juneteenth day on June 19, 2020 through their virtual channel and increased the awareness of his colleagues about the related social issues. In the past, he could only have reached fewer than 200 colleagues to celebrate Juneteenth Day. He also used this virtual event to reach out to the CEO to advocate the needs of African Americans in the organization. He also expressed gratitude for being able to see the faces of top-level leaders through many remote meetings. He perceived that the remote working place policy allowed closer communications between top-level and front-line workers as more information were now circulated through the remote channels without the interpretations of middle-level management. Another interviewee wrote this to the author,

> By the way, if you interviewed me today I would say we have come a really long way in a short time (Interviewee #3).
Interviewee #4 also received informal mentor training, cross-cultural competence training, and had opportunities to move up the corporate ladder after top-level management became more aware of the needs of people of color. However, there is still no institutionalized policy for mentoring people of color. He is also worried that the impact of the social movement on the organization would not be sustainable as people in the Midwest tend not to sustain such changes.

**Conclusion and Implications**

The practice of diversity, equity, and inclusion in the health care organization must be grounded on its basic core value: “people first.” In this organization, the community health department has significant interactions with the community and upholds the image of the hospital’s value about equity of care. This group of people at the community health department now feel that their wages have improved but they do not know whether the equity practices and emphases will be sustained.

The organization is in the process of making cultural changes and creating an organizational culture of mutual learning and cooperation; the success of change still depends on the discretion of individual leaders in their departments. It seems that those leaders who have experienced the pain of being rejected or know their own privileges tend to provide more safe spaces and empathy towards their subordinates than those without such experiences or recognition of their privileges. The five interviewees would like to hire more young people of color and to increase their pool of talented leaders through long-term community projects. It is essential for the organizational leaders to view diversity, equity, and inclusion initiatives as a long-term solution to their shortage of talented people of color in leadership positions and health equity issues in the community.

The leaders should fully utilize the opportunities provided by the recent social movements to have more meaningful and productive dialogues among different groups of people and bridge the caste that divide employees. The leaders should continuously use different means (i.e., digitized media, in-person workshops) to increase information flow between top-level
management and front-line workers. Many front-line workers may not access those digitized media and need to be in-person in those workshops with appropriate compensation. The leaders need to intentionally cultivate a safe space for marginalized people to articulate their concerns. They need to listen deeply about the concerns of front-line workers, while also making the messages to be clear and comprehensible to these front-line workers.

The leaders also foster collaborative work among different departments and facilitate learning among different groups. Different department leaders will contribute and motivate their employees to participate different cultural competence training. The objective is to give these leaders a sense of ownership of diversity training. As more and more groups adopt integration-learning perspectives in this organization, they will create better collaboration among groups for the well-being of patients, including those of marginalized groups. The author recommends having a greater diversity in top-level management in the future through institutionalized mentoring programs for people of color and systemic assessment of internal promotion. The leaders must exemplify the integration-and-learning perspective and are willing to be vulnerable to those without privilege in the caste system. They will encourage growth and learning among employees when they use those data related to structural injustice and health inequity in their decision-making process. As more and more truthful conversations between those with and without privilege in the organization occur more and more creative solutions for providing accessible and affordable health care will be made possible. The journey of this health care organization toward a culture with integration-and-learning perspective can inspire other health care organizations to know how to use a diverse, equitable, and inclusive workforce to achieve health equity.

**Acknowledgement**
The author thanks the McGregor Summer Research Fellowship, the Calvin Center for Innovation in Business, Calvin Center for Christian Scholarship, Dr. Brian Cawley, Dr. Mary Doonbos, Dr. Katherine Kunnen, Dr. Jeanne Logsdon, Dr. Dean Ward, Dr. Georgia Eshelman, Joshua
Polanski, Robert Lang, many corporate executives, and two anonymous reviewers of North American Management Society for their support in this project.

References


Ferdman, B. & Sagiv, L. (2012). Diversity in organizations and cross-cultural work psychology: what if they were more connected. *Industrial and Organizational Psychology, 5*, 323-345.


Appendix A: An Interview Guideline

An Interview Guideline

The objective of this interview is to learn from your organization’s best practices in the area of diversity and inclusion. We would like to examine the relationships between diversity and inclusion policies and organization effectiveness. We don’t want to know any confidential or financial information of your organization. All information will be compiled together.

Section A: Personal Background

Years of working experience in this organization________________

Years of working experience in the area of diversity and inclusion in this organization________________

Years of working experience in the area of diversity and inclusion in other organizations before this current organization____________

Section B: Your Organization’s diversity and inclusion policies

1. As we would like to learn from your best diversity and inclusion experience, would you please describe to us your experience? These are possible experiences:
   a. Creating safe space for more effective group conversations across differences.
   b. Being in diverse teams with the freedom/autonomy, recognition and reward, sufficient time, challenge, and sense of urgency to generate new ideas.
c. Inviting people who are typically not included in social events and diversity initiatives that you attend or organize to attend those events.

d. Giving meaningful and constructive feedback to all subordinates.

e. Promoting your organizational accountability and transparency in performance management process and criteria, outcomes, and audiences.

f. Investing in human resource tools and systems designed to de-bias the talent management process.

g. Creating a repository of resources for employees related to employment policies and legislation in geographies around the world to help them understand their rights and how those might change in different geographic contexts.

h. Implementing or participating diversity training focused on building effective relationships across difference.

i. Creating data-driven and targeted diversity and inclusion strategies aimed at addressing firm-specific challenges and opportunities.

j. Creating initiatives focused on building a culture of empathy, emotional intelligence, and high-quality connections.

2. Would people in your group or organization also have your best diversity and inclusion experience you have already mentioned? Why or why not?

3. Have you shared this best experience with your senior managers? Why or why not?

4. Have you shared this best experience with members in your department? Why or why not?

5. Have you shared this best experience with other departments? Why or why not?

6. Have you shared this best experience with other companies? Why or why not?

7. Would this best experience affect your interactions with your subordinates informally and formally? Why or why not?
Section C: Recommendation

1. What would you like your organization to do more in the area of diversity and inclusion?
2. What are the characteristics of excellent diversity and inclusion policies?

Section D: Referral

We need to interview your colleagues in your organization. Please give us referrals. All individual identity and organization identity will not be disclosed in the executive summary that you will receive in the spring, 2020.

Thanks!
When physical attractiveness does not benefit:
Focusing on interpersonal relationship, target employee personality, and career success

Si Ahn Mehng
University of North Carolina at Pembroke

Key words: physical attractiveness, interpersonal relationship, career success

A former banker in New York, Debrahlee Lorenzana, 33, claimed she was fired for being too attractive and filed a lawsuit against Citibank. The reason behind the lawsuit was because she was ordered not to wear a list of clothing (i.e., turtlenecks, pencil skirts, fitted suits or heels) in the workplace because it was distracting to other employees trying to do their jobs. However, Lorenzana explicitly compared herself to her female coworkers, and complained to human resources in a letter as followed: “They were able to wear such items of clothing because they were short, overweight, and they didn't draw much attention, but since I was five-foot-six, 125 pounds, with a figure, it wasn't 'appropriate'.” About a month or so later, she received a message from her male boss that she was being put on final notice for reasons including lagging sales and being late on days the bank wasn’t even open. She petitioned through a couple of letters to ask for a transfer, but the position Citibank gave her in a different office was as a telemarketer with a title of “business banker”. A few months later, at the Rockefeller Center branch, her female manager sat her down and fired her. The female manager cited the problems related to her clothing at the previous branch and said she was sorry, but Lorenzana wasn’t fit for the culture of Citibank (abstracted from Bates, 2010; Levin, 2010).
Lorenzana’s lawsuit case shows the opposite outcome (i.e., career success) of physical attractiveness. Physical attractiveness is the most obvious personal characteristic (Dion, Berscheid, & Walster, 1972), which is defined by social consensus (Feingold, 1992), and a substantial amount of research evidence has shown that attractive people have benefits in many aspects, such as earning more salary (e.g., Judge & Cable, 2004; Judge & Cable, 2011; Judge, Hurst, & Simon, 2009), having occupational success and occupational competence (see Langlois and colleagues, 2000). Attractive people are perceived as being more intellectually competent, as having greater occupational potential, and as being more successful in persuading others than are less-attractive people (Jackson, 1992: p.100). However, does this mean that physical attractiveness benefits us always? When including the aspect of interpersonal relationships, attractiveness benefits decreased.

In contrast to the physical attractiveness stereotype (i.e., “what is beautiful is good”, Dion et al., 1972), there are some interesting research evidence that the average or not-so-pretty people elicit strong feelings of trust and comfort. Kunkel (2009) cited some research results that the average faces were overwhelmingly judged as more attractive than beautiful faces. One study showed how “less-than-dapper” appearance would be in appealing to political votes. Participants answered some questions related to trust, help, moral, and honest, and sixty-seven percent of the survey participants trusted “flawed folks” more than “beauties”, and seventy one percent said unattractive types were more likely to help out a stranger. Moreover, eighty two percent of participants considered very unattractive people to be a far safer bet to loan money to than the beautiful people (Kunkel, 2009: pp.22-28). This is because individuals feel safe with less
attractive people for the reason that they are more accessible and they have less likelihood to make others feel inferior (Kunkel, 2009).

Back to the lawsuit case, Lorenzana was fired for being pretty as she claimed, but there are some interesting arguments based on interviews with her. From additional observations, it is possible to see physical appearance as not the main problem that she had for being fired, but is related to deeper-level personality attributes such as narcissism. Bates (2010) noted that, “She is a self-confessed shopaholic who already had five wardrobes stuffed full of Vuitton, Burberry, Hermes, and Roberto Cavalli”, and yet still was shopping for office clothes at the high street chain, Zara. Bates (2010) further pointed out “all this on a salary of $70,000 a year, which is, £47,000 ($74,400) a year (for clothing)? … Here is just another example of an ordinary working woman feeling she has the right and the bank balance to dress like a movie star.” Consumer behavior researchers have demonstrated that possessions are expressions of the self-concept and consumption is used for attention-seeking purposes (Sedikides, Cisek, & Hart, 2011). Narcissists are addicted to self-esteem and are hyper-motivated to self-enhance. Narcissists express their materialism through a distinct consumer behavior pattern such as preference for symbolic products (e.g., designer clothes, expensive jewelry, top-range cars, rare antiques), and they want to show that they are fashionistas, always aware of the latest label (Sedikides et al., 2011).

Generally, physical attractiveness attributed to individuals have a more favorable personality (Gross & Crofton, 1977), but if the target employee has excessive and unrealistic positive self-views (i.e., high narcissism), it would be problematic and maladaptive to have a positive interpersonal relationship (Back, Schmukle, & Egloff, 2010). Narcissistic individuals are deeply
engaged with maintaining positive perceptions of themselves, spending more time managing, and posting self-promoting information on social networking sites (Buffardi & Campbell, 2008), or using the display of material possessions as an impression management strategy (Sedikides et al., 2011). Narcissistic individuals are generally rated negatively as less agreeable, less well adjusted, less warm, and more arrogant by their peers (Paulhus, 1998).

Attractiveness effects depend on various factors (Jackson, 1992; Berry, 2007), and the purpose of this study is to show possible contingencies in physical attractiveness studies for both male and female employees (e.g., attractiveness was as important for men (d = .40) as for women (d = .32) from meta-analysis study on job-related outcomes, Hosoda, Stone-Romero, & Coats, 2003) that physical attractiveness can be a detrimental factor in occupational success (i.e., promotion or training/reward recommendation decisions), especially when focusing on the mediating effect of interpersonal relationship and the moderating effect of target employee narcissistic personality.

THEORY DEVELOPMENT

Conceptualization of Physical Attractiveness

A person’s physical appearance is the personal characteristic most obvious and accessible to others in social interaction (Dion et al., 1972), and physical attractiveness can be viewed as a status characteristic along with socially valued characteristics (e.g., intelligence, athletic ability) (Webster & Driskell, 1983). Physical attractiveness research has been done with diverse methodological approach in multidisciplinary areas (Eagly, Ashmore, Makhijani, & Longo,
1991), yet, much of this research has been conducted without a conceptual definition of what attractiveness is (Rubenstein, Langlois, & Roggman, 2002: p.1).

To conceptualize physical attractiveness, it is necessary to negate the belief that “Beauty is in the eye of the beholder”. Based on the adage, individuals develop idiosyncratic opinions about attractiveness and if the adage is true, people from different backgrounds and experiences should develop very different definitions of attractiveness, and there is no point to discuss about physical attractiveness without a common ground. However, empirical evidence has shown that the adage is not true. Langlois and colleagues (2000) examined meta-analysis study with 130 samples of attractiveness ratings from 94 different studies in the face perception literature. The study quantitatively assessed the agreement on attractiveness from different types of raters (i.e, age, gender, and ethnicity), and the results indicated high agreement about attractiveness from very different type of raters (i.e. within-culture ratings of adults: r = .90; within-culture ratings of children: r = .85; cross-cultural ratings of adults: r = .94; cross-ethnic ratings of adults: r = .88, all p < .05), and these results indicate that beauty is not simply in the eye of the beholder (Rubenstein, et al., 2002: pp. 2-4).

Then, what is physical attractiveness? According to a definition from Wikipedia, physical attractiveness can be referred to the degree to which a person’s physical traits are regarded as aesthetically pleasing or beautiful. There can be many sub-factors which influence one person’s attraction to another with various physical aspects (e.g., height, weight, a distinct facial part such as nose, etc.), but this study defines physical attractiveness as more of overall concepts including general facial attractiveness, height, weight, and body composition. As the meta-analysis
(Langlois, et al., 2000) result shows there are more agreed favorable traits for physical attractiveness (e.g., Henss, 1991: young people are rated as more attractive than old people). This study will follow commonly agreed standard to define physical attractiveness. Also, the current study will be more focusing on two broad research areas: the research concerns differential treatment as a function of physical attractiveness by examining looks-based discrimination, and the research focuses not on people’s reactions to targets, but on the characteristics (e.g., personality traits, skills, behavioral tendencies) of attractive or unattractive individuals (Eagly et al., 1991).

Physical Attractiveness and Career Success

The role of physical appearance is not negligible in staffing related decisions, and a significant amount of research evidence has shown that attractive people have benefits in many aspects (i.e., salary, performance evaluation). Physical appearance can be easily assumed that it is not really related to work itself, but research evidence shows person with high physical attractiveness can get preferable evaluations from others. Based on the literature review, facial attractiveness, height, and weight are all highly related to career success. First, Judge and colleagues (2009) investigated that general mental ability and physical attractiveness (i.e. facial attractiveness) exhibited both direct and indirect effects on income. Also, Judge and Cable (2004) showed height was positively correlated with earnings in all four large-sample studies, and the validity of height in predicting earnings does not decline over time, and height is more predictive of earnings in social interaction-oriented occupations. Another study by Judge and Cable (2011) showed weight gives opposite incentives to men and women, and that is weight has
a positive effect for men but a negative effect for women. Add to this, physical attractiveness differentially affects the performance evaluations and recommended personnel actions for men and women holding their jobs in managerial positions (e.g., Heilman & Stopeck, 1985: males take advantage of their good looks in managerial position, but opposite result for females).

Even though the target employee enjoys some benefit from the physical attractiveness stereotype, if that employee does not have a favorable personality, physical attractiveness may be negated and give detrimental effect to the target employee. From Barrick and colleagues’ (2009) meta-analysis shows a different effect of physical attractiveness depending on information availability with a time effect. The authors’ report on the correlation between physical attractiveness and job performance ($r_c = .14$) is much smaller than the correlation between physical attractiveness and interviewer ratings ($r_c = .54$). Two major differences between the initial interview and job performance ratings are time and access to information. In the interview, time is short and the hiring decision must be made on the basis of a limited amount of information. However, performance ratings are generally made over a longer period of time with more opportunities for observation on the target employee. If the target employee does not have a favorable personality (i.e. narcissism), physical attractiveness will not help much, and even can be a detrimental factor. Therefore, I would like to suggest the relationship between physical attractiveness and career success can be negative when the target employee does not have a favorable personality trait.
PROPOSITION: Physical attractiveness has a positive relationship with career success; however, when the target employee has a negative personality trait, physical attractiveness will be negatively related to career success.

Physical Attractiveness, Interpersonal Relationship, and Narcissism

Physical attractiveness can be attributed in many ways, and such attributions have important implications for workplace interpersonal relationship. According to Duval and Silvia (2002), people spontaneously strive to understand the world by making attributions for events. Through causal attribution system, people connect various effect events to any plausible cause. While having social interaction, physical attractiveness might not lead favorable judgment on the target employee such as s/he earns the benefit from physical appearance, and the target employee can be judged that s/he earns success not because of ability but because of luck or look (e.g. Forsterling, Preikschas, & Agthe, 2007).

Likability Generally, physical attractiveness shows positive relationships in a social context, and can be assumed to have high likability. Likability is a combination of several characteristics that people perceive and judge the other in a positive or negative way (Cottringer, 2003). From Dion and colleagues’ study (1972), participants judged attractive targets more positively on a composite measure of social desirability. Also, participants expected attractive targets to lead more satisfying social and professional lives than would their unattractive peers. Moreover, those identified with physical attractiveness were attributed to have more a favorable personality. From Gross and Crofton’s study (1977), the results indicated that the higher levels of physical attractiveness (from labeled as high, moderate, and low) was rated with having more favorable
personalities. Thus, it is possible to assume that as individual with greater physical attractiveness is attributed to have higher likability.

Hypothesis 1a: Target employee’s physical attractiveness will be positively related to supervisor likability.

**Trust** Under the assumptions of individual’s self-interest nature in economic organizations (Griesinger, 1990) trust can be one of the most important interpersonal resources. Trust is critical in many workplace relationships. Trust reduces transaction costs (Granovetter, 1985), facilitates cooperation (Pillutla, Malhortra, & Murnighan, 2003), and allows managers to operate effectively (Dirk and Ferrin, 2002). In economic organization settings, trust enables people to take risks, develop and maintain relationships (McAllister, 1995). McAllister (1995) identified two distinct types of trust: cognition-based trust and affect-based trust. Cognitive trust is based on beliefs about the trustee’s ability and integrity, while affective trust is based on beliefs about the trustee’s benevolence and an affective attachment between the truster and trustee (Dunn, Ruedy, & Schweitzer, 2012). The current study will be focusing more on affective trust since affective trust is more about emotional bonds between the truster and trustee, and truster with high affective trust expects the trustee to be supportive and considerate to his/her vulnerability (Dunn et al., 2012; McAllister, 1995) which is considered prosocial behavior in organizations.

Kunkel’s (2009) experiment on trust and physical appearance showed that average-looking or unattractive types are more trustworthy. In the follow-up session, participants were asked to answer why the beautiful people were less trustworthy than average-looking or unattractive types. Participants thought the average to unattractive types looked like “hard workers”, and
participants felt the unattractive types would feel a stronger need to prove themselves trustworthy (p. 27). Kunkel pointed out we feel safe with less attractive people because they are vulnerable and they make us feel less vulnerable ourselves (p. 40). Therefore, it is possible to assume that physical attractiveness is attributed as a negative factor for affective trust.

Hypothesis 1b: Target employee’s physical attractiveness will be negatively related to supervisor affective trust.

Narcissism – the negative personality trait Implicit personality theory is a hypothetical cognitive structure that comprises personal attributes (e.g., personality traits) and the set of expected relations (i.e., inferential relations) between and among them (Ashmore & Del Boca, 1981, recited). Stereotypes are implicit personality theories in which group membership is one of the personal attributes that is associated inferentially with other personal attributes. Eagly and colleagues (1991) applied implicit personality theory to understand the physical attractiveness stereotype, and argued that the social categories of “attractive” and “unattractive” were linked inferentially to a variety of personality dimensions (Hosoda et al., 2003).

Narcissism is a personality trait defined by an unusually high degree of self-love, broadly reflects strong self-admiration, and behavioral tendencies that may not be viewed positively by others (Judge, LePine, & Rich, 2006). Essentially, compared to unattractive people, those who are attractive have a higher score on measure of self-confidence and interpersonal orientation, internal locus of control, and self-acceptance and resistance to peer pressure (Jackson, 1992: pp132-133). However, when it comes to interpersonal relationships, narcissism is thought of as a problematic and maladaptive interpersonal trait (Back et al., 2010). Because narcissists are
insensitive to others’ concerns and social constraints and view others as inferior, their self-regulatory efforts often fail to earn the positive feedback they are seeking, but rather undermining the positive self-image they are trying to create (Morf & Rhodewalt, 2001).

Furthermore, narcissists are rather disliked at long-term acquaintance when they are engaged in interpersonal relationships. Paulhus (1998) showed the progression of negative traits perceived in individuals with narcissism in interpersonal relationship. Narcissists were rated negatively as less agreeable, less well adjusted, less warm, and more arrogant by their peers. Back and colleagues’ study (2010) also explains that narcissists lose their popularity as time progresses. At zero acquaintance, narcissists are more popular at first sight because they produce more valued physical, nonverbal, and verbal cues in a limited information situation. However, in a long-term relationship, the negative social habits of self-enhancers (e.g., arrogance, hostility) are more easily observable and lead to more negative evaluations by others.

Also, narcissists have a sense of entitlement and are not concerned about other people’s feelings or needs (Oltmanns & Lawton, 2011). When trust is defined as the willingness to accept vulnerability based on beliefs about the trustee’s ability and character, a narcissist’s lack of empathy can be an opposite trait of trust. Thus, the current study theorizes that the impact of physical attractiveness on the success of interpersonal relationships is contingent on target employee narcissism. Narcissists also lose their popularity with the time effect, and it is assumed if physically attractive target employee has narcissism, s/he may suffer in interpersonal relationships in many ways. Narcissism will have a negative interaction effect with physical
attractiveness on the interpersonal relationship outcome from the supervisor or peers of target employee.

**Interpersonal relationship and Career Success**

“Liking” has a positive effect on performance ratings. “Liking” influences supervisor’s performance rating as a mediator (see Wayne & Ferris, 1990). When managers make judgments about others, they retrieve relevant judgments which are already formed during early interactions or they make judgments based on information from long-term memory (Hastie & Park, 1986). If the manager has a good impression (i.e. liking) about the target employee, the target employee will have a highly likelihood to have a positive performance rating. Wayne and Ferris (1990) shows the relationship between a subordinate’s impression management tactics and a manager’s performance ratings, and both lab study and field study result supports “liking” as having a positive effect on performance rating (lab study: r = .58; field study: r = .65, both p< .001).

Also, research evidence suggests that trusted employees show better performance (Salamon & Robinson, 2008). From McAllister’s (1995) study, affect-based trust shows significant positive correlations with performance measures (peer performance: r = .18, p< .01; focal manager performance: r = .26, p< .001), and positive correlations with manager citizenship behaviors (manager affiliative citizenship behavior: r = .71, p< .01; manager assistance citizenship behavior: r = .48, p< .001). Therefore, high performing employees are likely to have career success, and it is possible to assume that an employee who has good interpersonal relationships will have career success. Yet, career success is also a function of employees’ job behaviors, especially their performance (Ng et al., 2005) so the current study will control target
employee’s job performance to see the relationship between interpersonal relationship and career success.

Hypothesis 2: Perceived employee interpersonal relationships (i.e., likability, affective trust) will be positively related to indicators of employee career success (i.e., salary, promotion), controlling for the target employee’s job performance.

Target employees’ personality characteristics (i.e. narcissism) will influence on how the target employee maintains interpersonal relationships with coworkers/supervisors. The interaction between physical attractiveness and narcissism will help explain when physical attractiveness becomes a detrimental factor for career success. In summary, the current study proposes that the effect of physical attractiveness on interpersonal relationship is contingent on target employee’s narcissism, and that perceived interpersonal relationship in turn influences target employees’ career success. Thus, perceived interpersonal relationship mediates the combined effects of physical attractiveness and target employee narcissism on career success (see Figure 1).

Hypothesis 3: Interpersonal relationships will mediate the combined effects of target employee’s physical attractiveness and narcissism on an employee’s career success (i.e., salary and promotion).
References


good, but...: A meta-analytic review of research on the physical attractiveness stereotype. Psychological Bulletin, 110, 109-128.


Hastie, R., & Park, B. (1986). The relationship between memory and judgment depends on whether the judgment task is memory-based or on-line. Psychological Review, 93, 258-458.


What motivates an academic coach in an online accelerated course? Using a qualitative approach
Si Ahn Mehng
University of North Carolina at Pembroke
Xinyan Shi
University of North Carolina at Pembroke
Brianna Livengood
University of North Carolina at Pembroke

Abstract
Academic coaches play a critical role in accelerated online graduate courses. Previous studies provide us with little understanding on how academic coaches are motivated and what sustains their efforts for students’ learning experience. This study examines the intrinsic factors that affect the motivation of academic coaches, and how those factors are related to their job behaviors and overall course delivery effectiveness. First, as an exploratory study, we use a grounded theory approach and conduct interviews to identify academic coaches’ intrinsic motivation factors. Based on the findings, we develop survey questionnaires to examine how their intrinsic motivation is related to overall job behaviors (e.g., job satisfaction, job commitment, turnover intention, etc.), and performance. Based on the findings obtained, we will show the areas of improvements to be made to increase positive job behaviors and performance to increase quality of education in an accelerated online course. The study will also offer insights on practical implementations to utilize academic coaches and improve efficiency for accelerated online courses.

Key words: Online course, teaching assistant, motivation, job behavior

Acknowledgement: This project was produced under a 2020-2021 grant from Instructional Connections.
Introduction:

Academic coaches (i.e., teaching assistants) play a critical role in online courses, as they are responsible for grading, answering questions for students, interacting with students, and communicating with instructors. To ensure maximum effectiveness in online classrooms, it is vital that we understand what motivates academic coaches so that we can create an environment to foster a positive experience for both academic coaches and students. Many academic coaches are either full-time graduate students or are employed full-time at another institution. Due to the relatively shorter duration for the position, lack of incentives, and other demands (e.g., their full-time job and family responsibilities), it can be challenging for academic coaches to feel motivated to perform well. Therefore, advancing our understanding about what motivates academic coaches is imperative so that we can maintain their effort in assisting the course with additional effort, and ensure better quality online education for students.

Previous studies provide little understanding of various aspects of graduate teaching assistants in an accelerated classroom with a large number of students, which is a common characteristic of online classes. Carpenter (2006) found that the majority of students prefer smaller class sizes but must enroll in larger classes due to the structure of their institutions. While a smaller online classroom size is found to be optimal (Russell & Curtis, 2013), it is not feasible for most institutions to provide smaller online classes because it is not cost-effective. Elison-Bowers and colleagues (2011) suggested that the institution can solve this issue by creating smaller sections with multiple teaching assistants in the online course. While countless studies have been conducted to determine how factors affect teaching assistants in traditional classroom settings (e.g., Louis & Matusovich, 2012; Mullin, Lohani, & Lo, 2006), few have been done to measure the factors that motivate teaching assistants. A similar study has been done to understand the motivation for graduate assistants in engineering for face to face classes (e.g., Kajfeza & Matusovich, 2017), but the results are not transferable to the large online course context.

This study aims to understand the factors that contribute to academic coaches’ intrinsic motivation in terms of their assistance with the course. Our research attempts to fill this gap in
the literature of graduate teaching assistants by studying the motivational factors for academic coaches in an accelerated online classroom. We reviewed the self-determination theory (Ryan & Deci, 2000) and approached different types of motivation of academic coaches. Self-determination theory explains how autonomous motivation (i.e., intrinsic motivation) and controlled motivation (i.e., extrinsic motivation) encourages the direction, intensity, and persistence of motivated behavior in different ways (Gagne & Deci, 2005). To develop such an understanding of what motivates an academic coach, we used a grounded theory approach to conduct an exploratory study by conducting 26 individual interviews with academic coaches. We currently develop survey questionnaires to examine how their different types of motivation (i.e., extrinsic, intrinsic, and prosocial) are related to overall job behaviors (i.e., job satisfaction, job commitment, and turnover intention) and performance.

The objective of this research is to determine which factors affect the motivation of an academic coach, and how different types of motivation can influence their job behaviors and overall course delivery effectiveness. The goal of this research is twofold. First, while the scope of our study may be limited in some aspects, it will open opportunities for further research and offer practical implementations of innovative ways to utilize academic coaches and improve efficiency for accelerated online courses. Second, instructors may be able to utilize the findings to shape their teaching methods and how to interact with teaching assistants to improve their classroom practices.

**Research Model**

```
Antecedents
Academic Coaches
Demographic factor

Intrinsic Motivation
(Interview)

Job Behaviors
a. Job Satisfaction
b. Job Commitment
c. Turnover intention

Job Performance
a. Task performance
b. Instructor Satisfacti
```
References:
Relational Leadership: A Model for Empowering People with Disabilities
Tamara J. Serghini
Gonzaga University

Abstract

Disability is not a minor issue that affects a small group of unfortunate individuals, it affects everyone with a body and the ability to relate to others. Society has an interest in advancing disability knowledge because it makes seen, unseen dominant structures that operate within communities and provides insight about possibilities where change can be made. Emerging from a social constructionist epistemology, this analysis shows how disability is constructed through shared assumptions about the social world. By conceptually exploring the relationship between leadership and disability, this work interrogates the absence of the disability narrative in modern leadership discourse and researchers’ overreliance on dominant paradigms. Originating from the understanding that all human beings are part of a greater whole, this work theorizes about an alternate paradigm; one that embraces the disability perspective as a facet of relational leadership development. The disability lens can enhance leadership practices by cultivating new understandings about human interaction that prioritizes the context of relationships as a path toward dismantling outdated structures and empowering people with disabilities to take the lead.

Keywords: Relational leadership, relationships, disability, social justice

We are living in a moment of true consequence as people from every facet of society are demanding recognition and raising questions about human interaction in an unequal world. Increased interdependency has created a space for new voices to express ideas about how to come together in times of “intractable challenge” and “insatiable change” (Kaufman, 2019). As we witness global uprisings around civil rights and experience a conscious reckoning with race, we also observe a disability movement in which people with disabilities are taking a decisive role in shaping their own realities; redefining the concept of disability from one of stigma and oppression to one that embraces disability as a tool of empowerment (Kaufman, 2019).
Humanity is standing at the crossroads of new possibilities and today’s leadership matters more now than ever if we are to “engage the human community in the work of individual and collective responsibility” (Ferch, 2015, xi) needed to shift narratives around disability and dismantle unjust social practices.

Traditional leadership discourse, often advising management policies and practices, has focused on leader qualities and behaviors relying on conventional understandings of leadership rooted in individuals, as a “self-contained entity” or as the “architect and controller of an internal and external order” (Uhl-Bien, 2006, p. 655). However, what happens when one cannot design or control order? When one falls outside of conventional understandings? How does one recreate or self-author different leadership identities within dominant paradigms? In this analysis, I explore the intersection between disability and leadership as a pathway for leader development, specifically that through relational practices, new knowledge about power and privilege can be produced. The disability narrative adds insight to leadership discourse by cultivating a language of empathy, it acts as a prism capable of deconstructing dominant structures and identifies new possibilities for change. Therefore, the disability narrative provides a valuable opportunity to rethink the conditions and consequences of leader practices in society today.

**Philosophical Underpinnings**

Developing a more holistic understanding of the relationship between disability and leadership is the purpose of this analysis, however, the concern of this work is not the disabled person as an object, but rather the system of cultural leadership processes that regulate the way one thinks about and thinks through the body (Davis, 1995). Kenneth Gergen (2009) makes a strong case for understanding the human being as a relational being. He contends that self is a social self whose sense of being is tied to interactions with the external world. He asks questions about the value of other people. “Are they not primarily instruments for our own pleasure or self-gain? If they do not contribute to our well-being, should we not avoid or abandon them?” (Gergen, 2009, xiv). Gergen interrogates the idea of the individual as the central component of the social world by examining the reliance on subject-object interactions where “social relations are enacted by
subjects to achieve knowledge about, and influence over, other people” (Uhl-Bien, 2006, p. 655). For Gergen, “we cannot step out of relationship, even in our most private moments we are never alone”, the origins of being are “not with the interior, but with others in co-action” (Gergen, 2009 p. 62).

Gergen’s analysis of the bounded self is a critique of the rational mind/body dualism through which Western narratives separate mental aspects of life from somatic ones, rendering understandings about the world to the “discourse of the mind” (Gergen, 2009, p. 1). Gergen (2009) purports that the mind is a manifestation of relationships that play out continuously making the self communal rather than individual. “It is from the relational process that the very idea of an “inner world is created” and “intelligible action is born, gathered, and or extinguished within the ongoing process of relationship” (Gergen, 2009, p. 63). His philosophical worldview provides valuable insight for leadership theory as it highlights the interconnected nature of the human consciousness and centers on the complex relationship between the self and the social world. The self is not only embedded in the world, but it is also as a product of the world, thus it provides insight about how knowledge is constructed through the world. Gergen elucidates that the “central challenge”, the vital task today, is to “bring relationship into clear view” (Gergen, 2009, xv). One way to accomplish this task is to emphasize the “social influence process through which emergent coordination (e.g., evolving social order) and change (e.g., new approaches, values, attitudes, behaviors, ideologies) are constructed and produced” (Uhl-Bien, 2006, p. 655).

Framing Disability

To be normal is to be able, and ableness is defined as “natural gifts, talents, intelligence, creativity, physical prowess…features essential to the human species (Sierbes, 2010, p. 315). Ability stands in contrast to disability which is linked to notions of illness, tragedy, and abnormality (Davis, 1995). At the core of the able/disabled binary is the question of what type of body is considered normal. While the disabled body is seen as imperfect, it can be said that the “problem is not the person with a disability” but rather the social process, the “way normalcy is constructed to create a “problem” with the disabled person” (Davis, 1995, p. 24) because the
concept of disability is derived from what we know of it through our relational experience with it.

Disability is not a minor issue that relates to small percent of unfortunate people, it is a “social process that intimately involves everyone who has a body and lives in the world of senses” (Davis, 1995, p. 2). It is part of a socially constructed discourse that emerged from notions of progress through “contemporary post-enlightenment science (Vehmas & Watson, 2016, p. 3). Sufficient research shows (Campbell, 2008; Kattari, 2015; Prokhovnik, 2014) that disability beliefs are ingrained in society through ableist structures that maintain and reproduce ongoing subjectification through everyday interactions. Ableism, the unearned privilege of those who do not have disabilities, continues to be “one of the most accepted and widespread” forms of discrimination in society today (Kattari, 2015, p. 375). It is seen as an ordinary and natural part of the culture making visible only the extreme and shocking forms of injustice while “business-as-usual” goes unnoticed (Campbell, 2008). Little attention has been given to the study of ableism even though extensive analysis has been extended to similar issues such as racism and sexism (Kattari, 2015; Mackey, 2018). Ableism, defined as a ‘net-work of beliefs, processes and practices that produces a particular kind of self and body (the corporeal standard) that is projected as the perfect, species-typical and therefore essential and fully human’ (Campbell, 2008, p.153) was founded on a network where “preference for ablebodiedness” was the “baseline by which humanness is determined” (Siebers, 2010, p. 314). Thus, the concept of ability, by which most “people shape their own existence is tied inexorable to disability, they are part of the same system” (Davis, 2013, p. 284). However, disability continues to be framed through epistemological models embedded with notions of ability that place disability outside of normative reality, as if it were an object to be seen; unconstrained by the relationship with world from which it emerges.

Medical Model of Disability

The medical model of disability is a deficit-based approach that relies on biological notions of normality (Seguna, 2014). Disability is viewed as an anomaly to be fixed or cured. The model
constructs the disabled individual as the *other* by striving to give everyone a “perfect” body (Siebers, 2010, p. 314). Disability is seen as, “a property of one body” (Siebers, 2010, p. 316) and bodies as ‘subjects’ to be intervened upon, categorized, and placed within a hierarchy of bodily traits that determines legitimacy and which bodies matter more (Loja, et al., 2013). Although the quality of life is improved through modern medicine, this perspective reduces a complex set of problems to an individualistic account of disability (Shakespeare, 2010, p. 218) curtailing the importance of the relational process through which the meaning of disability is determined.

**Social Model of Disability**

The social model emphasizes the social barriers that prevent people with disabilities from participating fully in society and disability is seen as the result of a hostile environment (Shakespeare, 2013). This model acknowledges that social structures constrain people with disabilities, however, it continues to validate a “compulsory identity that privileges able-bodiness” as it treats disability as an “unsocialized and universal concept” (Shakespeare, 2010, p. 220). Like the medical model, the social model ignores the relationality of the body as it is understood as “a taken-for-granted fixed corporeality” (Loja et al., 2013, p. 191). Shakespeare (2010) argued that models are ways of transforming ideas into practices, transmitting beliefs about the world. The medical model originates from the idea of individualized tragedy and the social model from imposed restrictions, both seek to “establish an objective truth” yet fail to recognize the possibility of “multiple realities in relation to one’s orientation toward truth” (Mackey, 2018, p. 6).

Disability is an important social justice issue and therefore it is inherently a leadership concern. Mladenov (2016) asserted that great attention has been given to challenge social inequality, yet critical theorists and social justice advocates have not engaged adequately with the increasing marginalization of disability. “Most thinkers and campaigners concerned with social justice have perceived their work as unrelated to what has routinely been regarded as a specialist domain of research” and there is a widespread assumption that “disability does not constitute ‘a serious
category of oppression” (Mladenov, 2016, p. 1227). The disability narrative is central to the social justice movement because “society is just only when it enables all of its adult members to interact with each other as peers” (Mladenov, 2016, p. 1227). Leadership, a primary mechanism for advancing social justice, has made little authentic and sustained progress toward increasing disability inclusion within the field (Campbell, 2008; Davis, 2013; Kattari, 2015; Siebers, 2010).

More than one billion people throughout the world, 15% of the global population, live with some form of disability (Moss, 2019). However, people with disabilities who sit on leadership boards, organizational committees or that hold prominent political positions are few yet and disability continues to be disregarded as an important leadership topic (Kattari, 2015; Moss, 2019). The connection between disability and leadership is valuable because disability, whether it comes from injury, illness or aging, is something that can be acquired by anyone (Shakespeare, n.d.) and the possibility exists for all people to join this group (Loja, et al., 2013). People with disabilities have unique experiences that offer valuable knowledge about human interactions and how power and privilege operate through them (Siebers, 2010), thus making visible unseen dominant perspectives (Davis, 2013) and providing an opportunity to rethink how one engages with others. Ultimately making disability fundamental to the leadership phenomenon.

**Critical Theory**

Disability is constructed from a complex web of relationships that emerges from interactions between the self and the social world. Understanding these relational dynamics makes it possible to recognize the differential treatment of people of disabilities through established practices (Campbell, 2008; Siebers, 2010). Critical Race Theory (CRT) is a framework that can be used to draw parallels between race and disability to emphasize how both are collective phenomena ingrained in society and maintained through everyday interactions that categorize people according to physical characteristics (Campbell, 2008; Kattari, 2015). CRT exposes how racism and ableism are not seen as irregular parts of society, but rather as socially constructed understandings that have become natural parts of the culture (Campbell, 2008). This framework emphasizes the unseen ways dominant structures uphold notions of normalcy as knowledge is mediated through social interactions.
Social Dominance Theory (SDT) analyses how groups in society oppress through systems that accentuate similarities and differences such as an age system, gender system, and an arbitrary-set system which includes race, class, religion, etc. (Kattari, 2015, p. 377). Ableist structures operate through dominant practices when the preference for ability is considered the norm (Kattari, 2015). For example, through media representations of prototypical leaders, educational practices that teach disability theory from a nondisabled perspective, or leadership structures that are void of the disability narrative (Campbell, 2008, Moss, 2019), the preference for able-bodiedness reinforces a reliance on traditional discourse which in turn impacts how disability is constructed and theorized.

Siebers’ (2010) Theory of Complex Embodiment exemplifies the socially constructed nature of identity and draws attention to the effects of the environment on an individual’s lived experience. Siebers emphasizes that “situated knowledge” comes from a mutual relationship between the mind and the body where what is known in the mind can be understood as the result of how the body is experienced in the world. “The disposition of the body determines perspectives with phenomenological knowledge—lifeworld experience—that affects the interpretation of the perspective” (p. 324). One learns one’s place in the world through the experiences that one lives, thus, it is reasonable to expect that people with disabilities learn to live a “disabled” reality in accordance with established norms where abled-bodied privilege shapes the relationship between both parties.

**Process of Disempowerment**

Power imbalances play a decisive role in the type of relationship that develops between the disabled self and the social world. Prokhovnik (2014) concluded that the body can be understood in terms of “embodied relationality” and argued that the body is fundamental for identity construction because it is a collective way of understanding one’s place in the world (p. 465). The intersection between identity and the body is a ‘site’ where social relations and cultural meanings merge to exert influence over the individual (McQueen, 2013; Prokhovnik, 2014). Identity is impacted by “collective behaving and beliefs” through daily norms that are “lived out
at the level of the body” (McQueen, 2013, p. 535). The body is constantly challenged by the presence and actions of a majority (Loja et al., 2013, p. 199) and one can be oppressed by the “mere influence of a person, institution or object” (McQueen, 2013, p. 534). It is important to think critically about the relationship between the mind and the body as it acts a mechanism for understanding the world through experiences. Prokhovnik (2014) purported that embodiment:

refers not simply to the materiality of individual corporeality, let alone to the autonomous’ liberal Western body critiqued by the ethics of care, but to the relational field of meanings and processes around embodiment which are at the same time both material and conceptual. (p.470)

Knowledge is mediated through the relationship between the material and conceptual. One’s qualities can enliven things associated with an individual, knowledge can emerge from a “field of meaning” rooted in habitual practices (Prokhovnik, 2014, p. 470), and understandings can be shaped by living experiences (Siebers, 2010, p. 330). Disabled embodied identity is produced when disability is denoted at the expense of other identities (Loja et al., 2013, p. 190). Common intersubjective interactions, such as the non-disabled gaze, draw attention to impairment and invalidate the disabled body as they originate from notions of ‘truth’ in normality (Loja et al., 2013, p. 193). Encounters that evoke emotions such as pity, charity, or sympathy hold the disabled body in a place where it is constantly viewed as an object (Loja et al., 2013, p. 193) and the persistent focus on impairment prevents one from seeing the person with disabilities as an “ordinary person with a full range of characteristics” (Smart, 2011, p. 156).

People with disabilities learn to see themselves through the eyes of others and internalize a process of “evaluating the self and the forms of one’s physicality from it” (Gantercer & More, 2019, p. 170). The experience of discomfort, self-consciousness, and heightened sense of difference impacts how meaning is constructed about the self and makes it difficult to separate the self from impairment (Gantercer & More, 2019). McQueen (2013) asserted that even the process of seeking to belong, be respected and recognized can actually be oppressive as disability becomes the “atypical” out-group quality that is a constant reminder that one does not
fit in (p. 534). Campbell (2008) concluded that people with disabilities internalize ableism as a response to oppression which results in “self-mortification and estrangement…[that] compels people…to adopt strategies of disavowal (p. 155). As people with disabilities attempt to fit into dominant discourse, they assume the “legitimacy of a devalued identity imposed by the dominant group” (Campbell, 2008, p. 156). “What connects all these instances is that individual agency and freedom are reduced because of their relationship with the external world (McQueen, 2013 p. 535) and the relational process of constructing disability through dominant discourse leads to the disempowerment of people with disabilities. However, it is precisely a relational process, a co-constructed, collective practice shared among people, that can reveal previously unseen instances of social injustice which perpetuate the abled-bodied perspective and impede how the “part and whole” could better fit together (Davis, 2013).

Leadership

“Leaders are relational beings” (Fairhusrt & Uhl-Bien, 2012, p. 1044) and effective leadership matters more now than ever if we are to interrogate limiting features of social interactions and build practices that are more socially-literate (Gilbney, 2019). Ospina et al., (2012) found, through a multimodal empirical study of non-profit social change organizations in the U.S., that the co-construction of the meaning making was essential for sustained social change because it highlights ways leader practices can be constructed to produce collective achievements (p.263). Co-constructed leadership “enables groups of people to work together in meaningful ways to produce leadership outcomes” (Fairhurst & Uhl-bien, 2012, p. 1044). Yet, there remains an important dearth of scholarly work related to leadership and its relationship to alternate identity groups. For example, the disability narrative is “woefully absent” from the field of leadership, and the scholarship that exists, focuses on how leaders should manage employees with disabilities instead of centering on how disability itself could enhance traditional understandings (Procknow et al., 2017). Some leadership theories advocate the importance of the leader, others focus on the function of followers, yet others move beyond individuals toward dialogue and service (Northouse, 2019). Northouse (2019) concluded that there are multiple ways to conceptualize leadership but common to all of them is that leadership is a process, it involves
influence, occurs in groups, and encompasses common goals (p. 5). One primary goal of leadership is to generate meaning. Leaders create meaning by clarifying purpose, advocating for change, and enabling individuals. Transformational leadership, for example, is rooted in connecting with others through shared meaning to motivate followers (Northouse, 2019). Servant leaders cultivate meaning by encouraging followers to develop their true potential and authentic leaders generate meaning through trust and transparency (Northouse, 2019). What these models reveal then, is that in addition to leadership being a vital way to construct meaning through relationships, it is also theorized through a prism of ability.

Leadership ability is identified through assumptions of commonality and it is related to notions of power and an individual’s capacity to influence others (Northouse, 2019). This stands in contrast to disability which is treated as an unsocialized phenomenon belonging to the imperfection of an individual (Davis, 1995). Authentic leadership, for example, is a model that focuses on leadership that is genuine and real. However, it rests on the notion of how well one can authentically express the true self (Procknow et al., 2017). Leader effectiveness is predicated on the individual’s ability to “meet the in-group prototype” such that followers see themselves in their leaders (Procknow et al., 2017, p. 368). Since the disabled body falls outside of the conventional bounds, authenticity is questioned. “Able-bodied people confer victimhood on perceived deficiency or diseased bodies” making it difficult to authentically express the disabled true self (Procknow et al., 2017, p. 367). People with disabilities are often unable to “instrumentalize” their body as an invisible expression of legitimacy and “being authentically one’s, self can be problematic if that self is informed by a way of being other than that of the dominate social grouping” (Procknow et al., 2017, p. 367). Thus, leadership is not equally attainable for the person who is seen for their disability because leadership continues to be framed in nondisabled terms. Dominant paradigms contribute to ableist structures when they emerge from individualistic assumptions that produce the alienation of the other who is pitted against the leader for not possessing the appropriate characteristics as defined by idealized standards (Nicholson & Kurucz, 2019).
Leadership is often constructed through normative depictions of mythic characters endowed with special skills. This reinforces the idea that leaders are separate and distinct from non-leaders; unconstrained by the relationship between the two. Spolestra (2018) went as far as to claim that it was the perception of the leader that had the power to lead. “The leader is always sacred because he is seen as extraordinary. Being seen as extraordinary is what separates him from the ordinary” (p. 93). Images impact, shape culture and inform how we think and act in everyday life (hooks, 2001, p. 96); they create a “natural attitude” that places leaders outside of the relational experience that defines them. Traditional theories based on “paradigms of perfection” that view leaders as “savior-like” with “prototypical identities” that validate success through the ability of the “knowing individual” with a capacity to “fit in” (Mackey, 2018, p. 2; Procknow et al, 2017) are predicated on a relationship of power (Loja et al., 2013; Uhl-Bien, 2006) making leadership accessible to those that hold power. Relationality is an overarching component that influences the effectiveness of leadership practices. The relationship between leadership theory and dominant leader identity is fluid and open as dominant narratives continue to construct individualized notions of leader characteristics. However, the relationship between alternate identities, such as disability and leadership are seen as separate and disconnected. See Appendix A for figure I that describes a unidirectional flow of relationality that constrict understandings that could rise up through leader interactions with disability. When leadership discourse emerges from knowledge of leaders as distinct and separate entities, as rational and knowing beings, it produces interactions that are enacted in pursuit of a knowable goal (Fairhurst & Uhl-Bien, 2012). Instead of exploring how leadership interactions come to be, within the complexity of human experience, dominant discourse minimizes the context upon which the interaction is built (Fairhurst & Uhl-Bien, 2012). Thus, to effectively expand leadership, practitioners should broaden contextual understandings to include thinking about who leaders are in relation to others.

Paradigm of “Imperfection”

This analysis theorizes about the prospects of an alternate paradigm; one that honors and prioritizes the “imperfections” of disability as a natural process of life that brings forward unique
intuition and insight about what it means to relate to others in an unequal world. The disability narrative does not exist exogenously, but rather what is known about it, comes from direct experience with it (Mladenov, 2016). Rather than assuming victimhood, disability can be claimed as a foundational experience that gives meaning and depth to the human experience. Leadership, as a tool for navigating complexity, stands to benefit from the life experience of disability; the experience of overcoming constant challenge and uncertainty can serve as a guide for greater attitudinal change, broader world views, and enhancing leadership design (Kaufman, 2019). Procknow et al. (2017) highlighted the idea that “tragedy transforms” and that within disability there are the “able-disabled” who “exclude attending to their disability” and focus on relationality as a way to fully participate in society (p. 370). “Supercrips”, are those who exemplify self-awareness, self-determination, and have successfully separated who they are and who they want to be from what the world thinks they are and wants them to be (Procknow et al., 2017, p. 370). By not allowing dominant discourse to impede relationality, supercrips are seen as “inspirational” and have a “positive effect on others” (Procknow et al., 2017). Although oriented toward established norms, supercrips do test prevailing stereotypes and challenge dominant understandings. People with disabilities exhibit resiliency by asserting themselves into a world that doesn’t welcome them, they align the emotions that underpin the experience of hardship with how they relate to others and draw on self-awareness and vulnerability as instruments to engage with the social world (Kaufman, 2019). These relational assets emerge by creating shared meaning through social interactions and focusing on what gives rise to the relationship itself, ultimately confirming the notion that “we are all embedded in a web of relationships” that “constitute who we are and are becoming” (Nicholson & Kurucz, 2019, p. 31).

The understanding that “all matters can be reduced to relationships” (Mackey, 2018, p. 7) counters the belief that leadership lies outside of the disabled reality. By emphasizing the context in which leadership is enacted, it is possible to contemplate the idea that if one’s relationships are defined by their “imperfections”, then imperfection itself becomes a way to know another, “to put oneself into an orientation” and to “uplift others” and “bring them into the circle” (Wilson, 2008, p. 81). As Wilson purports, “rather than viewing ourselves as being in relation with other
people or things, we are the relationships that we hold” (80). If society seeks equality, then society can longer afford to take for granted the boundaries of discourse heavily vested in “assumptions of individuality, in which leadership is a top-down influence of leaders while followers, process, and context appear secondary” (Fairhurst & Uhl-Bien, 2012, p.1043) because it minimizes the importance of emergent meanings that come into existence through the dynamic of interaction (Fairhurst & Uhl-Bien, 2012; Gergen, 2009).

**Relational Leadership**

To explore the intersection between disability and leadership as a way to conceptualize a framework, focus is placed on relationships as the path to effectively leading in complex societies. Traditional scholarship has investigated leadership by focusing on individual skills and behaviors that best predict leadership success (Seers & Chopin, 2012, p. 43). The assumption is that leader effectiveness rises up from the individual. However, this understanding restricts one’s ability to comprehend the paradoxical nature of the self in relationship to the social world. Leadership is not a property of an individual or a specific behavior, but rather a collective phenomenon that is shared between people, and it is deeply rooted in notions of power and culture (Fairhurst & Uhl-Bien, 2012, p.1044). Uhl-Bien and Ospina (2012) assert that traditional leadership models share the perspective that leaders are independent, autonomous entities that enter into relationships to influence others (p.6) and the results have been that leader practices seek a “singular objectively knowable reality” (Maxwell, 2012, p. 127). However, a relational orientation places emphasis on an interdependent process where “emergent practices reflect common understandings” and explores what influences the process of leadership (Uhl-Bien & Ospina, 2012, xxiii). From this perspective, relationships precede the individual and the social world is constructed around relating. “It is in the approach of one another that individuals can define themselves socially as separate entities: relationship comes first” (Uhl-Bien & Ospina, 2012, p. 8). Nicholson and Kurucz (2019) reflect that “the relation to others and the community which we are a part is not only a set of complex relationships…but is also the source of… identity” (p. 31), thus, relationships are both the context and outcome of one’s social experience
and they not only define who one is, but also become the foundation for how one engages with the world (Nicholson & Kurucz, 2019).

Uhl-Bien (2006) described two common leadership frameworks, an entity approach that emphasizes leader traits, behaviors, and attributes necessary to engage successfully with followers, and a constructionist approach that views “leadership as it happens” as a process between individuals that co-create a relationship as they interact (p. 654). A traditional model such as the Leader-Member Exchange is considered an entity approach because it views the quality of the relationship between the leader and follower as key to influencing outcomes, but it assumes that relationship is enacted to achieve specific goals (Northouse, 2019). This approach is limiting because it is over reliant on leader perspectives and it reduces interaction to a preestablished goal that emerged from separate and distinct entities (Ospina et al., 2012, p. 257). This model produces leader practices that are monologic and unresponsive to social complexities like disability because only one point of view is represented. (Canlifee & Eriksen, 2011; Uhl-Bien & Ospina 2012). Relational leadership, however, “validates the importance of leadership enacted to enhance relationships among individuals” (Uhl-Bien & Ospina, 2012, xxxiii). By focusing on the co-construction of meaning making, importance is placed not on the goal of the interaction but rather on the “the multiple meanings and perspectives that continuously emerge” (Uhl-Bien, 2006, p. 654) through the interaction. Relational leaders center on the knowledge that comes from others and what others perceive as important, their notions of values and judgements. Emphasizing the details in the construction of the leadership process itself helps to shift focus toward the context in which leadership is enacted, and highlights the importance of caring for the perspective of the other (Canliffe & Eriksen, 2011, p. 1431, Uhl-Bien, 2006, p. 654). Nicholson and Kurucz (2019) explain the significance of using care as a way to enhance relational leadership. One cares not only because one wants or one needs to, but because “we prioritize the relatedness” (Nicholson & Kurucz, 2019, p. 29). Care allows one to construct a “life of personal and interpersonal concern” (Arnett, 1986, as cited in Griffin, 1994, p. 70) cultivating a “space in between” where collaboration is enacted by relating to others such that individuals can resist the temptation to reduce interaction to terms of the self.
Relational leadership theory (RLT) as conceptualized by Uhl-Bien and Ospina (2012) illustrates a framework that is inclusive of diverse philosophical stances and explores relationships as the outcome of and the context for human interaction (p.8). RLT highlights the inherent relational dynamic present in leadership and emphasizes collective sense making through co-action (Ospina et al., 2012, p.257). As such, leadership remains located “in the ways actors engage, interact and negotiate with each other to influence…understandings and produce outcomes” (Fairhurst & Uhl-Bien, 2012, p.1044).

The mantra of today’s disability movement, “Nothing about us without us”, was coined by James Charlton (2000). This slogan highlights the collective nature of disability and acknowledges the significance of relationships. It means that no policy should be crafted without the direct participation of members of the group affected by the policy because there is important insight that arises from the lived experiences to which one is a member (Kaufman, 2019). The absence of the disability narrative in leadership discourse indicates that people with disabilities remain unable to “decide their own agenda” and must rely on members from outside their community to establish “truth” by assessing and proposing solutions for a reality to which they do not belong (Kaufman, 2019). Similarly, leadership itself misses the opportunity to discover the importance of the disability identity as a central theme of social justice and how alternate perspectives can be useful for organizational enhancement. Inherent in this process is the idea that effectiveness is defined through the individual and priority given to external definitions. However, as such, disability materializes from the “relational nature of a place and a space” (Mackey, 2018, p. 1), it is a reflection of society, dependent upon interactions within society and therefore becomes vital for understanding society.

Relational practices can transcend dominant discourse by grounding interactions in “rich interconnections among people” and challenging individuals to “radically rethink our notions of reality to suggest the origin of our experience is intersubjective rather than individual and cognitive” (Canliiffe & Eriksen, 2011, p. 1432). Placing primacy on the quality of relating to others as a key tenant of leader effectiveness can help guide leaders toward legitimacy by creating an “ethical selfhood…formed in how one treats others (Nicholson & Kurucz, 2019, p.
nurture a “two-way iterative process of mutual influence” where dialogue is enacted as an open-ended process through which “we do not know at the onset what the conclusion will be” (Nicholson & Kurucz, 2019, p. 38). As such, leadership paradigms shift from models of knowing toward prototypes of relationships that are “dynamic, developing and changing over time” (Fairhurst & Uhl-Bien, 2012). Canliff and Erikensen (2011) illumed that:

> Each conversation is both old and new – old in the sense of being based on past conversations and anchored in linguistic, cultural and social conventions – and new in the sense of being unique to the moment of speaking as we ‘craft’ our responses to what others are saying in that particular moment. In doing so, we create new meanings that can both carry through and shift across conversations as responses change. (p.1435)

Understanding leadership as a co-constructed process cultivated through relationships, demonstrates how leadership success cannot simply be the property of one or the behavior of another because each participant provides unique meanings that becomes part of the process itself. “Talking with people not to them, understanding that meaning emerges in specific moments of responsive conversation between people, and that everything that is said is in relationship to ‘others’: other people, other ideas, other conversations (Canliff & Erikensen, 2011, p.1435) is the key to successful leadership. The relational model refrains from the romanticization of leaders and works to de-emphasize the search for the right qualities by focusing on the space between individuals, where relationships with others occur. Ultimately, allowing one to consider the multiple realities present in leader interactions and that alternate perspectives can shape the context of and outcome from which understandings emerge.

**Conclusion**

Leadership discourse has not fully interrogated ableism in the same fashion as it has other inequality producing isms in society. As a result, the field of leadership remains limited in its scope and capacity as it does not fully account for the subjectivity inherent in the human consciousness nor the paradoxical nature of how meaning is constructed through the social
interactions. Dominant leadership practices, that often advise organizational policies and practices, remain entwined with ableist conventions that reproduce a binary view of disability through which impairment is seen as the problem of the disabled individual and not as the product of relationships that occur within the social world. As long as leader practices continue to be predicated on individualistic accounts where primacy given to the ability to express the self, emulate normative ideals, and pursue knowable goals, leadership will continue to reflect an able-bodied perspective and its capacity will be bound to the limitations of normativity, making disability a marker that ensures people with disabilities continue to remain underrepresented.

Change requires moving past leadership centric, context deficit models toward relational practices that work to rectify antiquated assumptions that impede people with disabilities from participating in leadership society. Seeking to understand how leadership happens, as it happens, places focus on what rises up from interactions between individuals. Relationally responsive practices can be sustained by centering on the context of leadership interactions so as to notice the subtleties, the ways in which power and culture influence relationships and the unfolding meanings that emerge in the moment. Striving to cultivate caring interactions with people with disabilities, relying on their unique insight, and including the voice of disability into leadership conversations are the first steps toward reconstructing disability in non-dichotomous terms. Understanding that notions of disability emerge from the social world and that “relationships form reality” (Wilson, 2008, p. 137) exposes the intersubjective nature of human interaction and the ways that it is possible to rethink notions of who leaders are in relation to others, and how alternate identities like disability impact not only leadership actors but also the context in which leadership itself is enacted. Future research, more deeply elaborating the connection between disability and leadership, would further establish the importance of relationality for leader development. Since relationships shape social circumstances and offer insight about collaborative action, relationality can allow disability to be claimed as a positive ontology, embraced as a tool of empowerment, and appreciated for its capacity to shed light onto complex social situations. Ultimately making disability an asset to leadership theory, one that is capable of
shifting the gaze from “impaired and incapable” to “active leaders in change” (Procknow et al., 2017, p. 372).

References


Appendix A: Figure I: Model of Relationality.

Relationality shapes leadership discourse. The solid arrow indicates a fluid relationship between dominant narratives and leader identity. However, unlike the relationship with dominant leadership narratives/identity, the dashed lines represent a disconnected and separated flow. Dominant leadership discourse creates a unidirectional flow that constricts the ability of the disability narrative to contribute to leadership understandings.
Exploring and Cultivating Types of Intelligence:
Creative Ways to Prepare Students for Real-World Leadership

Dustin Meredith
Southeast Missouri State University
Erin Rae Fluegge
Southeast Missouri State University

In the world of post-secondary education, much focus is put into teaching skills to students that will prepare them to be leaders. After all, this is one of the last chances students have to perfect their knowledge in their field of study before they enter the real world. So, the question arises, what can educators at the university level do to facilitate students’ retention of the valuable knowledge they learn in class and will inevitably need in their professional careers? It is important for educators, no matter what level of student they may be teaching, to know and understand the different types of learning styles students are equipped with. By educators having this foundational understanding of how different students learn, they can create activities and assignments that can engage all students. After all, the goal for educators is to teach so that all students leave understanding the material from each chapter, not just the ones who can read and take good notes.

The Eight Intelligences

Before stepping foot in a classroom an educator must understand the different ways students understand and absorb content. Researchers have studied the psychology of learning for centuries in an effort to understand different learning styles. As noted in Ali (2016, p. 839), an American psychologist named Howard Gardner wrote the book *Frames of Mind: The theory of multiple intelligences*, which completely transformed the concept of intelligence and fostered a new understanding of how people learn. Gardner (1983) identified the following eight intelligences that can generally categorize people’s understanding of the world around them and their ability to solve problems.
Linguistic intelligence: associated with the production of language. This type of intelligence shows itself through poetry, stories, jokes, or anything else that uses abstract reasoning and symbolic thinking. Linguistic intelligence is often used by public speakers, comedians, playwrights, and poets.

Logical-mathematical intelligence: associated with patterns and order between distinct pieces of information. It is often attributed to scientists, computer programmers, accountants, lawyers, mathematicians, and bankers.

Musical intelligence: associated with sensitivity to pitch, melody, rhythm, and tone. Musicians, composers, and music teachers have developed this type of intelligence.

Bodily-Kinesthetic intelligence: produces the ability to use the body to express emotions, compete in sporting events, or create something new. This intelligence is often found in actors, athletes, dancers, inventors, and entrepreneurs.

Spatial intelligence: the ability to accurately perceive the world and transform aspects of it. Often this intelligence is found in architects, artists, and cartographers.

Interpersonal intelligence: associated with the ability to notice contrasts in another person’s mood, temperament, motivation, and intention. These people have the ability to work well in teams and are masters at communicating both verbally and nonverbally. This intelligence is often attributed to councilors, teachers, therapists, politicians, and religious leaders.

Intrapersonal intelligence: allows one to step back from themselves and evaluate their own actions as an outside observer. This intelligence involves knowledge of internal aspects of one’s self such as knowledge of feelings, range of emotional responses, and sense of spiritual realities. Often attributed to philosophers, psychiatrists, and spiritual councilors.

Naturalist intelligence: attributed to people with a strong sense of wonder, awe, and respect for the natural world. Farmers, hunters, zookeepers, gardeners, cooks, and nature guides are examples of professions where this intelligence can be found.

When studying the eight different intelligences, one may notice that they can identify multiple intelligences within themselves. This is an important concept to understand as there is no one best way to teach a student, and no student is a perfect mold of just one intelligence.
Often, even one student may need to utilize multiple intelligences to fully understand a new concept being taught to them. As Ali (2016) further explains, scores on a test no longer define if a student is smart. Being smart is now determined by the variety of ways in which a student can learn, or how many intelligences they possess. While students may excel in a particular intelligence, educators must foster understanding in all intelligences if students are to be successful as leaders after they graduate. To only cater to one intelligence would be a disservice to both students who are gifted in that intelligence along with the ones who are not.

**Creating an Environment That Caters to the Eight Intelligences**

Leadership is often a subject that people dismiss as unteachable. The phrase “born a leader” has had negative implications on others who do not feel immediately comfortable taking a lead. Erika Anderson, author of *Leading So People Will Follow*, has observed people in business for over 30 years and has noticed something about leadership qualities within people. Anderson (2012) describes leadership capability within people as the shape of a bell curve. While there are gifted people who have the natural ability to lead, and there also exist people with no naturally ability to lead (these would be the outlying 10%-15% of the bell curve), a majority of people fall within the middle of the curve. That is, most people have the capabilities to lead but do not have the opportunity to lead or the knowledge that they even can.

Inchaouh and Tchaïcha (2020) explain that the duty of instructors is to facilitate a learning environment in which students acquire the diverse skills demanded of the global workplace. An approach to this daunting task is to construct tangible student collaborations with peers from different cultures and expose them to the potential linkages between different disciplines through hands-on learning tasks. Using knowledge of the eight intelligences mentioned before, one can start to create activities catered to the multiple intelligences’ students may possess while also providing them with a controlled environment to practice and perfect their skills.

**Engage the Senses.** This tactic is more geared toward the naturalistic, spatial, and musical intelligences, but can be useful for anyone. Research has shown that sensory stimuli in association with learning releases chemicals in the brain that aid in the retention of knowledge.
The use of music, scents, lighting, and a multitude of other variables can affect the ability of a student to focus in a classroom. Creating a comfortable environment that can be immediately perceived by the student can help them escape from the outside world and set them up for full engagement in class content. An act as simple as opening the windows or playing music before class can provide students with the opportunity to distinguish one class from another, one topic from another, and physiologically sets students up to learn.

**Experiential learning** is one way that educators can provide tangible value to students while still providing new material. Kolb and Kolb (2011), as cited in Inchaouh and Tchaïcha (2020, p. 41), define Experiential Learning Theory as “the process whereby knowledge is created through the transformation of experience. Knowledge results from the combination of grasping and transforming experience.” Assignments where students get to tackle real-world issues can offer the most motivation and creative processing, and it allows for the traditional classroom to be forgotten and instructors can become co-learners with their students. An example of this could be dividing a class into small groups with a leader and assigning each group to develop a business plan for a local small business interested in a new venture. Developing far-reaching and comprehensive project like this provides students with the opportunity to engage all of their intelligences while also observing new intelligences from group members who have different skill sets than them. It also provides students with an opportunity to add to their resume and to practice skills they will inevitably use in their careers.

**Peer-to-Peer Discussion** is a great way to allow students to learn from each other and also break up long lectures, increasing student engagement. Amabile and Khaire (2008) explain that innovation is more likely when people of different areas of expertise share their thinking. Bruffee (1973), as cited in Inchaouh and Tchaïcha (2020, p. 38), defines collaborative learning as “a form of indirect teaching in which the teacher sets the problem and organizes the students to work it out collaboratively.” Collaborating with peers who have different intelligences can solidify understanding of a topic and allow more ideas to be freely shared and examined. Allowing groups of two to three students to discuss the topic being presented engages people with intelligences that are prone to keeping to themselves due to being unsure of their
understanding by making sure their thoughts are valid before sharing with the entire class. Being comfortable around one’s peers is also essential to a healthy class environment.

**Clear expectations** are important for students no matter which intelligence they possess. Diefes-Dux (2019) indicates that a well-designed standards-based grading system sets clear expectations and enables self-monitoring of a student’s learning progress. Outlining at the beginning of each class what will be covered and ending the class with what needs to be completed for the next meeting ensures students are set up for maximum success. Making sure assignments have a clear set of expectations and students are given the opportunity for questions pertaining to an assignment or topic being discussed is also essential. The logical-mathematical intelligence is especially benefitted by this tactic as their need for patterns and order is essential in their understanding of topics.

**Identifying talent.** Amabile and Khaire (2008) state that the first priority of leadership is to engage the right people, at the right times, to the right degree of work. As an educator one has the responsibility to identify when students have a unique untapped potential and encourage them to grow and develop an understanding of their capabilities. For example, if the professor of a general-education speech class recognizes that a student is gifted in public speaking, that professor might personally reach out to the student and present them with an opportunity to further develop their speaking skills by suggesting a student organization or field of study that can provide that student with the opportunity to perfect their untapped talent. Some students need a push in the right direction to jump-start future personal success.

**Implications and Summary**

While there are infinite possibilities to engage students, one should always keep in mind how a chosen activity can impact the maximum number of students. By understanding the multiple intelligences that exist, educators can modify and adapt activities as necessary allowing students to find their full potential. Leaders can be made, but they must be provided with the proper tools in order to become fully aware of their potential. By providing an education catered to all intelligences, educators are setting students up with the experience and familiarity to the endless ideas and creative tactics needed to innovate in the real-world. Exposure to working in a
group where others don’t think the same as one may be used to, developing innovative ideas through collaboration in a group setting, and allowing students to explore which intelligences they can personally excel in is how educators can best cultivate more knowledgeable students in a university setting and set them up for success in the real world.

References


Leadership in Public Organizations: 
Evidence for the Limits of Transformational Change

Patrick G. Scott
Missouri State University

Abstract

Over the past several years researchers have explored the concept of transformational leadership and its centrality to organizational change. Several studies have advanced our understanding regarding the impact that environment factors have on leaders’ ability to engage in transformational change. To date, however, there has not been much attention devoted to the relationship between sectoral context (i.e., private, public, not-for-profit) and the efficacy of transformational leadership on organizational change. This paper attempts to advance our understanding by discussing how various kinds of dynamics/ influences associated with the public sector context limit the application of transformational leadership behaviors and outcomes.

The topic of leadership is, perhaps, one of the most studied topics in the realm of management and the social sciences. Its effect on organizations cannot be overstated. Burns (1978), for example, notes that leadership is one of the most observed and least understood phenomena on earth. Nevertheless, we depend upon leaders to develop a clear organizational vision, work across multiple constituencies, and inspire and motivate workers to accomplish an organization’s mission and maximize its effectiveness.

Despite the overall importance of leadership, we should note how certain factors, conditions, or contexts may limit its potential toward achieving effective change. For example, does an organization’s external environment facilitate or limit the ability of leaders to engage in organizational change? To what extent can leaders alter the culture of their organizations to
achieve effective change, and how might this ability depend upon the sector to which an organization belongs (public, private, not-for-profit)?

The purpose of this paper is to explore the topic of transformational leadership and how its impact is influenced by sectoral context. Much research attention has been devoted to transformational leadership because it holds out the promise of being one of the most effective forms of leadership, and there have been several empirical studies that have examined the impact of transformational leadership in the public sector. Unfortunately, much of that research has not only been beset by some empirical limitations, it also has shown a tendency to overlook the importance of contextual influences that cannot be easily discounted. Because of these limitations, this paper calls for a modest reappraisal of the nature of transformational leadership as it applies to the public sector.

In terms of organization, the paper will discuss some of the differences between, and commonalities among, transformational, transactional, and charismatic styles of leadership. The paper will then consider how some of the unique constraints that emanate from the public sector moderate the extent to which transformational leadership can be fully realized.

**Transformational, Transactional, and Charismatic Leadership**

The premise of this paper is to show that transformational leadership is limited by contextual constraints, with particular focus devoted to the role of sector. Thus, as a first step, it is useful to draw upon research that describes what transformational leadership is and how it differs from transactional and charismatic leadership.

Some of the earlier work on transformational leadership viewed leadership as taking place within two categories: transactional leadership and transformational leadership (e.g., Burns, 1978; Bass, 1985). Transactional leaders use rewards and incentives to exert subordinates to do work on the organization’s behalf, and this very much involves a relationship of mutual exchange. In a transactional culture, job assignments are explicitly spelled out along with conditions of employment, benefit structures, codes of conduct, etc. Rewards are contingent upon meeting or exceeding performance standards. Commitment and loyalty among workers are likely to be superficial. Work is performed according to clearly specified procedures, and there is a strong
acceptance and commitment to those expectations. Innovation and risk-taking are not actively encouraged.

Transforming leaders, on the other hand, seek to create and harness shared purposes. By promoting a worthy cause and using inspirational forms of persuasion, transforming leaders achieve a unified sense of direction that permits large-scale change (Bass, 1996; Bass & Avolio, 1990, 1993). “With this approach, leaders transform their followers by activating higher order needs, emphasizing the value of certain outcomes, and influencing the followers to put the organization beyond their own self-interest” (Carlson & Perrewe, 1995: 820). In a transformational organization, there is a sense of purpose, a feeling of family, and a long-term commitment to the organization. There is much talk about purpose, vision and meeting challenges.

Other researchers (e.g., Tichy & Ulrich, 1984; Tucker & Russell, 2004) echo the similarity of the contrast between transactional and transformational leadership. They note that transformational leadership involves the idea of developing a vision and using that vision to mobilize the organization toward fundamental change and institutionalizing those changes that last over time. Compared to transactional leadership, transformational leaders make fundamental changes that affect the basic structural, technical, political and cultural systems within the organization. By contrast, transactional leaders work within existing cultural norms, whereas transformational leaders seek to change their culture with a new vision and a new set of shared assumptions, values, and rules (Bass & Avolio, 1993).

Bass (1996) was one of the first to operationalize the concept of transformational leadership and noted that it contained four basic dimensions: (1) Individualized Consideration, where leaders focus on the needs on each follower; (2) Idealized Influence, where leaders become role models and set the example for their followers; (3) Intellectual Stimulation, where leaders encourage followers to see their work from new perspectives and be willing question basic assumptions and beliefs; and (4) Inspirational Motivation, where leaders articulate a vision that is appealing and provides a sense of meaning and purpose to the followers. These dimensions were found to be quite distinct from that of transactional leaders.
In this same study Bass proposed three dimensions of transactional leadership, two of which dealt with the idea of a leader monitoring performance of employees and taking corrective action either while tasks were being performed or after the fact. The third dimension “Contingent Reward”, is based on the idea of leaders setting clear standards for performance and providing intrinsic and material rewards for the work that is performed.

Charismatic leaders share some similarities to transformational leaders. According to Chemers (1997) both types of leaders are visionary, both have strong communication skills, both are risk-propense, and both have an action orientation. The fundamental difference is that one inspires while the other brings about fundamental changes. Northouse (2015), in fact, views charismatic leadership as a necessary, but not sufficient, condition for transformational leadership to emerge.

Yet, as with transformational leadership, charismatic leaders go beyond a simple reward-performance orientation that is associated with transactional leadership. Charismatic leaders are effective in making emotional appeals to their subordinates and in creating an emotional attachment between the leader and his/her followers. By doing so, charismatic leaders create a strong commitment by employees to both the leader’s values and the organization’s goals (Bass, 1985; Conger and Kanungo, 1998; House, 1992). An important difference, however, is that charismatic leaders prompt followers to work on behalf of the leader, whereas transformational leaders prompt followers to work on behalf of the organization (Carlson & Perrewe, 1995).

In sum, charismatic leadership is based on the personal identification of followers with the leader, and there is some debate about whether this is or is not a component of transformational leadership. Bass (1985) seems to see this as a component of transformational leadership, while Sashkin (1992) sees it as completely distinct from transformational leadership. While the growing body of research seems to see these are two distinct orientations, there remains a fair amount of disagreement regarding the nature of those distinctions.

**The Importance of Context, Including Sector**

A rather seminal article regarding the importance of context on transformational leadership is provided by Pawar and Eastman (1997). In this article the authors suggest that transformational leadership is augmented or constrained by a variety of contextual conditions that emanate from
several sources. While they do not address the role of the public sector per se, they identify several areas that have clear parallels to the public sector context. Their basic points are summarized as follows.

As a starting point, the authors emphasize four particular organizational domains, and while these are largely internal in nature, there are some clear connections to external organizational conditions as well. These four domains are: (1) an organization’s emphasis on efficiency and adaption; (2) the relative dominance of an organization’s technical core and boundary spanning units; (3) the structure of an organization; and (4) mode of governance. The authors argue that each of these domains affects an organization’s receptivity to transformational leadership. Specifically, the authors suggest that organizations will be more receptive to transformational leadership if they have more of an adaption orientation than an efficiency orientation. They also suggest that organizations where boundary-spanning units are dominant will be more receptive to transformational leadership than organizations with dominant technical cores. In terms of structure, the authors propose that organizations with more simple structures are more likely to be receptive to transformational leadership when compared to more complex, mechanistic organizations. Lastly, using the framework of Wilkins and Ouchi (1983) the authors suggest that organizations with a clan mode of governance will be more receptive to transformational leadership than either market or bureaucratic forms of organization. In other words, context matters.

If we were to apply this template to public sector organizations, the conclusions would suggest the difficulty for transformational leadership to emerge and/or be highly successful. That is because most public organizations provide a fairly close match of the conditions to which Pawar and Eastman allude. Public organizations tend to maintain a strong emphasis on efficiency over adaption, they tend to be structurally complex and mechanistic in nature, and they tend to rely more on the traditional bureaucratic control rather than clan control. In such non-receptive contexts, it is hard to generate commitment of organizational members to a transformational vision. Accordingly, while it is not impossible for transformational leadership processes to be successful in these contexts, the transformational leader will need to undertake a thoroughly
destructive process to induce fundamental change. In more receptive contexts, (e.g., organizational units that perform boundary-spanning functions), the template suggests a greater likelihood of receptivity and success, but in less receptive contexts the process of transformational leadership is likely to be incremental in nature and probably can only go so far. These are, of course, propositions that need to be tested by empirical research. But interestingly, there is a significant amount of current empirical evidence that involves comparisons between public and private organizations, and the evidence from these studies illustrate some of the dynamics that are likely to constrain the application of transformational leadership in the public sector. Some of that evidence is provided below.

**Constraints Associated with Public Organizations**

Several researchers have noted core differences between public and private sector organizations (Dahl & Lindblom, 1953; Rainey, Backoff, & Levine, 1976). For example public organizations are inherently different from private ones owing to the presence of legal and political constraints placed on government agencies by the courts, legislatures, executive oversight agencies, and various constituent groups. Such constraints result in greater oversight, less autonomy, and reduce authority among public managers, and they lead to higher levels of formalization, red tape and bureaucratization.

These distinctions have been corroborated by several empirical studies. Research has shown, for example, that public managers tend to perceive or experience less flexibility in terms of personnel procedures (Coursey & Rainey, 1989), lower levels of job satisfaction (Rainey, 1983; Smith & Nock, 1980), lower levels of job involvement (Buchanan, 1975), less linkage between rewards and performance (Rainey, 1983) and less authority over personnel (Coursey & Rainey, 1989).

Because of such differences, public managers experience greater difficulty in developing incentives for effective performance and linking employee performance with rewards (Golembiewski, 1969; Mainzer, 1973; Rainey, Backoff, & Levine, 1976). Moreover, personnel systems in the public sector tend to be more centralized (Pugh, Hickson, & Hinings, 1969) and marked by higher levels of formalization and complexity (Emmert & Crow, 1988; Rainey, 1983,
Consequently, public organizations are characterized as less innovative, less performance-oriented (Rainey, Backoff, & Levine, 1976), and as more risk averse than private sector organizations (Fottler, 1981). Overall, these are the kinds of conditions and constraints that seem to lessen the receptivity to transformational leadership, as well as discourage its success.

In terms of the federal setting, it is also useful to note the unique dynamics that take place between political appointees and senior career executives. Political appointees serve as at the pleasure of the president, and senior merit-based career officials are tasked with carrying out the will of their political superiors. The very nature of this relationship suggests limited prospects for successful transformational change, given the expected acquiescence of career officials to political authority. As Pfiffner (1987) and Heclo (1977) point out, the relationship between senior managers and political appointees can be tense and conflictual, particularly when fundamental disagreements arise over public policies and expected directions of policy change. Many case studies have amply illustrated the frustrations of public managers when pressured by their less-seasoned political superiors to alter policies that run counter to the former’s conception of the public interest (e.g., O’Leary, 2019). Such an environment does not provide fertile soil for transformational leadership to thrive. Successful transformational leadership is marked by long-term, fundamental changes in the operation, processes, and culture of public sector organizations. Given the nature of the patronage/merit relationship, it seems hard to imagine how transformational change could be accomplished on a regular basis.

We could also examine the power of external constituencies and the role they play in shaping public policies and processes. Interest groups, for example, seek to ensure that public decisions are tailored to their interests. Models of policy-making, such as “iron triangles” and “issue networks” (Heclo, 1978) attest to their powerful influence in shaping programs and policies. In some areas, such as regulatory policies, these external constituencies can become so powerful that they come to dominate internal agency decision making and thereby shape agency outputs that reflect their prerogatives. It is not surprising, then, that federal budgets and policies are characterized by limited, incremental change because they tend to uphold vested interests.
generally, public policies tend to reflect an equilibrium of interests as various forces shape the push and pull of policy making. For agencies operating in such environments, the soil is not particularly fertile for leaders to be able to enact transformational change. Transformational leadership is designed to upset that equilibrium, not to maintain it or make marginal adjustments to it. Transactional leadership operates within present structures; transformational leadership seeks to change that in a fundamental way.

Lastly, it should be noted that the concept of accountability is pervasive throughout the public sector, and this implies the limited exercise of discretion, the need to uphold values such as due process and the rule of law, and the need to ensure that public servants maintain their role as guardians of the public trust. These are the kinds of values that tend toward a transactional and managerial orientation (Van Wart, 2003). Because public administrators are entrusted with the authority of the state, it is difficult to envision the adoption of behaviors such as risk taking and innovation, except in a limited way.

Conclusion
What this paper has tried to demonstrate is the way that context, and in particular, the public sector context, constrains the prospects for true transformational leadership to flourish in the public sector. Certainly, there is plenty of evidence to document the existence of transformational leadership behaviors, but there is a paucity of evidence with respect to the intended outcomes resulting from those behaviors. Perhaps, then, we should consider a modest reappraisal of the nature of transformational leadership in the public sector and be a bit more reserved in our approach in trying to oversell the value of transformational leadership in public organizations.

At the same time, we also see how factors such as public service motivation and the need to rely on intrinsic motivators reinforce the view that even the limited exercise of transformational leadership behaviors has important utility for enhancing the effectiveness of public organizations. In fact, despite some methodological limitations, there are a number of studies that illustrate the connections between transformational leadership, public service motivation, organizational loyalty and commitment, and pro-social behaviors such as whistle-blowing.
Transactional leadership may rule the day, but that does not mean we cannot take elements found in transformational behaviors and apply them when possible.

In sum, there is the need for a more modest characterization of transformational leadership as it applies to the public sector context. Perhaps the current behaviors that reflect transformational leadership might be more appropriately labeled as *Public Service Leadership*. Public Service Leadership represents a hybrid between transactional and transformational leadership; it is not fully transformational but it speaks to the essence of stewardship and seems compatible with important constructs such as public service motivation and the use of intrinsic motivators. Perhaps future research can refine this concept and operationalize, over time, a measure of Public Service Leadership. This form of leadership would certainly be similar to some of the dimensions that comprise measures of transformational leadership, but they are not the same constructs. Perhaps over time, the concept of Public Service Leadership might ultimately supplant the notion of transformational leadership in studies involving public sector organizations. From there, we might even envision the development of a robust research agenda that would ultimately add to our conceptual and empirical understanding of what makes for effective leadership in the public sector.
REFERENCES


Correlation Between Corn Prices and Farmland Values: 1980 to 2020

Harry E. Fisher
Eureka College
Scott P. Fitzgerald
Eureka College

This paper takes a closer look into how commodity prices, specifically corn, impact farmland values. This is a very important aspect of farmland value to consider since the US is the largest corn producer in the world and corn production is vital to many industries around the globe. This paper looks into the factors that determine how corn and farmland are valued and just how much they are connected to each other. This paper takes a historic look at these correlations and tries to analyze past and present price patterns in order to better understand future probabilities.

Consider how farmland is valued. There are many factors that go into this process. The first factor that we would like to discuss is the percentage of farmland that is owned by farmers themselves. This is an important factor to understand, because farmers now own around 80% of farmland. They continue to show willingness to purchase farmland and appear to have lower expectations on ROE than non-farming investors do. If farmers were to become hesitant to invest in farmland, the demand shift could put substantial downward pressure on farmland prices (Schafer, 2019).

Consider supply and demand. In grandfather’s day there was an adage “Well, they are not making any new farmland” which was intended to encourage buyers in the face of rising prices. While the adage is true, farmland value, like any other asset, is ultimately worth no more than the current value of projected long run return. The key factor to consider in regard to supply is the land turnover, so how much is sold over a period of time. One thing that is affecting turnover rates now and will continue to do so in the future is the amount of currently aging baby boomer farm owners. There is currently a substantial number of older farm owners which will likely cause greater than average amounts of farmland to be offered for sale. This could drive down
prices nationally, with impacts varying substantially between regions. The determining factor as to how much of that farmland will ultimately be offered for sale will depend on returns from farmland at that time compared to returns from investments. Current returns from farmland versus alternative investments should substantially influence the decisions of non-farming heirs as they decide whether to hold or liquidate the farmland asset. Non-farming investors, insurance companies and pension funds own farmland across the US. They may be less patient than farmers tend to be when it comes to return on investments in farmland. Any factors that may cause greater volumes of land to be offered for sale could start a substantial immediate decline in farmland values. In regard to demand, the main thing that farmland has going for it is its steady rise in value since the bubble burst in the 80’s. Farmland has seen a very steady return on investments since 1988. Farmland may be a very attractive asset for investors looking to diversify their portfolios. Other factors such as farm income and interest rates that affect demand also. There are many factors that go into the supply and demand of farmland and these factors will be explored throughout this paper.

A substantial factor affecting farmland prices is interest rates. Low interest rates are supporting current farmland prices and projections are for interest rates to remain near the current historic lows into the foreseeable future. This is a positive force for increasing farmland values, as investors compare farmland purchases to risk-free investments such as treasury bonds. As the rates of risk-free investments start to climb investors start to want higher returns on other riskier assets also, such as farmland. This was seen in the early 1980’s when interest rates rose and farmland prices declined substantially.

The overall economy has an impact on farmland prices. When the economy is strong, there is continuous real estate development. In recent years, there has been a continuous amount of real estate development occurring around many metropolitan areas throughout the United States. This has caused many acres of farmland to be sold for real estate development in various urban areas. IRS section 1031 has made it worthwhile for farmers to sell off land for development as they can sell it and forego the capital gains taxes if they turn around and reinvest that money in other farmland, typically further away from city centers (Gloy, 2011).
There are a number of factors which interact to determine corn prices. Corn has many uses, with about two-thirds of the corn that is harvested in the United States utilized for either ethanol production or feed for livestock.

Regarding ethanol, as of now the US is far and away the largest producer and consumer of corn-based ethanol. In order to decrease dependence on foreign oil and for the betterment of the environment the United States began a program in 2005 called the Renewable Fuel Standard (RFS). This plan slowly increases the amounts of ethanol and other biofuels to be blended with gasoline and other miscellaneous petroleum fuels. The amount of ethanol is restricted to not exceed E10 or a 10% blend which has been the current regulation for several years. This has caused ethanol consumption to be stagnant for the last few years. The EPA has stepped in and plans to increase the limits set by the RFS which would raise the demand for the fuel. There have been proposals to move the blended barrier to 15% ethanol which would require an estimated 20% higher production of feed corn in the US, which comes to an estimated 16 million acres devoted to growing corn. China is also trying very hard to increase production of ethanol. They have plans in the works to go to E10. This will likely take a number of years, as they are at a nationwide E3 right now. China has the same reasons for making this switch to ethanol as the United States, and the rest of the world may not be that far behind. It is far better for the air quality, it can create more energy independence and if you can grow corn in your country it supports local agriculture. As more countries around the world become more and more developed, they may start to depend more on alternative fuels such as ethanol also (Yu, 2019).

There is also a very large portion of the corn that is grown in the United States that goes to feed animals. Around 36% of the corn produced in the United States is feed corn for animals. Much of this corn-based feed is used in hog production. This is another area where China’s demand may impact corn prices in the United States. China’s demand for corn declined in recent years as there was depopulation of hog herds in many regions due to African Swine Fever. China is now in the process of trying to rebuild the hog population as quickly as possible and this requires substantial amounts of corn. There are also a large number of other countries around the globe that are starting to become more developed. As countries become more
developed their incomes go up, as incomes go up people improve their diets by eating larger amounts of protein. Much of this protein comes from animals, which are fed with grains such as corn (Foley, 2013).

The value of the United States dollar is another factor in how corn is valued. The weakening of the United States dollar in recent years has put a higher demand on corn because corn is sold in United States dollars. Thus, as the United States dollar weakens, foreign currencies have greater buying power, making corn relatively cheaper for buyers outside of the United States.

Climate and weather changes are another factor that can have an impact on corn prices. Unexpected heavy rains can delay planting, unexpected droughts can drastically reduce yields. Another reason that China has been importing more corn than expected is because of being hit by typhoons and major amounts of flooding. These types of unexpected and unavoidable weather circumstances can cause prices to spike because of the lack of supply.

Government policies also impact the price of corn received by farmers. There are subsidies, tariffs, embargoes, monetary policies not only in the United States but in foreign governments also. Government policies may change quickly. Changes in United States policies or those in foreign countries have the potential to change the outlook on corn prices in the United States at any time (Corn, 2020).

We will now begin to examine the correlation, or lack thereof, between corn prices and farmland valuations. You would think that these two would go hand-in-hand, but perhaps they do not have as close of ties as you would think. This graph shows farmland values, corn values and inflation adjusted prices for both from 1980 up to 2020.
The really interesting thing about this graph is that aside from the drop in land value in the early to mid-eighties, land prices have been steadily increasing, as where corn prices are almost the exact same as they were in 1980. This almost seems like it can’t be right. The even crazier thing is that in states like Illinois where land prices are some of the highest in the country, the numbers are even more skewed. In 1980, an acre of farmland in Illinois went for $2,041 and in 2020 it is going for $7,400. Also, that $7,400 is a statewide average. There have been recorded sales in Illinois in 2020 for up to $20,000 an acre (Doran, 2020). So how is it that farmland can be appreciating that much and the corn that it grows isn’t getting sold for any more money than it was forty years ago?

The main issue here is supply and demand. If you take a look the yields in the 80’s compared to now they are around double the bushels per acre. Larger yields seem like it would be a great thing and what all farmers should strive for. It is what all farmers strive for but it is also what is driving the price down because of the abundance of corn that we are producing as a nation. We continue to see record harvests that allow us to stockpile corn and keep the supply higher than the demand. As long as we continue to do this, prices will stay low. Farmers are either selling off
their farmland to settle up and move on, or buying up more farmland and getting better at being economical and efficient in order to turn a profit. As a farmer, you need to watch prices very closely and decide when and how is the proper time and way to sell. This can be a very difficult thing to predict as prices are always fluctuating due to the many factors discussed previously. You also need to have a place to store all of that corn if you are not going to sell it right away and with farm sizes constantly growing, that is becoming a more and more difficult task (Kluis, 2020).

If you look at the graph you will see that there have been years where corn prices were much higher such as the years right around 2012. This was because of droughts and a limited supply of corn during those years. In 2012, US farmers were suffering through the worst drought in over 50 years. After that, rainfall started to normalize and with it, the corn prices did too. This information just further illustrates the issue that is going on with corn prices in the US. Sometimes, the best thing that farmers can hope for is a disaster somewhere other than where they are in hopes that it will drive prices up (Yousuf, 2012).

One thing that has had a negative impact on corn prices through the pandemic is the decreased demand for ethanol. With so many people being quarantined and not driving nearly as much they are not using nearly as much gas as usual. There are many people who are working from home and people are also not going on vacations or even to visit family for the holidays like they would in a regular year. This has led to a sharp decline in gasoline usage which is the driver for ethanol sales (Irwin, 2020). One more thing that made the corn prices drop is the decrease in chicken and hog feed. This was due to farmers having to euthanize animals because of decreased demand from the closing of restaurants and meatpacking plants.

As was briefly mentioned previously in this paper, China is a large purchaser of US corn and they could help the price rebound for the next year or so as they fight to repopulate their hog population. It is estimated that China purchased around 7.2 million metric tons of corn in 2019 and that figure could jump up to 30 million or so in 2021. This should help to drive the price of corn up for those who have the ability to store the grain (China’s, 2020).
That last point is also testament to the gamble that is selling corn and exactly when to do it. There are a few different options that farmers have when it comes to selling. They can lock in a price early in the season if they think that the price is as good as it is going to get, they can sell their corn at harvest for a cash price at that time, they can store the grain and wait for the cash price that they want, or there are some hybrid options available as well that involve price floors and allow for prices to go higher if the price goes way up. Farmers can also do a mixture of these options also to hedge their bets or if they need cash at any given time. The market can be fairly volatile and unpredictable sometimes so hedging your bets may be the best option (Usset, 2018).

One of the main things keeping farmers afloat has been government subsidies. These are government payments dedicated to a specific industry. The subsidies that have been paid out to farmers recently have been massive. The estimated amount of subsidies to be paid out to farmers in 2020 is $37.2 billion. There will also be an additional $14 billion added to that for relief because of COVID which would bring the total to $51.2 billion. There are pros and cons to subsidies. Some of the pros are that farmers are susceptible to all kinds of variables in their line of work and this is something that is put in place to help protect their livelihood. These farmers are the ones who help to feed the world and without them much of the world would be starving. The farmers equipment is very expensive and they rely heavily on loans to be able to afford this equipment. Without the help of subsidies, it would be too risky to get a loan for a $500,000 combine if you didn’t have that insurance policy and support from the government. One of the cons of subsidies are how they are distributed, there are a large amount of wealthy people who receive subsidies while there are a lot of poor farmers receiving nothing. Subsidies are without a doubt vital to the success of farming in the US, but should we need to depend so heavily on them? I’m sure that farmers all over the US would rather just be able to be profitable than depend on the government for assistance (Amadeo, 2020).

There is one promising avenue that may be available in the near future to boost corn production. The University of Minnesota’s Center for Sustainable Polymers is working on developing a corn-based bioplastic. It will hopefully be able to take the place of petroleum-based plastics in the near future. The University is working on its strength and flexibility now. It would also be
something that would decompose rapidly unlike the plastics that are used today. This type of solution would be a good one for the environment and for corn farmers alike (Developing, 2020). With yields getting larger and larger, and demand perhaps not able to keep up with production gains, it is tough to see corn prices growing a whole lot in the near future. That also makes a person wonder just how much farmland values can continue to grow with the main commodity that it produces staying stagnant on price. At some point it just doesn’t become economical to raise corn anymore because all of the inputs are continuously increasing, while the output value stagnates. What happens if the government policy changes and a determination is made to not continue to pay the massive amounts of subsidies necessary for many farmers to stay afloat? It appears that most farmers are investing in farmland as a very long-term investment, something that they may not even see paid off in their lifetimes. Farmers are doing so because they have been raised as generational farmers and hope to continue the family tradition. However, it is clear that crop options may need to change. Perhaps an additional crop, such as hemp, needs to be introduced to the rotation in addition to corn and soybeans. Or perhaps new uses for corn will be developed to enhance demand, thus enhancing the potential for row crop farmers to enjoy greater profitability in future years.

References

Gloy, Brent, et al. “Purdue University.” Purdue Agriculture, Mar. 2011, ag.purdue.edu/commercialag/Pages/Resources/Farmland/Land-Prices/Farmland-Values-Current.aspx.


Kluis, Al. “Corn Is Approaching All-Time Lows.” Successful Farming, Successful Farming, 25 September, 2020


**Bibliography**


